**NAME:** Seth Racusen**

**BIO:**

**Seth Racusen is an Associate Professor of Political Science and Criminal Justice at Anna Maria College and a former Visiting Fulbright Scholar at UNIRIO (The Federal University of the State of Rio de Janeiro). Racusen has explored the use of law and public policy to combat racial inequality and the mutual constitution of identity, nation and law in Brazil. His work showed the influence of the ideology of racial democracy in the judicial treatment of racial discrimination claims. (The Ideology of the Brazilian Nation and the Brazilian Legal Theory of Racial Discrimination. 10 Social Identities 775, December 2004.) That paper was highly cited in the important 2006 decision of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR) condemning Brazil's failure to address employment discrimination (Report N 66/06, Case 12.001, Merits, Simone Andr Diniz, Brazil, IACHR, October 21, 2006 and the 2004 CEJA report to the OAS in support of an Inter-American Convention on Racial Discrimination. (CEJA, 2004)).

**SUMMARY:**

... I defend the verification of identity to insure that higher echelon opportunities are provided to those previously excluded as well as to maximize the longer-term political viability and legitimacy of affirmative action. ... Third, critics argue that affirmative action imposes identity as a consequence of using photos to verify identity. ... Those "imposed-upon" presumably include those who do not wish to have an identity, those who are unsure of their identity, those who do not identify with census categories such as Morenos, Pardos in the north who might identify as Indio (census term for indigenous persons), or those who have never thought of themselves as pertaining to the Black race. ... First, if ancestry were used to define the beneficiary class, the beneficiary class would become over-inclusive since many Whites can claim African ancestry. ... Of the multiple claims for affirmative action beneficiaries, I consider the three most relevant for this paper: (1) race: all Afro Brazilians, (2) color: the darkest Afro Brazilians (who are "unmistakably" Afro Brazilian), and (3) class: public school students and/or the poor. ... The use of color narrows the beneficiary class to darker Afro Brazilians who are more likely to report discrimination and therefore constitute a worthy beneficiary class. ... Indeed, four universities that verify identity have rejected the identity claims of between 5% and 35% of the applicants. ... From the comparative arena, colleges verifying identity could employ some of the following methods to verify a candidate's identity:

(1) official documents that testify to a candidate's identity; (2) visual examination of the candidate; (3) interviews with candidates about their self-perception, their behavior, their treatment by others, or their prior discriminatory experiences; and (4) the testimony of others, including a candidate's family, neighbors, co-workers, or members of various reference groups about the individual's self-perception, reputation in the community, self-presentation and behavior, discriminatory experiences, and physical appearance. ... Although the opposition has overstated the consequences of the complexities of identity, important questions about identity and public policy warrant further consideration. ... In that view, Brazilians would continue to treat state identity as something to be declared in specific contexts, such as university admissions, and claim societal identity, such as Moreno, on a daily basis.
To order what cannot be ordered or to forbid what cannot be prevented is nonsensical, crazy, and illogical.

- Judge Raquel Soares Chiarelli, 2007

TEXT:

[*1] Racial orders constitute social structures with no clear exit. The axis of domination and the technology of domination can neither be readily ignored, as "colorblind" conservatives in the United States insist, nor axiomatically redeployed to undo racial domination. For example, contemporary South Africa would not use apartheid's technology of domination (pencil tests, et al.) to assign racial identity, and it remains unclear how South Africans define their identity under post-apartheid nonracialism and how they deploy their identities for the purpose of equal opportunity policies. n2 India outlawed the use of castes in its Constitution even as it also created educational, economic and political opportunity [*2] policies based upon caste membership. n3 In the United States, a movement for a multiracial census category critiqued the rigidity of U.S. categories without fully acknowledging its positionality in the existing racial order n4 as if a new paradigm could simply be declared. I contend that an exit from a racial order cannot simply be declared, and explore the current implementation of affirmative action in Brazil as a case study of the general problem of exiting a racial order.

Each racial order produces a fiction that contains obstacles to remedying the inequalities it produces. The Brazilian fiction of identity as appearance has constructed an atomized and ambivalent n5 Afro Brazilian identity that complicates the use of categories to develop equal opportunity policies. In Brazil, Black (Preta) and Brown (Parda) have historically represented distinct color identities, and most of the Black movement's intended constituency has identified as Brown. n6 The Black movement encountered significant difficulties in 1991 in getting Brazilians to identity according to race and not color, a paradigm change. n7 Despite small but [*3] significant inroads n8, the vast majority of the Black Movement's constituency still identifies according to color and not race. Thus, although identity is subjective, existing structures shape reconstructions of identity. The Brazilian fiction of identity allows multiple interpretations of certain markers that complicate the distinguishing of those on the border of whiteness and brownness, the relevant divide for Brazilian affirmative action. In those instances that universities have verified individual identity claims for the purposes of affirmative action, the evaluators have rejected as many as 1/3 of the applicants, n9 a phenomenon also reflected in Brazilians surveys. n10 In Brazil, unlike the U.S., mixedness has not been contained within blackness n11 but has been its own container for many identities, including a path to whiteness. Thus, the Brazilian fiction of mixedness and the system of physical differentiation have complicated the identification and verification of affirmative action beneficiaries.

In her opinion quoted in the epigraph, Judge Chiarelli viewed the Brazilian fiction of mixedness as expressing fundamental axioms about Brazilian humanity. Accordingly, in a country that blended individuals from distinct backgrounds, human beings inherently "cannot be ordered" and therefore cannot be distinguished for the purposes of affirmative action. Judge Chiarelli held that the differential treatment of two siblings was "absurd" and summarily dismissed the Federal University of Brasilia's (UNB) affirmative action admissions procedures. n12 This holding rests upon [*4] an expectation that siblings be perceived and treated identically, which ignores Brazilian social reality. n13

The popular interpretation of the Brazilian construction of identity as primarily a matter of appearance n14 recreates a false dichotomy between self-identity and the perception of others. Self-identity and appearance to others are distinct entities that have also been mutually constituted. The flexibility that some Brazilians enjoy in their identity choices is delimitied by their appearance. And their subjective identities influence how others see them. Thus, identity is fully contextual and relational, and research suggests that Brazilian self-presentation responds to perceptions of how an identity claim will be received in a specific context. n15

Colleges that verify identity have generally relied upon applicant appearance to others in making their initial determination of identity and applicant's self-identity upon appeal. In its initial determination, UNB found both siblings, Fernando and Fernanda, ineligible for affirmative action based upon their appearance to a UNB commission, which Judge Chiarelli upheld because "simple observation of their photos . . . verified that neither the plaintiff nor her brother is phenotypically black." n16 Thus, at first blush, the judge and the university agreed on the siblings' appearances. In appealing that classification, Fernando declared himself Black in appearance and ancestry and produced official docu-
The separation of appearance and subjective identity as sequential steps in the admissions process indicates the conceptual trouble in the current deployment of identity for the purpose of affirmative action. The dichotomization of subjectivity and appearance effectively denied applicants a voice in their process prior to the appeal and gave ammunition to the opposition to affirmative action.

The opposition to affirmative action seized upon the case of Fernando and Fernanda and another case in which UNB classified identical twins differently to demonstrate the impossibility of deploying categorical identities in Brazil for the purposes of public policy. The genuine complexity of adopting affirmative action in a country with a flexible but hierarchical identity structure has been sensationalized by a tripartite oppositional coalition of the media, rejected affirmative action candidates, and "anti-essentialist" anthropologists. Opposition from the media, dominated by Brazilian elites, is not surprising since elites view affirmative action as a threat to their children's access to public universities, which provides free education of the highest caliber. Rejected candidates for affirmative action seats assert their strategic interests in their legal challenges to the universities. These individuals differ from Alan Bakke in that many claim to have Black ancestry and to be part of the subject class. The oppositional anthropologists include prominent intellectuals who have contributed to the study of race in Brazil. These anthropologists argue that race conscious policies force Brazilians to identify in divisive racial categories and that race, since it cannot be based on science, cannot provide a sound basis for government policy. The alliance of anthropologists and rejected candidates lends an unusual edge to the opposition because of their combined proximity to the beneficiary class, progressive university professors, and important segments of the Black Movement.

Opponents claim that Brazil fused Portuguese, African and indigenous persons into a nation of 'blended' Brazilians, and thereby constructed mixedness as quasi-national. However, in contrast to these fusionist claims to have produced a 'new people' by blending persons and cultures, an 'absorptionist' state produces its 'new people' by absorbing persons and cultures into the dominant group, who sets the terms for the 'blending'. Opponents claim that the Brazilian nation will be divided through affirmative action. However, if Brazil were truly fusionist, why would articulations of Blackness threaten this national 'mixedness'? Why couldn't a Brazilian be Black and Mixed? I argue that Brazil is a color hierarchy with both fusionist and absorptionist tendencies and that the ambiguous space between fusionist and absorptionist discourses provides the political room for the opposition to affirmative action.

Affirmative action proponents hold the unusual position of being on the defensive in the debate but winning in the real policy arena with an ever-increasing number of Brazilian universities implementing affirmative action. To the claim that it is impossible to identify Afro Brazilian, proponents retort that the police have no such difficulty. Although the discretionary behavior of Brazilian police hardly represents a credible model for state discretionary policy, the moral suasion of this response suggests the hyperbole of the opposition to affirmative action. If numerous public and private actors can routinely make discretionary determinations for discriminatory purposes, how could it be impossible to make determinations for the purpose of anti-discriminatory policies?

The resulting debate represents an "intellectual cul-de-sac" that largely does not address the identity questions posed by adopting affirmative action in Brazil. Who should be the beneficiaries of affirmative action? If a candidate chose an identity simply for the purpose of university admissions, do the principles of social constructedness...
require that that she be accepted without scrutiny? What manifestations of Black or Brown identity would a candidate need to show, especially in a country that historically drew distinctions based upon appearance, and how should colleges incorporate appearance and subjective identity? Can colleges verify the identity of beneficiaries without falling into the trap of policing "fraud" n33 and violating the principles of social constructedness and the primacy of subjective identity? I argue that the view that subjective identity cannot be verified represents a dogmatic understanding of social constructedness and subjective identity. Identity claims are contextual, relational, and negotiable, especially in Brazil.

In this paper, I propose three policy goals to review Brazilian affirmative action: (1) to maximize the provision of opportunities to those previously excluded, (2) to maximize the political viability and political legitimacy of the program, and (3) to dismantle or at least counter the absorptionist aspects of racial democracy. n34 I argue that both race-based and class-based affirmative action are needed in Brazil and argue for the inclusion of three groups: Afro Brazilian public school students, White public school students, and Afro Brazilian private school students as best addressing those goals. The inclusion of Afro Brazilian private school students, especially necessary to democratize participation in the upper echelon schools, raises additional issues. Private school Whites seeking admission to competitive programs have reportedly identified as Brown for [*9] the purposes of affirmative action. n35 In a country where at least 38% n36 of Whites possess African ancestry, such claims are not unfounded even if they are primarily strategic. I defend the verification of identity to insure that higher echelon opportunities are provided to those previously excluded as well as to maximize the longer-term political viability and legitimacy of affirmative action. In subsequent sections of this paper, I sketch the possibilities and limits of the contemporary affirmative action initiatives to transform the Brazilian social structure by examining: (1) the influence of the structure of identity upon categorical policy as claimed by opponents, (2) the Brazilian structure of identity, and (3) the influence of the structure of identity upon categorical policy of Brazilian colleges.

Part I: Brazilian Identity and Affirmative Action, According to Affirmative Action Opponents

An unusual tripartite oppositional coalition of the media, rejected affirmative action candidates, and "anti-essentialist" anthropologists has emerged to sensationalize any problems in affirmative action policy and render the complexity of identity as impassable. Accordingly, if universities cannot show via science (such as DNA tests) n37 or positivist precision who is Pardo, then universities may not require applicants to be Pardo or Preto. n38 This anti-essentialism obscures the reality of subjective identity in Brazil. n39 In addition, White and light Brown Brazilians, claiming to be part of the subject class, have advanced the most prominent challenges to the affirmative action program at UNB, which has been subjected to intense scrutiny for its use of photos in the verification of candidates. The media [*10] and the opposition have constructed each of these challenges as an indictment of affirmative action and the impossibility of verifying identity.

Of opposition claims n40, I examine those pertaining to identity and the delineation of the subject class. The first claim is the 'anthropological' objection that the use of photos to verify an applicant's identity clashes with the principle of subjective identity. UNB, used one commission to evaluate photos, the so-called 'racial tribunal' n41 and a second commission to consider appeals by rejected candidates, the so-called 'racial psychology' commission. n42 Important proponents of affirmative action have conceded this criticism about the use of photos but argued for the policies of the vast majority of universities that do not verify identity. n43

A second claim is that the full logic of affirmative action must lead to the use of photos, even if only a few universities do so today. n44 In this account, affirmative action seeks to remedy discrimination, and the best proxy for discrimination is how someone appears to others. n45 Therefore, affirmative action programs must rely on the view of others to viably identify affirmative action beneficiaries. Supporters have also argued that beneficiaries should appear Brown or Black to others n46 to insure that opportunities are being allocated to deserving beneficiaries. n47 This argument assumes that affirmative action should target current victims of discrimination. If affirmative action seeks to remedy past discrimination, the determination of who appears Brown would not be pertinent. Consider that a verification commission could reject Black movement activists on the [*11] basis of their photos alone. Further, the logic of the census campaign of 1991 included all who subjectively identified as Brown or Black, choosing subjectivity over appearance. Certainly, affirmative action imposes a different logic, yet both supporters and opponents are flattening the complexity of identity and the considerations of how to mediate subjective and 'objective' identity. Finally, I argue that the verification of identity is linked to particular conceptions of the beneficiary class and particular policy objectives rather than to affirmative action policy in general.

Third, critics argue that affirmative action imposes identity as a consequence of using photos to verify identity. Some argue that affirmative action inevitably imposes census identity n48 upon those who would 'freely' identify oth-
erwise. n49 Those "imposed-upon" presumably include those who do not wish to have an identity, those who are unsure of their identity, those who do not identify with census categories such as Morenos, Pardos in the north who might identify as Indio (census term for indigenous persons), or those who have never thought of themselves as pertaining to the Black race. Two leading opponents of affirmative action, Maio and Venura, suggest that this imposition emanates from the tendency of law to require clear categories. n50 However, this entire 'imposition' argument turns on a claim that has not been articulated. What tangible harm is caused to "Morenos" or those uncertain or unwilling to declare their identity by the existence of seats for Afro Brazilians? Does the existence of indigenous seats at the university "impose" indigenous identity on such persons? Since candidates do not have to declare an identity for the universal seats, the existence of Afro Brazilian and indigenous seats does not seem to place an onerous burden on these students. n51

[*12] Fourth, critics argue that it is impossible to say who is really Black. In addition to the long established social scientific understanding that race is not genetic, critics emphasize recent studies that have confirmed the lack of a biological link to physical appearance. n52 This argument insists that the only real evidence for racial identity could be genetic and that failing that threshold, racial identity cannot exist. That notion leaves out the understanding of race as a social construction! n53 Anti-essentialist anthropologists who seemingly defend social constructedness cannot fathom the independence of social construction from biological determinism. I concede the complication of racial identity as do others n54 but argue the imprecision of socially constructed identity does not render it intractable.

Finally, the anthropologists argue that making racial distinctions represents a slippery slope which leads Brazil, not only to make the invidious distinctions of North American Jim Crow but also the deadly determinations enacted in Nazi Germany and genocidal Rwanda. n55 This slippery slope argument fails to distinguish between classifications made for remedial rather than discriminatory practices and fails to weigh the real consequences of governmental actions. Certainly being rejected for university admissions cannot be compared to being sent to a concentration camp -- yet the slippery slope argument claims that the former will somehow result in the latter. Nor does the slippery slope argument contend with causality: did Nazi distinctions grow because of the existence of the distinctions or because of the concomitant growth in Nazi power and regime capacity to enforce and expand the significance of the distinctions? n56 The [*13] idea that racialization would have the same impact in every social context seems as ludicrous as the idea that rain would have the same impact on every natural environment. Arguably, racialization has a positive value in an absorptionist country in which many subordinated persons have been reluctant to articulate identity.

Opponents have questioned every aspect of the so-called "racial tribunals": their composition, their mandate, and their actual practices. Maio and Santos question whether "persons connected to the Black movement constitute 'effective' representatives of society" n57 and whether they could "mimic societal perceptions about race and discrimination" n58, the stated purposes for the UNB Commission. Do their questions suggest that no one could perform such a function or only that Black activists cannot? Either question seems ludicrous: who would know better than Afro Brazilians how society views Brazilians? As Dubois noted more than a century ago, Blacks know most directly how they are seen by Whites as well as how they see themselves, n59 and as Fanon added, the perception of Whites can overwhelm and become self-image. n60 Both insights are highly relevant in Brazil. n61

Many affirmative action opponents prefer class-based policies admissions policies n62 arguing that such policies can reach Afro Brazilians without making racial distinctions. Ironically, many of their critiques could also be leveled at class-based preferences, which can result in income or school attendance stipulations also difficult to verify. n63 Most significantly, the law that the anthropologists oppose n64 creates opportunities for public school students and stipulates that a proportionate share of these public school students be Afro Brazilian. Restated, these anthropologists oppose class-based affirmative action with a wrinkle: that Afro Brazilians be proportionately included in the beneficiary class. Without this "wrinkle," would Afro Brazilians really be proportionately represented by class-based affirmative action? I see no reason to assume that class-based affirmative action is either the most viable or appropriate policy to reach Afro [*14] Brazilians. Researchers have found persistent racial disadvantages from birth (surviving childbirth and childhood n65) onward (remaining in school n66) that are reproduced through major life passages. Consequently, Afro Brazilians enter the labor market much earlier and with much less education than Whites. n67 These racial differences are mediated through social class but also are manifest among persons of the same social class, so that social class cannot fully explain racial inequality. For example, White children enjoy greater educational success than their darker siblings. n68 Afro Brazilians who attain higher levels of education are much less likely than Whites with equivalent education to secure economic return for their education. n69 Finally, those Afro Brazilians who attain socioeconomic mobility are much less likely than Whites to be able to transmit those gains to their children. n70 Thus, racial difference cannot be simply understood as consequential to processes of social class formation.
Most Brazilians perceive these vast racial differences and tend to understand these differences in terms of social class or the legacy of slavery, rather than the actual reproduction of racial inequality. However, not only do racial differences emerge among persons similarly situated but racial inequality also accumulates across life experiences. Racial differences in the accumulation of wealth are even greater than differences in income. For example, home value for the poorest Whites is twice as great as for Browns and three times as great as for Blacks. Racial inequality in Brazil lies closer to South Africa than to the US in several important dimensions, such as participation in higher education and overall economic position. Class-based affirmative action is too narrow and does not include middle class Afro Brazilians who also suffer racial discrimination and whose participation is necessary to credibly diversify the more competitive public universities.

According to the opposition, affirmative action law forces the round peg, Brazilian flexible identity, into the square hole: the categories needed for affirmative action. In that view, affirmative action supporters and higher education officials seek to racialize Brazilian hybridity, and the oppositional anthropologists seek to protect that hybridity from the dangers of racialization. In so arguing, the opposition reads experience without deeper structural considerations and especially fails to address societal racialization that already shapes Brazilian experience. This opposition has fully polarized the debate, and proponents have been unwilling to discuss the real complications because every complication becomes an indictment of affirmative action. The next section explores some of the complexities of Brazilian identity that are relevant for the implementation of categorical policies by Brazilian colleges.

Part II: The Brazilian Structure of Identity

Although Brazilian identity is complex, it provides a basis for policy distinctions. Brazilians often differ labeling themselves and each other in consistent categories. Nonetheless, they use a commonly understood framework of physical characteristics to characterize themselves and each other on a hierarchical color ladder. Thus, they can more surely rank themselves and each other from lighter to darker. This section examines key characteristics of the Brazilian identity structure that interact with affirmative action: (1) the number and nature of categories, (2) the difference between self-identity and assessment by others, (3) disagreements in the assessments of others, and (4) the relationship of ancestry and identity.

Historically, Brazilian identity has been officially constructed in terms of "color" and not "race," an emphasis of appearance over descent. By "official," I refer both to the production of "social scientific knowledge" about race through the census, which asked Brazilians for their "color" usually from a selection of five categories or "closed" identity, and researchers who have asked Brazilians for their color sometimes without reference to census categories, or "open-ended" identity. As has been widely noted, Brazilians have claimed more than 100 identities on at least three occasions: 136 in the 1976 Census Household Survey (PNAD), 143 in the 1998 National Employment and Manufacturing Survey (PME), and 492 in a 1970 study by Marvin Harris. Harris argued that a country with 492 identities could not effectively discriminate. I argue that the sheer number of categories is not an obstacle to discriminatory behavior nor to affirmative action as evidenced by the case of India and its several thousand castes. Instead of the number of categories being determinative, I argue that the nature of categories matters more. Categories are not mutually exclusive groups that clearly perceive and maintain the boundaries between them and others.

In Brazil, there are a handful of salient categories with many derivatives. Seven categories (Branca, Moreno Claro, Parda, Preta, Negra and Clara) account for 95% of the overall population, as shown by Table 1. Most of the other categories, cited by only a few respondents, pertain to Brown Brazilians articulating their positionality within mixedness, their aspirations to whiten, and their distinctiveness from blackness on the hierarchical ladder.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Open-Ended and Closed Identity, Zumbi Survey, 1995</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branca</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreno Claro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreno</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mulato</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1: Open-Ended and Closed Identity, Zumbi Survey, 1995

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity</th>
<th>Open-ended</th>
<th>Closed: (Census)</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moreno Escuro</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Esuro</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preta</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negro</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>5003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Much** fewer Brazilians claim the census identities *Pardo* and *Preto* in the open-ended question than in a close-ended question. I distinguish "societal" identities, those used on the street and volunteered in open-ended survey questions, from "state" or "census" identities. n87 Table 2 shows that the most popular identity claimed by *Pardas* and *Pretas* in 1995 was *Moreno*, a "societal" identity. Variations of *Moreno*, such as *Moreno Claro*, represent a smaller but still significant identity. The popularity of *Moreno* supported the claim that the census bureau "imposes" identity on Brazilians [*18*] with its choice of categories, especially for those identifying as *Moreno*. n88 More recent data has shown a sizeable shift toward *Pardo*, *Preto*, and *Negro* and away from *Moreno*. n89

Table 2: Most Popular Societal Identities According to Census Identities, Zumbi Survey, 1995

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity</th>
<th>For Brancas</th>
<th>For Pardas</th>
<th>For Pretas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brancas</td>
<td>73.5%</td>
<td>60.5%</td>
<td>38.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreno</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreno Claro</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>7.4%</td>
<td>18.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clara</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branca</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preta</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mulato</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negro</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.6%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Although many *Afro Brazilians* have preferred "societal" to "state" categories, surveys have shown that Brazilians can identify in a "census" category. For example, 99.4% of the respondents in the 1998 PME, a national survey, claimed a state identity. n90 The few Brazilians unable to locate themselves in a census category generally have attained so little schooling to not be close to university admission. n91 Thus, these data does [*19*] not support the opposition's argument that affirmative action causes tangible harm to Brazilians unable to place themselves in an affirmative action category.

Second, Brazilian self-identity often differs from the perception of another, which significantly impacts affirmative action: especially those who self-identify darker than someone else's perception. In the 1995 Zumbi survey, interviewers viewed 19% of self-identified *Pardos* and 2% of self-identified *Pretos* as *White*. n92 This impacts the definition and verification of beneficiaries. Should beneficiaries be defined according to self-identity, consistent with the primacy of self-identity, or the view of another? If affirmative action represents a response to current discrimination, the view of others would be the best proxy for who was most likely to encounter discrimination. However, how might the discrepancy between self and other be addressed in the process of verification?

Third, a further complication for the discrepancy between self and other is that Brazilians do not consistently identify others. In his studies of the Brazilian northeast, Harris found that Brazilians disagreed about the meaning of racial labels and the application of those labels to concrete persons, especially for those viewed to be in-between *White* and *Black*. n93 Two questions in the 2002 PESB survey illuminate this phenomenon. First, respondents evaluated 8 photos according to census categories. They reached an overwhelming consensus (95%) on 3 photos, which they viewed as *White* or *Black* and a strong consensus on 4 photos, which they predominantly viewed (85%) as *White* or *Brown*. They
were sharply divided on one photo: viewed as Brown by a large majority (72%) and White by a significant minority (25%). Based upon UNB procedures from 2004-5, a verification commission would be likely to disagree on 2 or more of these. n94 Another PESB question asked respondents to assess the identity of their interviewers. Respondents disagreed about the identity of 23 of 157 interviewers (14.6%). Respondents viewed one interviewer as White (9), Black (5), and Brown (1): Whites viewed her as Black and Blacks viewed [*20] her as White: virtually all respondents differentiated her from themselves. n95 These data suggest that commissions evaluating candidates would often disagree with candidate self-assessment and among themselves. n96

Finally, how might ancestry intervene in these uncertainties about identity? A majority of all Brazilians report mixed ancestry, which poses several problems for affirmative action. n97 First, if ancestry were used to define the beneficiary class, the beneficiary class would become over-inclusive since many Whites can claim African ancestry. n98 If ancestry were used to verify identity claims only in cases of doubt, there would still be the same problem of over inclusiveness. Finally, siblings from the same parents can identify or be viewed distinctly, n99 and their common ancestry can obscure their distinctive identity, as in the opening case of the paper.

Thus, the complexity of Brazilian identity, including differences in self-identity and the view of others and differences among others about someone's identity, complicate the field for affirmative action. The constitution of appearance and descent make the designation, Afro Brazilian, problematic, which paradoxically leaves identity in the realm of appearance and subjective identity. The Brazilian structure of identity contains significant ambiguities, complicating the definition and verification of beneficiaries. Given these data and the dearth of opportunity in Brazil, I hypothesize that identity would be strategically deployed for the purposes of affirmative action. Despite this nuanced societal identity, Brazilians are able to place themselves in census categories, which is consistent with the thesis that context influences the presentation of identity. [*21] The next section examines the influence of identity upon the categorical policies of Brazilian universities.

A. The Influence of the Structure of Identity Upon Categorical Policy of Brazilian Colleges

Brazilian racial identity has developed within a complex identity structure that melds race, color, and class as overlapping components of identity. The predominant claim for affirmative action has been to treat Pardas and Pretas as a unified beneficiary class, supported by empirical data that has shown a negligible difference in the life outcomes for Pardas and Pretas. n100 The other predominant claim has been to create opportunities on the basis of class: targeting either public school students and/or the poor. Class-based affirmative action has represented either a pragmatic construction of the beneficiary class n101 or an alternative conception of the truly needy. Third, some have advocated affirmative action for darker Afro Brazilians: a claim for a beneficiary class based upon color. n102 Studies show that Pretas are more than twice as likely as Pardas to report discriminatory experiences. n103 That data, combined with the hiring preference for lighter over darker Browns, could justify a greater preference for Pretas, particularly if affirmative action is viewed as compensatory for present discrimination.

How have Brazilian universities mediated between the competing claims for affirmative action on the basis of race, color and class? The early claim that affirmative action could not be implemented because no one would be willing to identify as Black has proven false. The other early [*22] claim that everyone would wish to be Black for the purposes of affirmative action has proven closer to the mark. How have colleges responded to the new subjectivity of higher education candidates? In a country in which at least 38 percent n104 of Whites also have Black African ancestry, some Whites have declared themselves Brown for the purpose of university admission. Must verification of candidates violate the principles of social constructedness and the primacy of subjective identity, as some claim? This article argues that such a view represents a dogmatic understanding of social constructedness, and that the cost to program legitimacy in not verifying outweighs the cost of verification. This article claims that verification does not have to violate the principles of social constructedness and that it can be conducted in a way that maximizes program legitimacy.

 Whereas the national debate has demonstrated the political cost of verifying beneficiary identity, I argue that there is also a cost to not verifying identity. Verification curbs the potential awarding of seats to those not intended and provides needed signals to candidates about their identity claims. The legitimacy of the program could be undermined without some verification process.

In this paper, I propose three principles to animate Brazilian affirmative action policy: (1) to maximize the provision of opportunities to those previously excluded, (2) to maximize the political viability and political legitimacy of the program, and (3) to counter the absorptionist aspects of racial democracy. I argue that maximizing opportunities to those previously excluded is morally just in a country with rampant inequality, socially advisable to further Brazilian
economic development, n105 and politically beneficial to increase political support for affirmative action. The broadest conception of the beneficiary class includes three constituencies: (1) Afro Brazilian public school students, (2) White public school students, and (3) Afro Brazilian private school students. The inclusion of Afro Brazilian public school students is relatively non-controversial since they would meet the criterion of race and class. The inclusion of White public school students is justifiable on several grounds. First, White public school students also deserve opportunities in a highly egalitarian country and their inclusion also increases the political viability of affirmative action. Second, the poor are most likely to self-lighten n106 so that some self-identified poorer [*23] Whites might be socially viewed as Brown. Third, the inclusion of this group minimizes the need for verification of racial identity because an "error" would result in a White public school student gaining a university seat. Finally, Afro Brazilian private school students, having faced persistent discrimination, deserve inclusion. Their inclusion, opposed by some prominent Afro Brazilian educators and activists n107, provides the strongest demand to visibly diversify the higher echelon universities.

Maximizing the political legitimacy of affirmative action entails strategic considerations, such as maximizing potential supporters, minimizing potential opposition, and increasing the likelihood that others will view affirmative action as fair. Providing opportunities for the broadest constituency as discussed above will maximize supporters and opposition and make affirmative action more politically charged. The expansion of real opportunity, part of the federal government's current plan, will maximize supporters and minimize opposition. Rejected university candidates, who provide ammunition for the tripartite opposition and constitute its most crucial sector, would be diminished by the expansion of real opportunities. University verification of identity can also be conducted in ways to maximize the legitimacy of the program in the eyes of the broader public.

Affirmative action on the basis of race directly counters the absorptionist aspects of racial democracy by providing the first material incentive to identify as Black or Brown. In so doing, affirmative action communicates that racial identity can positively affect life chances. Affirmative action students need self-esteem to fully engage in a university historically catering to the elite. I argue that this ideological aspect of affirmative action is critical in Arendt's sense that the right to have rights n108 precedes the actual use of any right. The succeeding sections examine university practices in designating and verifying the beneficiaries of affirmative action.

B. Designation of Beneficiaries

The adoption of affirmative action by Brazilian universities has had an historic impact in a country that had denied having racial discrimination until 1996. n109 During the ensuing decade, racial discrimination became part [*24] of the public discourse, and 51 public universities adopted affirmative action by January 2008. n110 Most of these universities (61%) n111 constructed beneficiary classes with multiple constituencies. The few universities that targeted a sole constituency were most likely to designate public school students (9) and indigenous students (5). None of the universities with only one beneficiary group targets Afro Brazilian students! n112 That data surely indicates the relative political weight of the different beneficiary groups.

Of the multiple claims for affirmative action beneficiaries, I consider the three most relevant for this paper n113: (1) race: all Afro Brazilians, (2) color: the darkest Afro Brazilians (who are "unmistakably" Afro Brazilian), and (3) class: public school students and/or the poor. The criterion of color has the dubious virtue of being the politically least viable criterion but potentially offering the greatest challenge to the absorptionist aspect of racial democracy. The use of color narrows the beneficiary class to darker Afro Brazilians who are more likely to report discrimination and therefore constitute a worthy beneficiary class. Of the three criterion described above, the color criterion offers the most effective corrective to the whitening bias of the labor market. However, the use of color as a criterion for beneficiaries has encountered the most vehement political objections. Prominent Black movement activists were highly critical of the phenotypical criterion used at the State University of Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS) as counter to subjective identity. n114

The criterion of race, the designation of Blacks and Browns as a unitary beneficiary class, enjoys greater political support than the criterion of color. The criterion of race creates real opportunities for Afro Brazilians but does not create opportunities for poor Whites nor differentiate among Afro Brazilians. It would challenge racial democracy by providing the first material incentive for someone to identify as Afro Brazilian, but not offer a corrective to the hiring preferences, such as boa aparencia. n115 Second, these opportunities would be more accessible to Afro Brazilians of greater means.

The criterion of class enjoys the greatest political support in Brazil [*25] and provides opportunities to those excluded in the past. However, it does not necessary offer a proportionate share of seats to Afro Brazilian public school
students. Empirical research has suggested that class-based policies cannot remedy Brazilian inequality. n116 Second, it does not provide opportunities for Afro Brazilian private school students nor challenge racial democracy.

The conception of the beneficiary class is strengthened by the use of multiple criteria, the practice of most universities. Race and class have been combined within the beneficiary class in at least four different approaches in Brazil. The first three approaches use separate lists while the fourth approach awards specific points for racial and/or class identity, akin to the Harvard plan, within a unitary process. n117 In Brazil, university admission is generally based upon entrance examinations. Students take a qualifying examination that establishes their overall skill attainment. Those that pass take a second examination that ranks students according to specified skills for their major. Students are admitted to specific departments based upon these examinations. Under the provision of affirmative action, separate lists have generally been utilized for beneficiary classes, and candidates decide whether to seek admission through the universal system or the affirmative action program. Each of the four approaches treat the three target constituencies, Afro Brazilian public school students, White public school students, and Afro Brazilian private school students distinctly:

. **Race and class:** This approach, used by 6 colleges n118, combines race and class to provide opportunities to Afro Brazilian public [*26] school students. This approach does not offer opportunities to Afro Brazilian private school students or White public school students. This approach represents the narrowest conception of the beneficiary class and provides the fewest opportunities. It would probably not generate much longer-term political support and would generate the least political opposition. It has the virtue of identifying a beneficiary class that could be viewed "double worthy" and thereby reducing the need to verify beneficiaries.

. **Race inside of class:** The current federal proposal for affirmative action sets aside half of the seats in the federal universities for public school students. Within the seats for public school students, colleges make proportionate shares available to Afro Brazilian and indigenous students, reflecting the census demographic data for each state. n119 This approach, the most widely used (15 colleges) n120, includes White public school students and represents class-based affirmative action that also offers proportionate representation for Afro Brazilians. The approach is probably the most political efficacious because it provides opportunities to White public school students while reducing the imperative to verify beneficiary racial identity. However, this approach omits Afro Brazilian private school students.

[*27]  . **Race or class:** This approach, used by 7 colleges n121, creates opportunities for candidates on the basis of their racial or class identity. This approach represents the broadest conception of the beneficiary class, admitting Afro Brazilian private school students and White public school students. Depending of the design of the program, Afro Brazilian public school students might need to decide whether to apply on the basis of race or class or might be able to apply simultaneously on multiple lists. However, this approach has not prioritized opportunities among beneficiaries and arguably, Afro Brazilian public school students deserve priority over other public school students and Afro Brazilian private school students. Further, this approach generates the most political support and the most virulent political opposition.

Figure 1: Constructing the Beneficiary Class

. **Race and class as "bonus points":** Finally, race and class can be [*28] treated as supplementary factors. Three Brazilian universities n122 use a "Harvard like" system that awards points for race and class that are added to the examination score. The early data from one of these universities, UNICAMP, which awards 10 points for race and 30 points for class, indicates that the program has increased Afro Brazilian and public school presence but not at a rate that has kept up with the increase in demand. n123 This approach could theoretically provide the most sophisticated approach to the construction of the beneficiary class, by including all three constituencies and by prioritizing Afro Brazilian public school students over other public school students and over Afro Brazilian private school students.

Notwithstanding the public rancor over race-based affirmative action, class-based affirmative action has been widely implemented by single beneficiary n124 and multiple beneficiary programs. This surely reflects the historical salience of social class in Brazil, the tremendous need of the poor, as well as the current political balance of forces, in-
cluding the vociferous opposition to race-based affirmative action. Although regionalized approaches have emerged in the implementation of affirmative action, this paper suggests that the regional effect is primarily a result of the learning processes among universities (developing their programs based upon learning from the experiences of other universities) within each region.

The construction of the beneficiary class has implications for the imperative to verify identity. The first two approaches combine race and class simultaneously and reduce the imperative to verify identity. Indeed, only one of 23 universities (4%) using these approaches verifies identity. The last two approaches treat race and class separately, which could engender a greater need to verify identity. Indeed, five of the seven universities (71%) that use the broader race or class approach verify identity.

The use of multiple factors strengthens the conception of the beneficiary class but also asks how to prioritize among multiple groups. The bonus point system may have the ranking right: by prioritizing Afro Brazilian public school students, then White public school students and finally Afro Brazilian private school students. Both UNICAMP and FATEC grant three times more points for public school attendance than for racial identity. As noted above, the demand for the Afro Brazilian seats has increased more quickly than admissions, suggesting that the weighting system be evaluated. The next section considers the verification of beneficiaries by selected universities.

C. Verifying Beneficiaries

Verification of racial identity has generated the greatest controversy for affirmative action. There are social and political costs for verifying, and also for not verifying, identity.

The need for verification is more pronounced at the more competitive universities where strategic candidates consider whether or not to apply for affirmative action seats to improve their chances for admission. This strategic use of identity was highly evident in the first year of affirmative action at the State University of the State of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ). Apparently, more than a quarter of UERJ applicants changed their identity during the two entrance examinations. Some candidates darkened themselves, changing from White to Brown or Black, and some lightened themselves, changing from Brown or Black to White. Those who darkened themselves presumably sought to increase their chances to gain admission to the university. Those who lightened themselves may have decided that they did not wish to, did not need to, or could not justify claiming to be Black or Brown for the purposes of university admission. For example, one applicant for medical school, Gabriella Fracescutti, considered darkening herself for the purpose of admission but did not:

*I have friends who are whiter than me and didn't study or do well on the exam, but they wrote down they were [Black] on their application and they got in. My grandmother is Black. I could have written down that I am Black, but I didn't feel right about that. In a country like Brazil, everyone's blood is mixed together.*

Such calculations have also been evident at UNB. Karinny, a blond candidate for nutrition, decided to seek an affirmative action seat reasoning differently than Gabriela that "if others are benefiting, why shouldn't I?" I suggest that the heart of the matter is not simply Gabriella and Karinny's decisions but the overall legitimacy of affirmative action because candidates are keenly aware of their competitors' decisions.

The perceived fairness of Brazil affirmative action is not simply how affirmative action affects the overall provision of opportunities but also whether affirmative action can be administered fairly. Apparently, many of the admitted affirmative action students were Whites who had been counseled by university professors to darken themselves for the purpose of admission. The perception that others are using identity opportunity to gain university admittance destabilizes and de-legitimizes affirmative action. With the knowledge that other candidates are darkening themselves, other Whites will also be tempted to darken themselves. Thus, I speculate that a highly competitive admissions process without verification processes will increase uncertainty and serve to delegitimize affirmative action.

Does social constructedness require the automatic acceptance of subjective identity? If a candidate chose a 'subjective identity' simply for the purpose of university admissions, do the principles of social constructedness require that that be accepted without scrutiny? I argue that such a view represents a dogmatic understanding of social constructedness and does not acknowledge the strategic use of identity nor contemporary understandings of the complexity of
identity. Although I defend the importance of verification, I recognize that verification of racial identity is a delicate process that need be conducted based upon the principles of social constructedness and in a way to maximize program legitimacy in the eyes of ordinary Brazilians.

Any method of verification can yield an assessment that differs from subjective claims. As shown in section (2), survey data suggests that the verification will differ from the individual's self-identity in approximately 15% to 20% of the cases. University candidates have more incentive than survey respondents to shape their identity for the purposes of university admission, which predicts higher rates. Indeed, four universities that verify identity have rejected the identity claims of between 5% and 35% of the applicants. n136 This divergence poses the challenge that the process and the actual assessment can withstand review.

From the comparative arena, colleges verifying identity could employ [*32] some of the following methods to verify a candidate's identity:

1. Official documents that testify to a candidate's identity; n137
2. Visual examination of the candidate; n138
3. Interviews with candidates about their self-perception, n139 their behavior, n140 their treatment by others n141, or their prior discriminatory experiences; n142 and
4. The testimony of others, including a candidate's family, neighbors, co-workers, or members of various reference groups n143 about the individual's self-perception, n144 reputation in the community, n145 self-presentation and behavior, discriminatory experiences, n146 and physical appearance.

In practice, Brazilian colleges have employed a combination of the first three methods, including the evaluation of candidate photos, interviews with the candidates, and the presentation of official documentation. At least two colleges permitted internal appeals of these determinations in which rejected candidates generally prevailed. In making their initial determinations, the colleges have emphasized the physical appearance of candidates. In the appeals, colleges have also considered the experiences and perceptions of candidates, their racial consciousness, their ancestry, and other considerations.

Only six of the fifty-one Brazilian colleges with affirmative action [*33] programs n147 verify candidate identity. Currently, four colleges primarily use interviews, one primarily uses photos, and one primarily uses official documents to verify identity. n148 Most colleges have adopted other measures to "tighten" identity in lieu of actual verification n149, and require other criteria that can be more readily verified (such as public school attendance or family income). This section briefly surveys five of the Brazilian colleges n150 that have verified identity...

Photos

Of the three universities that have used photos to verify identity, only one still does: the State University of Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS). [*34] The other two, the Federal Universities of Brasilia (UNB) and Maranhao (UFMA), both have shifted to use interviews to verify identity. In Mato Grosso do Sul in 2003, political leaders, university officials, and Black movement activists sought to avoid the trouble with self-identification that had occurred at UERJ. State Representative Pedro Kemp (PT) sponsored the new affirmative action law n151 and argued that the process of implementing affirmative action would be "fragile and susceptible to fraud" if applicants declared their own identity, n152 and Black movement activists advocated for "social control." n153 Subsequently, the University Vice-Chancellor, Leocadia Petry Leme, announced that Pardos would not be considered Negros under this law and would not be eligible for the affirmative action openings. She also announced the formation of a commission composed of Afro Brazilian students and professors, and Black movement activists to verify applicant identity. n154 Although the Commission considered holding interviews with candidates n155, it decided instead to require candidates to present a photo. n156 As shown in Table 3, the Commission rejected 76 (14%) of 530 applicants in its first year who did not possess the necessary "phenotype." n157 According to a member of the Commission who was also the President of the State Council for the Defense of Negro Rights (CEDINE), Naercio Ferreira Fernandes de Souza, the 76 lacked the necessary facial characteristics of a Negro: "thick lips, flat nose, and frizzy hair." n158 The Commission eliminated some lighter "Afro descendent" applicants, which she defended because "society discriminates against the color of the Negro. It is not a matter of genes or blood, but physical traces." n159 Dr. Edna Roland, Coordinator of the UNESCO program in Brazil against Racial Discrimination, sharply criticized the Mato Grosso [*35] do Sul approach for (1) differentiating between Negros and Afrodescendants, (2) presuming that all Negros had particular physical traces, and (3) excluding lighter Afrodescen-
In subsequent years, the UEMS Commission rejected considerably more candidates: 191 (18.1%) in 2004 and 319 (35.1%) in 2005. 

Table 3: Evaluation of Candidates by Four Commissions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Candidates</th>
<th>Candidates Rejected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEMS 1</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>1,053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNB 2</td>
<td>4,385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UFPR 3</td>
<td>573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UFMA 4</td>
<td>1,987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Maria Jose de Jesus Alves Cordeiro, Tres anos de efetiva presenca de negros e indigenas cotistas nas salas de aula da UEMS: primeiras analises, in ANDRE AUGUSTO BRANDAO (org.) COTAS RACIAIS NO BRASIL: A PRIMEIRA AVALIACAO, (Colecao Politicas da Cor 2007).
3 Cimea Barbato Bevilaqua, A implantacao do "Plano de Metas de Inclusao Racial e Social" na Universidade Federal do Parana, Curitiba, Dezembro de 2005.
4 COLUMBA BASTIDORES, O IMPARCIAL, February 1, 2008.

[*36] UNB was the second college that decided to verify the identity of its affirmative action applicants. Two anthropology professors, Jose Jorge de Carvalho and Rita Laura Segato, proposed that the university adopt affirmative action in response to the discriminatory treatment of Arivaldo Lima Alves, the first Black doctoral student in the anthropology department in 1999. n162 Influenced by the UERJ experience and allegations of fraud for admission to an affirmative action program for the diplomat corps n163, [*37] officials at UNB worried about the problem of fraud. Although UNB considered conducting candidate interviews, the implementation commission decided in favor of photos because of concerns for the efficient handling of student applications. n164 This concern with fraud led UNB to diverge from the Carvalho/Segato proposal that had proposed that "social consequentialism" could properly constrain candidates. n165 Reflecting the concern with fraud, UNB decided to modify the UEMS system by requiring that UNB take candidate photos (against standardized backgrounds) to prevent the altering of photos. n166

UNB set a very high standard for rejecting candidates and a very low standard for admitting candidates. If any of the six members of the UNB Commission thought a candidate was Brown or Black, that candidate was admitted. In other words, the UNB commission had to reach unanimity to not admit a candidate. This high standard for rejecting candidates had several consequences. First, this probably contributed to the very low rejection rate at UNB, compared to other colleges. (See Table 3). Second, the Commission effectively set the admission bar very close to whiteness, and apparently Whites reportedly gained admissions to UNB. n167 Third, UNB claimed that the actual impact of the photo requirement significantly exceeded the 4.8% rejection rate by deterring others from applying. n168 Finally, the media closely scrutinized every rejection. The UNB Commission classified at least two sets of twins differently, and at least two additional brother-sister combinations differently, each of which became cause celebres for the media and the opposition to affirmative action. [*38]

Table 4: Appeals by Rejected Candidates at Two Universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Candidates Rejected</th>
<th>Appeals</th>
<th>As % of rejected applicants</th>
<th>Successful appeals</th>
<th>As % of appeals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

[*36] UNB was the second college that decided to verify the identity of its affirmative action applicants. Two anthropology professors, Jose Jorge de Carvalho and Rita Laura Segato, proposed that the university adopt affirmative action in response to the discriminatory treatment of Arivaldo Lima Alves, the first Black doctoral student in the anthropology department in 1999. n162 Influenced by the UERJ experience and allegations of fraud for admission to an affirmative action program for the diplomat corps n163, [*37] officials at UNB worried about the problem of fraud. Although UNB considered conducting candidate interviews, the implementation commission decided in favor of photos because of concerns for the efficient handling of student applications. n164 This concern with fraud led UNB to diverge from the Carvalho/Segato proposal that had proposed that "social consequentialism" could properly constrain candidates. n165 Reflecting the concern with fraud, UNB decided to modify the UEMS system by requiring that UNB take candidate photos (against standardized backgrounds) to prevent the altering of photos. n166

UNB set a very high standard for rejecting candidates and a very low standard for admitting candidates. If any of the six members of the UNB Commission thought a candidate was Brown or Black, that candidate was admitted. In other words, the UNB commission had to reach unanimity to not admit a candidate. This high standard for rejecting candidates had several consequences. First, this probably contributed to the very low rejection rate at UNB, compared to other colleges. (See Table 3). Second, the Commission effectively set the admission bar very close to whiteness, and apparently Whites reportedly gained admissions to UNB. n167 Third, UNB claimed that the actual impact of the photo requirement significantly exceeded the 4.8% rejection rate by deterring others from applying. n168 Finally, the media closely scrutinized every rejection. The UNB Commission classified at least two sets of twins differently, and at least two additional brother-sister combinations differently, each of which became cause celebres for the media and the opposition to affirmative action. [*38]
Table 4: Appeals by Rejected Candidates at Two Universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Candidates</th>
<th>As % of</th>
<th>Successful</th>
<th>As % of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rejected</td>
<td>Appeals</td>
<td>rejected applicants</td>
<td>appeals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNB 1</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>16.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UFPR 2</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>81.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Para a UnB, 21 rejeitados agora sao negros, FOLHA DE SAO
2 Cimea Barbato Bevilaqua, A implantacao do "Plano de Metas de Inclusao Racial e Social" na Universidade Federal do Parana, Curitiba, Dezembro de 2005.

UNB permitted rejected candidates to appeal the college's assessment. As indicated by Table 4, few (16%) candidates appealed their rejections. These much lower rejection and appeal rates conform to the view that the low bar for admission resulted in the admission of Whites, and that many of the rejected candidates perceived themselves as White.

UFMA was the third university to adopt the use of photos to verify candidate identity, although it would do so for only one year. In 2007, its first year of implementing affirmative action, UFMA established a Validation Commission of three members to review photos. The Commission reviewed the photos of all candidates, and invited candidates about whom it had doubts for interviews. In all, the Commission validated the identity of about 80% of the 925 applicants.

According to Fernanda Pinheiro, a member of the commission, the rejected candidates did not show "any trace [of blackness] or any circumstances of disadvantage," n169 which could represent a standard closer to UNB.

Official Documentation

One university, the State University of Goias (UEG), verifies candidate identity by presentation of official documents. The affirmative action program at UEG, initiated in 2004, included seats for Afro Brazilians, public school students, and indigenous or disabled students, and permitted candidates to apply for one of the quota systems and the universal [*39] system simultaneously. All quota candidates are required to provide official documentation: indigenous students must provide a letter from the federal agency for indigenous affairs, the National Foundation of the Indian (FUNAI), public school students need to prove their matriculation through middle school, and Afro Brazilians need to show "an official public document that confirms the candidate's black identity, such as a birth or marriage certificate."

n170 Lacking that, candidates for the Afro Brazilian seats can submit a declaration of blackness officially registered by a public notary, which apparently cost approximately $ 75 in 2006. n171 This last method of documentation appears the most expensive and the least rigorous. n172

Interviews

Three universities use interviews to verify candidate identity. The first, the Federal University of Parana (UFPR), strongly influenced by the UNB plan, developed its affirmative action program in 2004. However, instead of requiring that candidates be photographed, the university conducted a short interview as candidates submitted their applications. n173 To gain admissions through affirmative action, candidates had to be unanimously approved by the Commission, a much higher standard than at UNB. n174 Consequently, the UFPR Commission rejected the identity claims of 22% of the affirmative action candidates. Of the 127 rejected candidates, 81% appealed, and most prevailed. Those who appealed tended to view themselves as Pardo, alleged to have a black parent and in some instance a black grandparent, and showed an official identity document or a photo of their family. n175

[*40] In its first year of affirmative action, UFPR enjoyed a significant growth in Afro Brazilian candidates and students. In subsequent years, the demand for Afro Brazilian candidates declined but remained above the pre-affirmative action level. Marcilene Garcia de Souza, a member of the Commission, and the President of UFPR, Carlos Moreira Junior, both thought that this decline in demand was a response to the Commission's rigorous verification process. n176 Thus, the differences in methods, requiring unanimity to admit rather than to reject, and the actual standards moved the line for candidates further toward Pardo at UFPR than at UNB. The higher rejection and higher appeals rates also suggest that the standard at UFPR was further toward Pardo.
In 2008, UFMA modified its affirmative action admissions process to call all quota candidates, and not just those in doubt, for an interview. Of 3,041 eligible candidates, approximately one thousand did not appear for the interview. n177 Of the 1987 interviewed, the 25-person Commission of Validation did not accept 343 (17.3%), who subsequently competed in the universal system. n178 The 1644 approved candidates represented just over half (54.1%) of the qualified candidates. n179 The Validation Commission had made its determinations based upon a short interview, which sought, according to the director of the commission, Professor Carlos Benedito Rodrigues da Silva, to evaluate the candidate's perception of her blackness in daily life, n180 including how she views herself socially and how she presents herself to her family, as well her reasons for choosing the quota option. n181

Following UNB's footsteps, UFMA also classified twins distinctly. The rejected twin, Ana Caroline, claimed her interview had lasted less than five minutes and consisted of three questions: "(1) why do you want to study Communication? (2) did you study in public school? and (3) do you [*41] understand the [purpose of the] quota system?" n182 During the several month controversy, the university never managed to locate its records from her interview. n183 Fully reminiscent of Marx's warning about the repetition of history, UFMA also admitted Ana Caroline after significant political pressure.

UNB revised its affirmative action admission policy to verify candidate identity based upon interviews as of January 2008 in response to the ongoing controversies. n184 Candidates viewed the new system as more fair and more difficult to scam. However, even under the new system, some candidates reported a "grand mixture of color" among their competitors. Apparently, one candidate was "so White that everyone laughed" when he entered the waiting room, and this candidate was reputedly accepted by the Commission. n185 The interviews at UNB were also short and also consisted of three questions: (1) what is your name? (2) why do you consider yourself Black? and (3) why are you seeking a quota seat? n186

Discussion

The verification of applicant identity constitutes a sensitive process that presents particular challenges in a country that has prided itself for rendering identity ambiguous and indeterminate. To maximize political and social legitimacy in Brazil, the verification method needs to recognize both the primacy of subjective identity and the social contexts of identity, which entails mediating between self-perception and the perception of others. Thus, candidates must be able to "speak" during the process of verification, which the use of photos or documents fails to grant. Until 2008, UNB candidates could not "speak" until their appeal, which recognized neither their due process rights nor the primacy of self-identity. A primary reliance on documents does not recognize the reality of Brazilian identity and past practice in which official documents have been issued without regard for the potential consequences for scarce public goods. n187

Documents and photos best constitute supporting and not primary evidence. I claim that the [*42] interview represents the verification method best suited to maximize the political and societal legitimacy of affirmative action.

On what underlying assumptions about identity might interviews draw? Should interviewers seek to 'uncover' the identity of applicants, on the theory that identity is 'waiting' to be 'fou', or to seek to explore the identity of applicants in a more open-ended fashion? n188 If the latter, might interviews simulate 'travel' in the sense that new experiences, at a university or another country, enabled some Afro Brazilians to see their Brazilian experiences through new eyes? Might interviews take stock of the significance of assimilation in Brazil and explore candidate identity in a way that contests Brazilian assimilation, as the 1991 census campaign sought to do? Further, should interviews be structured in a way that acknowledges the role of positionality in socializing all discourse about identity? A candidate's perceived relationship to her audience, in this instance her interviewers, could influence her identity claim, and thus the composition of interviewers would matter. n189 Thus, committees might be composed to reflect the identity of the applicant pool. Regarding the scope of the interview, committees might develop a "short mode" that would suffice in the vast majority of cases and a "dialogic" mode n190 available for the more complicated cases. n191

What base-line subjectivity might colleges seek from affirmative action candidates in these interviews? For the "short mode" interview, suitable for the vast majority of candidates, I propose a plural approach that emphasizes subjective "color" identity, the recognition of societal position, and the perception of others without any element functioning as the litmus test n192 for identity. If someone presented herself as Parda in her daily life or [*43] was clearly perceived as Parda by others, I claim that would be sufficient. I question an expectation that someone had already come to identify with the Black movement n193 or possessed Black consciousness, either of which would certainly constitute evidence of her identity, but lacking either should not constitute grounds for elimination. n194 Scholars have proposed tests of "suffering," n195 "functional" experience, n196 or "consequentialism" n197 that emphasize different conceptions of subaltern societal position. Piper's "suffering" test was a litmus test of whether she was "Black enough", experi-
rences that lighter Brazilian Pardas also face. Yang's functional test, an effort to move away from a conception of policing fraud, emphasizes the recognition of discrimination. Requiring such recognition in Brazil would represent a narrow construction of the beneficiary class since the majority of Afro Brazilians do not report discriminatory experiences.

n198 Tanya Hernandez proposes a consequentialist approach that asks an individual to recognize how her appearance and self-presentation affects her treatment: "When first interacting with others, in what ways does your appearance affect the interaction?" n199 Hernandez's consequentialism overlaps Piper's suffering test in a more open-ended fashion and elicits a broader recognition of racialized experiences than those generally conceived as discriminatory. While all three notions are relevant for Brazil, I suggest that Hernandez's consequentialism would be most pertinent in a country with coded [*44] behaviors most aptly described as racial and color etiquette. n200 I argue that this consequentialism would need to be incorporated in an exploratory rather than accusatory style to grant primacy to the candidate's subjective identity.

Several questions could elicit subjective "color" identity and recognition of subaltern positionality. First, how does the candidate identify on a daily basis? Presumably, she would offer or be asked to provide concrete instances, such as friends, associates, or community members who could validate her identity. UNB has asked several questions that resonate with Hernandez's concern with the mutual constitution of identity and experience: (1) why do you consider yourself Black? n201 and (2) how is it being Black? n202 Second, a committee might explore how others view and treat the candidate on a daily basis and might ask "whether anyone outside of your family treat you as Pardo?" In these instances, either the candidate would offer, or be asked for, concrete instances. These questions bring community perception and daily experience into the assessment. Although ancestry is not determinative, I claim that having a Black or Brown parent matters in Brazil and propose that committees also elicit parental identity. n203

Consider how those three questions: daily self-presentation, community perception and parental racial identity, would play out for the toughest case: Novos Pardos, "first time Browns," stimulated by the benefit of access to higher education to identify for the first time as Brown. How might a university distinguish between Novos Pardos who deployed identity simply to maximize their life chances and those who had actually come to rethink their identity because of the opportunity? n204 The three proposed questions would not seem helpful to make this determination. Novos Pardos could not viably claim to have presented themselves or to have been perceived as Brown. Nor would parental ancestry necessarily differentiate a light Brown from a White, although having a Black parent has been sufficient in practice to gain admission. Thus, a broader, dialogic approach [*45] to identity that draws upon Hernandez's notion of consequentialism seems especially relevant for such cases.

What might this broader dialogic approach to the identity of Novo Pardo entail? A committee would presumably focus on two elements: (1) the nature of the change in identity: to explore the candidate's considerations triggered by the new opportunity, and (2) the candidates deeper recognition of the consequences of her appearance in daily life. UNB asks candidates, "Before signing up for the UNB entrance examination, had you ever thought of yourself as Negro?" n205 That question would not establish whether someone whose new identity was triggered by the possibility of affirmative action had come to genuinely rethink her identity, which I argue is the central question. Interviewers might ask whether she had previously wondered about her identity, and if so, to talk about that in an open-ended fashion. Interviewers would seek to elicit the elements of that "wondering": her multiple personal and social influences. She might have a sibling who identified as White, another who identified as Brown, a darker parent, a lighter parent, and distinct relations with the extended families of both parents, while most likely privileging the extended family of the White parent. She undoubtedly had the experience of being treated White sometimes and Brown sometimes in social settings, and may have learned to avoid the settings in which she would be treated Brown. Interviewers would seek to draw out her recognition and experience of these diverse influences, opportunities and treatment by others. Hernandez's consequentialism would be extremely relevant to inquire about her recognition of how her "appearance affected the interaction?" n206 The intent would be to locate the substance of her claim to be Brown and her recognition of the consequences of her Brownness, rather than simply authenticating her Afro-Brazilianess. In addition to eliciting innermost thought, interviewers would explore whether she communicated those thoughts to others. Admittedly, this broader dialogic "verification" would tread on soft ground, but I argue that to be a necessary space for individual Novo Pardos and to understand the nature of the identity shift from affirmative action, necessary for a new paradigm of identity.

[*46] Because of the complexity of individual verification, colleges also seek to impact the macro-level, the larger market of applicants. Thus, one college with a lower rate of rejecting candidates (UNB) n207 claimed to have deterred other applicants from applying and to have had a greater impact on the macro-level. At UFMA, the number of candidates who failed to show for interviews tripled the actual rejection rate, suggesting that no-show candidates feared the interviews. The higher initial rejection rate at UFPR, compared to UEMS or UNB, was thought to lower applications in
subsequent years, n208 also suggesting a relationship between verification and macro-level demand. This data suggests that colleges need to be aware that too much deterrence could yield a drop in demand and perhaps create a backlash among rejected candidates.

The nature of the interview process will impact the ability of the verification commissions to make determinations in the difficult cases. Currently, the interviews conducted at UFPR, UNB and UFMA are short and governed by considerations of efficiency, a prominent consideration given the large demand for public universities. At UEG, a notary public can issue an official statement of identity for a sizeable fee. Perhaps the process of confirming identity is best conducted outside of the university admissions office to not overburden the various universities, provided that the outside entity designated is appropriate for the task. Designated Black Movement NGOs and/or an official agency could confirm candidate identity, similar to the certification of candidate eligibility for indigenous affirmative action seats in Brazil. A longer interview conducted separately from the moment of the university entrance examination could allow for a calm, probing interview that could maximize the legitimacy and stability of the process. Based upon the UNB experience, I suggest that the fuller interviews would be necessary for no more than 10% of the applicants. These interviews could illuminate a rethinking of Afro Brazilian identity in Brazil and contribute toward a new racial paradigm. That, as I explore in the closing, seems to be the heart of the controversy: how will Brazil be translated and transformed toward a new racial paradigm?

[*47] If Gilberto Freyre were alive today, he would roll over and die again.
- Edson Cardoso, April, 2007 n209

Conclusion

When Brazil's former President Cardoso initially opened the public discussion about affirmative action in 1996, he conceded the existence of racial discrimination, a statement of historical significance, while also insisting that Brazilians would need to find "Brazilian" solutions to racial discrimination. n210 During the ensuing decade, a growing debate emerged about those "Brazilian" solutions in which opponents continually asserted the impossibility of implementing affirmative action in Brazil because of the nature of Brazilian identity. Initially, they argued that no one would wish to claim to be Black, given deep-seated historical stigma, even to gain an opportunity. That argument has proven wrong and many Whites have been willing to claim to be Black or Brown for the purposes of gaining university admission. The other prominent argument about the impossibility of affirmative action was the converse: that everyone would want an affirmative action seat and that it would be impossible to determine who was really Black. Although that argument has also proven not to be true, that argument landed closer to the mark.

The first five years of affirmative action have shown that the considerable ambiguities of the Brazilian structure of identity have provided sufficient opportunities for strategic action and that Brazilians have deployed their identity strategically. Although the opposition has overstated the consequences of the complexities of identity, important questions about identity and public policy warrant further consideration. The Black movement's initial effort through the 1991 census campaign to encourage Brazilians to identify on the basis of race and not color has developed a following. However, I argue against requiring such racial consciousness on the part of candidates for the university and that Black or Brown color identity should be sufficient.

Affirmative action surely represents a paradigm shift in Brazil. Affirmative action represents the first material incentive in Brazil to identify as Black or Brown, an important counterweight to racial democracy. Affirmative action is increasing the educational opportunities for Blacks, Browns and the poor, which also will create identity shifts. University educated Afro Brazilians are more likely to identify as Black or [*48] Brown and as Afro Brazilian. Further, the nature of the identity shift by Novos Pardos, another consequence of affirmative action, will signal the nature of the paradigm shift. Has the strategic opportunity of entering universities led Novos Pardos to reconsider their identity or to seek personal gain?

I contend that the current moment can only be understood as a collision between past and present identity structures and the discursive ambiguity between fusionist and assimilationist fictions. The provision of targeted opportunities for the historically oppressed, those who were to be absorbed, represents a historically significant counterweight to the societal pressure to be absorbed. These opportunity policies also provide an incentive for anyone in the country to identify within the dominated group. Consequently, others also seek benefits intended for dominated persons, which contributes to the collision between past and present identity structures. Winant characterizes this dynamic, the exhaustion of an old paradigm prior to the development of a new paradigm of identity, as a world-wide phenomena. n211
How might affirmative action affect Brazil and its structure of identity? One possibility, raised by the opposition and Thomas Sowell, is that state identity will trump societal identity and that Brazil will become bipolar. In a sense, that fear parallels the Black movement hope that affirmative action will yield a new paradigm for identity based upon an overarching African ancestry. Certainly identities change over time, but I argue that such change occurs through societal mobilization rather than a single declaration for a public benefit. State identity would have to matter beyond university admissions for such a change to be plausible. A second possibility would be that societal identity would be able to adapt to the new circumstance. In that view, Brazilians would continue to treat state identity as something to be declared in specific contexts, such as university admissions, and claim societal identity, such as *Moreno*, on a daily basis. That latter view underestimates the nature of the change. I hypothesize instead that a new synthesis of state and societal identities will emerge over time.

New knowledge and methodologies about racial identity will be needed to perceive this new synthesis of identity. The understanding of race in Brazil that the opposition has defended so staunchly was developed through an "orientalist" paradigm that has presumed US race relations as the norm. Seminal studies showed that Brazil did not have US style racial dynamics, which said little analytically about Brazilian dynamics. Perhaps the much-maligned "racial commissions" may contribute to a new understanding about identity and to the production of a new subjectivity: new ways of moving beyond the color paradigm. Thus far, the majority of the Black movement recoils from the category, *Moreno*, because of its association to whitening. The battle in the 20th century centered over the construction of the middle of the color spectrum, declared *Moreno* by Freyre. Might the Black Movement find a new way to contest that construction by inventing a new category connoting mixedness and blackness? Could an absorptionist dynamic be transformed into a dynamic that was genuinely fusionist based upon the power of renaming?

Finally, one policy goal I initially posited was whether affirmative action policy could counter the absorptionist aspects of *racial democracy*. Consider that the historical preference for whiter or lighter employees can be expected to continue for the foreseeable future. Thus, employers hiring through affirmative action would be expected to hire the lightest Brown Brazilian available. Ultimately, does opportunity policy in a color hierarchy need to offer "layered' benefits: privileging those "at the bottom" over those "at the middle" over those "at the top"? Would employers need to be expected to hire the darkest of the equally qualified candidates? Those questions, not yet considered, may become pertinent if Brazil seeks to fully exit its racial order.

**Legal Topics:**

For related research and practice materials, see the following legal topics:
Antitrust & Trade LawIndustry RegulationProfessional Associations & Higher EducationGeneral OverviewCivil ProcedureJudicial OfficersJudgesGeneral OverviewEvidenceDemonstrative EvidencePhotographs

**FOOTNOTES:**


n3 India carefully prescribed the circumstances under which the government might use "forbidden criteria." See especially MARC GALANTER, COMPETING EQUALITIES, LAW AND THE BACKWARD CLASSES IN INDIA 215 (Oxford University Press 1984).


n6 In Brazil, a term equivalent to African-American has not developed widespread acceptance. The Black movement (Movimento Negro) has advanced Afro Brasileiro (Afro-Brazilian) and Negro (Black), terms connoting race, as preferable to Preta and Parda, the terms used by the census bureau that connote color: Black and Brown (or tan, more precisely), respectively. In daily life, darker Brazilians have tended to identify as Moreno or one of its many variants rather than as Parda, Preta or Negra. To the census bureau, most Afro Brazilians identify as Parda (Brown) rather than Preta (Black). Parda (Brown) is an identity of different meanings in different parts of the country, that suggest mixedness. Further, atleast three different vocabularies of identity are deployed: movement, state, and traditional. In this article, I refer to both Pretas and Pardas as Afro-Brazilians for clarity and support the Black Movement's aspirations but without asserting that the majority of Pardas and Pretas actually embrace the term.

n7 Brazil's Black movement has grown significantly since 1991. The movements is expressed through many non-governmental organizations (NGOs) which address concrete employment, health, legal, and other issues as well as underlying social and cultural concerns. On the Black movement, see Monica Trevino, *Opportunities and Challenges for the Afro-Brazilian Movement* and Sales Augusto dos Santos, *Black NGOs and Consciousness Rap: New Agents of the Antiracism Struggle in Brazil* in Bernd Reiter and Gladys Mitchell, BRAZIL'S NEW RACIAL POLITICS (Lynne Rienner, 2009). On the census campaign of 1991, see especially Melissa Nobles, SHADES OF CITIZENSHIP: RACE AND THE CENSUS IN MODERN POLITICS 15-17 (Stanford University Press, 2000) (discussing the role of the census bureaus in the definition of categories).

n8 After a century of declining Parda and Preta identity, small but significant increases in Parda and Preta identity and the emergence of Negra identity have developed in the past decade. See Seth Racusen, *Making the "Impossible" Determination: Flexible Identity and Targeted Opportunity in Contemporary Brazil*, 36 CONN. L. REV. 787, 797 (Spring, 2004).

n9 Six universities currently verify the identity of applicants: the Federal University of Brasilia (UNB), the State University of Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS), the Federal University of Parana (UFPR), the Federal University of Maranhao (UFMA), the State University of Goias (UEG), and the State University of Ponta Grossa (UEPG).

n11 The notion of mixedness contains a tension by implying a prior moment of "pure" or "non-mixed" individuals. By "mixedness", the article refers to the social construction of mixed persons in relationship to societal constructs of Whites and Blacks, which produces the meaning of mixedness. See Naomi Pabst, *Blackness/Mixedness: Contestations over Crossing Signs*, 54 CULTURAL CRITIQUE 178 (2003).


n18 Although the judge raised questions about the admissions criterion, the admissions requirements clearly stipulated that candidates declare their identity in either the census category of Brown or Black, declare their belonging to the black race, and have a picture taken that will be evaluated by a UNB commission. In this instance, Fernanda's application was rejected on the second criteria.

n19 UNB's recent revision of its admissions procedures to use interviews instead of photos will likely increase the role of subjectivity in the process. Erica Montegenro, *Cota Racial -- aprovadas mudancas na UNB*, CORREIO BRAZILENSE, Jornal Irohin Clipping, Oct. 2, 2007.

n21 Alan Bakke was the white candidate to the Medical School of the University of California at Davis who challenged the university's affirmative action program as discriminatory. *Regents of Univ. of Cal. v. Bakke*, 438 U.S. 265 (1978)

n22 See especially DIVISOES PERIGOSAS: POLITICAS RACIAIS NO BRASIL (Peter Fry, Yvonne Maggie, Marcos Chor Maio, Simone Monteiro, Ricardo Ventura Santos) (Civilizacao Brasileira, 2007). See also a special issue of the anthropological journal, Horizontes Antropologicos, Marcos Chor Maio and Ricardo Ventura Santos, HORIZONTES ANTROPOLOGICOS, Year 11, N. 23, (Jan/Jun 2005).


n26 See especially Fry et al. 2007, supra note 22, at Política Social de Alto Risco.


n34 The term *racial democracy* refers to a society in which opportunities are not structured by racial identity. Although some scholars contest the origins of the concept, most credit Gilberto Freyre with its development. Frere tributed the "democratization of human relationships" and Brazil's "marching onward toward social democracy" in his English preface to his classic, the *Masters and the Slaves*. For the skeptics, see David Lehman and Levy Cruz, who criticize Freyre's critics for not reading him closely enough but fail to acknowledge that Freyre's the precision of his concepts was not Freyre's strength. He uses 'ethnic democracy', 'racial democracy', and 'social democracy' interchangeably. See GILBERTO FREYRE, THE MASTERS AND THE SLAVES xiv (University of California Press, 1986). See David Lehman, *Gilberto Freyre: the Reassessment Continues*, 43 LATIN AMERICAN RESEARCH REVIEW 208 (2008). See Levy Cruz, *Deocracia racial: uma hipotese*, TRABALHOS PARA DISCUSSAO, N. 128 (Recife: Fundacao Joaquim Nabuco, 2002), available at http://www.fundaj.gov.br/tpd/128.html.

n35 See section 3 -- B.

n36 TELLES 2004, *supra* note 10, at 92-3. The work of Pena and Bortolini suggest a much higher figure, in excess of 50%, and in excess of 75% for 3 of Brazil's regions. See Sergio D. J. Pena and Maria Catira Bortolini, *Pode a genetica definir quem deve se beneficiar das cotas universitarias e demais acoes afirmativas?*, 18 ESTUDOS AVANCADOS 43 (2004).
n37 Sergio D. J. Pena and Maria Catira Bortolini, supra note 36.


n39 Anti-essentialism argues that human beings cannot be reduced to a biological essence. Thus, the significance of being a woman in society is socially and politically constructed in each society, rather than simply arising automatically from the "biological" difference of men and women. The anti-essentialism of Brazilian affirmative action opponents turns anti-essentialism on its head by not acknowledging the social construction of identity in the case of race in Brazil.

n40 Opponents raise other, non-identity based claims, such as considerations of merit. See especially the special issue of HORIZONTES ANTROPOLOGICOS, supra note 22; and Fry, et al, 2007, supra note 22 at Introduction.

n41 Maio and Santos, supra note 23, at 181.

n42 Maio and Santos, supra note 23, at 181.


n44 Pode-se criar uma cisao racial in Fry et al, 2007, supra note 22, at 340.

n45 Pode-se criar uma cisao racial in Fry et al, 2007, supra note 22, at 340.

n46 Telles and Lim argued that the interviewer's racial assessment of a respondent was a stronger proxy for racial discrimination because it was dependent on the views of others. Edward E. Telles and Nelson Lim, Does It Matter Who Answers the Race Question? Racial Classification and Income Inequality in Brazil, 35 DEMOGRAPHY 465 (1998).


n49 Marvin Harris, Josildeth Gomes Consorte, Joseph Lang and Bryan Byrne, Who Are the Whites?: Imposed Census Categories and the Racial Demography of Brazil, 72 SOCIAL FORCES 451, 459 (1993).

n50 Maio and Santos argue that UNB uses the social scientists on its commission as "classifier/taxonomists," performing "techno-bureaucratic" activity that misuses anthropology. Maio and Santos, supra note 23, at 201.

n51 Consider that most Brazilians are able to comply with the census. Less than 1% of Brazilians do not claim a census identity. (Simon Schwartzman, Fora de foco: diversidade e identidades etnicas no Brasil, 55 NOVO ESTUDOS CEBRAP 83 (1999). This group would arguably have a difficult time applying for affirmative action. Yet it would hardly seem justifiable to throw out a needed program for a large sector of Brazilians based upon this small segment who could seemingly be accommodated. Telles has argued persuasively that the possibility of real opportunities available through affirmative action should trump the right to an ambiguous identity. Edward E. Telles, Who Are the Morenas? 73 SOCIAL FORCES 1609 (1995). Indeed, as long as Brazil increases the pool of openings, the uncertain or ambiguous Brazilian can apply without loss through the universal system.

n52 See Sergio D. J. Pena and Maria Catira Bortolini, supra note 36, at 31.


n54 A dificil tarefa de definir quem e Negro no Brasil: Entrevista de Kabengele Munanga, 18 ESTUDOS AVANCADOS, 51 (2004).

n55 See Rosana Zakabi and Leoleli Camargo, "Eles sao gêmeos identicos, mas, Segundo a UNB, este e branco e este e Negro," Veja, June 6, 2007, p. 82 (arguing that racial classification leads to disastrous consequences, cit-
ing Nazi Germany and apartheid South Africa). See also Fry, et al, 2007, supra note 22 at 21 (arguing that racial classifications polarize a society and lead to "conquest, civil wars and genocide").

n56 Tanya Hernandez argued that "Racial categories themselves do not confer stigma upon non-White classifications, but rather racism informs and stigmatizes the categories." See Hernandez, supra note 4, at 160.

n57 Maio and Santos, supra note 23, at 196.

n58 Maio and Santos, supra note 41, at 197.


n60 See FRANZ FANON, BLACK SKIN, WHITE MASKS (New York: Grove Press 1967). On the relevance of Fanon to Brazil, see HOWARD WINANT, H. RACIAL CONDITIONS: POLITICS, THEORY, COMPARISON. (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press 1994)

n61 See N. S. Souza, N. S. Tornar-se negro, ou, As vicissitudes da identidade do negro brasileiro em ascensao social, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brasil, Graal, 1983.


n63 Most pointedly, how could income be verified in an economy with a large informal sector and with widely variable household structure?

n64 Their recent book is dedicated to opposing the law. See Bila Soraj, Jos Carlos Miranda and Yvonne Maggie, Preambulo, in Fry, et al, 2007, supra note 22, at 14.


n67 Singer, *supra* note 66.


n71 TURRA AND VENTURI, ET AL, RACISMO CORDIAL: A MAIS COMPLETA ANALISE SOBRE O PRECONCEITO DE COR NO BRASIL (Sao Paulo, SP, Editora Atica, 1995).

n72 Telles 2004, *supra* note 10, at 118.

n73 Do Valle Silva and Hasenbalg 1999, *supra* note 69, at 57.

n74 Telles 2004, *supra* note 10, at 137.


n76 I concede the Brazilian structure of identity to be complex but not so complex so as to make affirmative action impossible. Even if identity appeared intractable because subaltern identity was occluded, I would argue against the claim of the impossibility of affirmative action. A country that produced a widely inegalitarian society on the grounds of race would have a moral obligation to provide opportunities to those excluded even if they failed to perceive the grounds of their disadvantaged position. In that instance, it would be justifiable to explore policy alternatives that would reach Afro Brazilians without explicitly naming them.

n77 *See* Blanco, *supra* note 15, at 78-85.


n80 Galanter reported between 2,000 and 3,000 castes. See GALANTER, *supra* note 3, at 8.


n83 Telles 2004, *supra* note 10, at 82.

n84 Petruccelli notes that 77 of the 143 categories of the PME had only one claimant. See Jose Luis Petruccelli, *Classificacao etnico-racial brasileira: onde estamos e aonde vamos*, REAA TEXTOS PARA DISCUSSAO, NUMERO 1, REDE DE ESTUDOS DE ACAO AFIRMATIVA 6 (2006).

n85 See Naomi Pabst, *supra* note 11.

n86 Schwarcz, *supra* note 30.

n87 Scholars have identified numerous "systems" of deploying identity within Brazil. Sheriff distinguishes three 'discourses' or 'registers' of identity: (1) a "descriptive discourse" used to describe rather than classify others, (2) a "pragmatic discourse" used to "treat" others in daily life, and (3) a bipolar "discourse on race" that distinguishes white and black and anchors the three discourses. (ROBIN E. SHERIFF, *DREAMING EQUALITY, COLOR, RACE AND RACISM IN URBAN BRAZIL* (Rutgers University Press 2001)). Although Sheriff acknowledges the role of relationality and positionality within the labeling processes, her account does not theorize how relationality and positionality inform the use of the 3 "registers." Telles distinguishes three systems: the popular system, the IBGE, and the "black movement" system. (Telles 2004, *supra* note 10).

n88 Harris 1993, *supra* note 49.

n90 Simon Schwartzman, *supra* note 51, at 5.

n91 Studies have consistently shown that ability or willingness to self-identify in a census category is strongly correlated with education. *See* Telles 2004, *supra* note 10. My secondary analysis of a national survey, the Brazilian Social Study (PESB) of 2002, showed that 98% of the 52 respondents who could not place themselves in a census category possessed less than high school education. The PESB of 2002, (N=2365) was conducted by DataUFF, a research center at the Federal University of Fluminese (UFF). Race was one of its four major themes, along with the Brazilian "jeitinho" or personalist culture, violence and criminality, and sexuality and reproductive health. *See O Que e o PESB, DATAUFF, UFF, available at* http://www.uff.br/datauff/Crdssr/pesb_mod_sexualidade.htm, (last visited: Aug. 31, 2005); and *Brazil Sample Design, Stigma in Global Context: Mental Health Study Website, Indiana University, available at* http://ww.indiana.edu/_sgcmhs/study%20design/brazil.htm (last visited: Aug. 31, 2005). Nelson do Valle Silva kindly shared the dataset.

n92 Datafolha Instituto de Pesquisa, 300 Anos de Zumbi, Os Brasileiros e o Preconceito de Cor, Report (1995), 164.


n94 At UNB in 2004-5, caution prevailed. An affirmative action candidate was admitted if one evaluator of the group of 3 viewed the person as Brown or Black. All 3 evaluators had to view the person as White for that person to not be admitted. All candidates not admitted were then viewed *em banc* by all 6 evaluators. Any candidate viewed as Black or Brown by one of the six evaluators was also admitted. The rejected candidates were those still unanimously viewed as White. Author's interview with Timothy Mulholhand, Brasilia (Aug. 17, 2004).

n95 Secondary analysis of the PESB 2002 conducted by the author.

n96 The Commissions have generally sought to reproduce the "eyes of society" rather than the perspective of trained "experts." This survey data about respondent views about reflects the "eyes of society." There is an important distinction between respondent views of the interviewer (second person assessment) and of photos (third person assessment of someone not present).

n97 A majority of Whites (52%) claim African or indigenous descent. Much larger majorities of Blacks (75%) and Browns (80%) claim European or indigenous descent. Telles 2004, *supra* note 10, at 93.
n98 It is important to note that this complexity in distinguishing Browns from Whites does not seemingly apply to distinguishing indigenous persons from Whites. 29% of Whites and much larger proportions of Browns (48%) and Blacks (44%) claim indigenous ancestry. (Telles 2004, supra note 10, at 93) Distinguishing indigenous from non-indigenous Brazilians could be analogous to distinguishing White from Brown. However, indigenous identity is authoritatively established by a document issued by the Federal Agency of Indigenous Affairs (FUNAI) based upon a letter from a tribe. The lack of controversy over this process contrasts markedly to the heated rancor over the so-called 'racial tribunals'.

n99 Harris 196, supra note 93; Harris 1970, supra note 79; Telles 2004, supra note 10


n101 Helio Santos and Antonio Carlos Arruda da Silva, important Brazilian activists, advanced a proposal in the early 1990's for affirmative action for public school students as the most viable and pragmatic way of reaching Afro Brazilians. Peter Eccles also suggested this approach in his unpublished article, Peter Eccles, Blacks, the Law, and Human Rights in Brazil 53 (Cambridge, Harvard Law School, 1985). See also Ricardo Rochetti, Not as Easy as Black and White: The implications of the University of Rio de Janeiro's Quota-Based Admissions Policy on Affirmative Action Law in Brazil, 37 VAND. J. TRANSNAT'L L. 1423 (2004).

n102 This preference has been expressed in several instances: at UEMS and for public sector hiring in the Ministry of Agriculture. See Solano Nascimento & Beatriz Velloso, A Semana, EPOCA, Dec. 16, 2001.

n103 The author has conducted unpublished secondary analysis of the 1995 Datafolha Zumbi survey that demonstrates this effect. See TURRA AND VENTURI 1995, supra note 71; Telles 2004, supra note 10.

n104 Telles 2004, supra note 10 at 92-3.


n107 For example, the dynamic President of the State University of Bahia (UNEB), Ivete Nascimento, felt that her children, who attended private schools, did not need affirmative action. Author's interview with Ivete Nascimento, Salvador (Aug. 10, 2004).


n109 See Maio and Santos, supra note 23.

n110 See Gois, supra note 51.

n111 Machado, supra note 27.

n112 Machado, supra note 27.

n113 Claims have also been advanced for indigenous Brazilians and those physically different.


n115 The employment screen, boa aparência, which literally means good appearance but possesses racial and class overtones, was apparently devised for occupations with considerable customer contact in anticipation that certain customers would be offended if served by an Afro-Brazilian. See Abdia Nascimento, O Negro revoltado. RIO DE JANEIRO, Editora Nova Fronteira, 1982.


n117 The Bakke Court recognized the Harvard admission process for taking race into account as one of many factors that might contribute to the diversity of the student body. Under this approach, various diversity factors, including race, can boost an applicant's overall standing within a unitary pool of candidates for admission. Regents of Univ. of Cal. v. Bakke, 438 U.S. 265, 316 (1978).
As of January 2008, six colleges use the joint criterion of race and class. For the Universidade do Estado da Bahia (UNEB), the Universidade Federal de Alagoas (UFAL), the Universidade do Estado de Mato Grosso (UNEMAT), and the Universidade Federal de Sao Paulo (UNIFESP), see Renato Ferreira, Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Laboratorio de Politicas Publicas, Programa Politicas da Cor na Educacao Brasileira Mapa das Acoes Afirmativas no Ensino Superior, available at http://152.92.152.60/web/CDREUNIAO/SerieDadosDebate/index.htm. For the Universidade Federal da Bahia (UFBA), and the Universidade Federal do Recconcavo da Bahia (UFRCB), see Manual do Candidato, available at http://www.vestibular.ufba.br/manual/Inform_Gerais2008.htm.


As of January, 2008, seven colleges use the criterion of race or class: Universidade Estadual de Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS), Universidade Federal Do Maranhao (UFMA), Universidade Federal do Parana (UFPR), Universidade de Brasilia (UNB), Universidade Federal de Santa Maria (UFSM), Centro Universitario de Franca (FACEF), Universidade Estadual de Goias (UEG). Renato Ferreira, Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Laboratorio de Politicas Publicas, Programa Politicas da Cor na Educacao Brasileira Mapa das Acoes Afirmativas no Ensino Superior, available at http://152.92.152.60/web/CDREUNIAO/SerieDadosDebate/index.htm.

Three colleges augment a candidate's score with points or a percentage: the Universidade Estadual de Campinas (UNICAMP), the Faculade de Medicina S.J. do Rio Preto (FAMERP), and the Faculdade de Tecnologia - Sao Paulo (FATEC-SP). Renato Ferreira, Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Laboratorio de Politicas Publicas, Programa Politicas da Cor na Educacao Brasileira Mapa das Acoes Afirmativas no Ensino Superior, http://152.92.152.60/web/CDREUNIAO/SerieDadosDebate/index.htm,
Kleinke shows that Afro Brazilian and public school admits increased during the first two years of affirmative action. Mauricio U. Kleinke, "O Vestibular Unicamp e a Inclusão Social: Experiências e Perspectivas," Working paper, http://www.convest.unicamp.br/paais/artigo6.pdf, 10. However, university data reveals that the increased demand by Afro Brazilians and public school student exceeded this increased admissions and that the ratio of candidates to admits became higher for Afro Brazilians than any other group after affirmative action was implemented. See Perfil Socioeconômico dos Candidatos e Ingressantes Vestibular Unicamp for the years 2003-7, http://www.convest.unicamp.br/estatisticas/perfil/.

Machado, supra note 27, at 148.

Race and class, which provides seats for Afro Brazilian public school students, has primarily been used in the Northeast: the poorest and darkest region that uses affirmative action. The class-based approach, race-in-class that provides opportunities to all Public School students, has been used in south and southeast, the lightest regions. The race or class approach, that includes Public school students and Black private school students, has been used primarily in the South and the Central regions (Brasilia), areas with more affluent candidates. Finally, a few elite universities in the southeast use the "bonus points" approach. Do these regional differences in approach reflect regional demographic differences, the balance of political power, or other considerations? The deployment of the narrowest conception of the beneficiary class, Afro-Brazilian public school students, in the poorest region, the northeast, might be more a reflection of politics, since it is also the most traditional region politically. It would be difficult to argue that White public school students do not need opportunity only in the northeast.

See DANIEL MAZMANIAN AND PAUL SABATIER, IMPLEMENTATION AND PUBLIC POLICY (University Press of America 1989).

The State University of Ponta Grossa (UEPG) verifies the identity of its candidates for the Afro Brazilian public school student seats.

Five universities currently verify applicant identity for seats under the broad "race or class" approach: the Federal University of Brasilia (UNB), the State University of Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS), the Federal University of Parana (UFPR), the Federal University of Maranhao (UFMA), and the State University of Goias (UEG).

This controversy has not been about verification per se but verification of racial identity. Neither the verification of public school participation, income nor indigenous status has produced controversy about verification, even though there are equivalent problems. Verification of household income in an economy with a sizable informal labor force is virtually impossible. To my knowledge, no one has argued that because of the impossibility of verifying income in Brazil affirmative action cannot be implemented on the grounds of social class. Nor has anyone denounced indigenous tribes as "racial tribunals" for their procedures in deterring whether or not to issue a letter.

The 'strategic' use of identity undoubtedly emerged in the first round as well. Thus, some candidates who "darkened" themselves for the second round may have "lightened" themselves initially. Further research would be needed to understand the strategic use of identity in Brazil.

See Jon Jeter, Affirmative Action Debate Forces Brazil To Take Look In The Mirror, WASHINGTON POST, June 16, 2003.


A prominent activist, Frei David Raimundo dos Santos, charged that 35% of the admitted Blacks and Browns were actually Whites who had darkened themselves for the purpose of admission, many so counseled by university professors. Sistema de cotas apresenta mudancas em relacao a 2003, FOLHA DIRIGIDA, Oct. 14, 2003, available at http://www2.uerj.br/clipping/cotas (last visited Jan. 31, 2004)

Nagel argues that social constructedness must recognize the endurance of identity. See Nagel, supra note 53, at 168.

See Table 3 below.

This criterion has been discussed as one of the three Jasani factors used in India. See GALANTER, supra note 3, at 290.

Ford discussed this as one of the three tests used to evaluate the claim of the Malone brothers. See Christopher A. Ford, Administering Identity: The Determination of "Race" in Race-Conscious Law, 82 CAL. L. REV. 1233 (1994).

Ford, supra note 138, at 1233.

n141 Tanya Hernandez proposes a consequentialist approach that would ask someone to reflect on how her appearance impacted her treatment and if she shared her ancestry, how that information would affect her treatment. See *Hernandez, supra* note 4, at 168-9.

n142 See comments of David Santos in *Barreto, supra* note 29. See also Adrian Piper's, *Suffering Test, in* Adrian Piper, *Passing for White, Passing for Black*, 58 TRANSITION 1, 6-7 (1992).

n143 The Jasani factors in India strongly emphasize the views of the former and new reference groups. See *Galanter, supra* note 3, at 290-97.

n144 Ford, *supra* note 138, at 1233.

n145 See *Karst, supra* note 140 at 272; see also *Galanter, supra* note 3, at 291-92.

n146 See question of David Santos in *Barreto, supra* note 29.


n148 The four colleges primarily relying on interviews to verify racial identity include Universidade Federal do Paraná (UFPR), Universidade Federal Do Maranhão (UFMA), Universidade de Brasília (UNB), and Universidade Estadual de Ponta Grossa (UEPG). To verify the racial identity of candidates, Universidade Estadual de Mato Grosso do Sul (UEMS) and Universidade Estadual de Goiás (UEG) rely primarily on photos and documents, respectively.

n149 Universities worry about ambiguity of the *Pardo* category (Larissa, Meira, "Rejeitados por unanimidade," (Author's Interview with Mauro Rabelo, Correio Braziliense (June 1, 2004)) and include questions to strengthen the likelihood that a *Pardo* applicant belongs to the intended beneficiary class. For example, many universities ask candidates whether they pertain to something larger than a census category. UFSM asks whether applicants identify as Afro Brazilian (*Afro Brasileiro*), with the explanation that that refers to the IBGE identities of *Pardo* or *Preto*. (Universidade Federal de Santa Maria (UFSM), *Manual do Candidato, Vestibular 2008*, 63, available at http://w3.ufsm.br/coperves/edital.php?id_edital=29) UNEMAT asks candidates whether they consider themselves *Negro* (of the Black race) also linked to IBGE categories and whether they have suffered discrimination for being Black. (Universidade Estadual de Mato Grosso, *Manual do Candidato, Vestibular 008/2*, 40, available at http://www.unemat.br/vestibular.) UFPR asks whether candidates possess "phenotypical traces characterized in society as pertaining to the black (*Negro*) racial group." (UFPR -- Universidade Federal do Parana, *Processo Seletivo 2007/2008, Guia Do Candidato*, 20, available at
Finally, some universities warn candidates to be prepared to prove their identity legally (UFSM) or to be aware of the legal consequences of fraud (UNEMAT).


n158 See Correa, supra note 157.

n159 See Correa, supra note 157.

n161 Maria Jose de Jesus Alves Cordeiro, *Tres anos de efetiva presenca de negros e indigenas cotistas nas salas de aula da UEMS: primeiras analises*, in ANDRE AUGUSTO BRANDAO (ORG,) *COTAS RACIAIS NO BRASIL: A PRIMEIRA AVALIACAO*, (Colecao Politicas da Cor, 2007).

n162 Jose Jorge de Carvalho, *supra* note 43, at 239-240.

n163 Gustavo Moura, a UNB student active in ENEGRESER and the affirmative action planning process, discussed the trouble at the Institute Rio Branco where allegedly 40% of the candidates for the affirmative action seats were white. See *Cotas por cor, nao por renda*, UNB Agencia, April 29, 2004; available at www.unb.br/acs/acsweb/.

n164 Author's interview with Timothy Mulholhand, Brasilia (Aug. 17, 2004).

n165 See the interview with Professor Jose Jorge de Carvalho, PPCOR, Boletim N. 11, March, 2004, *available at* www.politicasdacor.net: "Neither I nor Profa. Rita Segato supported the utilization [of photos]... because we thought that there are other control mechanisms, less problematic from the standpoint of political repercussion, than this." He suggested that regular meetings of the quota students would exert a "severe moral constraint" upon opportunist candidates, which he thought would be more effective and less problematic politically.

n166 Author's interview with Timothy Mulholhand, Brasilia (Aug. 17, 2004).

n167 There are many reports of White admissions at UNB. In addition to the case discussed on page 1, see Erica Montenegro, *Cota Racial -- Aprovadas mudancas na UNB*, CORREIO BRAZILIENSE, JORNAL IROHIN CLIPPING, Feb 10, 2008.

n168 Author's interview with Mauro Rabelo, Brasilia, (Aug. 17, 2004).

Of course, such identification, prepared by an official who often assigned someone's identity, can also violate the primacy of self-identity. See Rafael Guerreiro Osorio, O Sistema Classificatorio de "Cor ou Raca" do IBGE, TEXTO PARA DISCUSSAO N. 996 (November 2003), Brasilia. For the UEG requirement, see Universidade Estadual de Goias, Processo Seletivo 2008/2, 15, available at http://www.vestibular.ueg.br/


Presumably, a notary would be certifying that a candidate declared herself to be Black or Brown in his presence. Although some notaries might require support beyond a verbal declaration, the high fee would serve as a strong incentive to certify a candidate's blackness.


Bevilaqua, supra note 173, at 18.

Bevilaqua, supra note 157, at 17.


The figure was cited differently in two newspaper articles. The figure of 999 was given by Suzana Beckman, UFMA nao incluiria candidata em cotas, O IMPARCIAL, Feb 14, 2008; while the figure of 1,054 was given by Coluna Bastidores, O IMPARCIAL, Feb. 1, 2008.

Columna Bastidores, supra note 177.

Beckman, supra note 177; see also UFMA Commission admits the possibility of human error, O IMPARCIAL, Feb. 12, 2008.

n182 *Inscritos na cota para negros são entrevistados*, *supra* note 181.


n185 Vizeu, *supra* note 184.

n186 Vizeu, *supra* note 184.

n187 Ironically, there appears to have been no controversy in the media about this university verifying identity according to existing documents.

n188 See Paula Saukko, *Studying the self: from the subjective and the social to personal and political dialogues*, 2 QUALITATIVE RESEARCH 244.

n189 A Brazilian would arguably have a harder time claiming to the Brown if at least one of the interviewers had his complexion.

n190 For example, Saukko proposes "agonistic dialogues" that would seek to mediate between the constructions of the "self" presented by individuals, others, and their "social world". *See* Saukko, *supra* note 188, at 252-4.

n191 As a point of reference, the UNB verification committee was apparently stumped by approximately 10% of the applicants in its first year. Author's interview with Timothy Mulholland, Brasilia (Aug. 17, 2004).
n192 UNB included several other questions to elicit life experiences. The first was a question about discrimination: "Were you ever discriminated against?" (Acao Declaratoria com Pedido de Antecipacao de Tutela, Fernanda Souza Lopes de Oliveira, v. Fundacao Universidade de Brasilia, Vara de Direito da Circunscricao Especial Judicaria de Brasilia, July 2004.) That question would seem important to include as long as a positive answer is not required. The second was a question about romantic choices: "Did you ever have a mulata girlfriend?" (Darse Junior, Concorrencia major, CORREIO BRAZILIENSE, June 23, 2004.) This latter question seems questionable especially under the presumptions of racial democracy.

n193 UNB included several questions that consider the candidate's consciousness as a Black, not simply racial identity, but collective identity: "Do you have or have you ever had a connection to the black movement? Do you have connections with the values and with black culture"? and Did you ever participate in the black movement?" Ney Hayashi da Cruz, Alunos sao reavaliados pela UNB para ingresso no sistema de cotas, FOLHA DE SAO PAULO, June 6, 2004, available at http://www1.folha.uol.com.br.

n194 Consider that many Brazilian Black activists developed their racially consciousness in college, which raises strategical and moral questions about expecting that consciousness prior to enrollment.

n195 Adrian Piper's lightness subjected her in the US to a "suffering test" generally conducted by other Blacks who presented their experiences of racism to test if she had really suffered enough. See Adrian Piper, supra note 142.

n196 Yang proposed a "functional test" that emphasizes one's "experience and relationship with racial discrimination" for affirmative action. See Yang, supra note 33, at 407-8.

n197 See Hernandez, supra note 4 at 168-9.

n198 Although there are good reasons to suspect this represents underreporting, approximately 22% of Afro Brazilians report discriminatory experiences. See Datafolha Report, 1995, supra note 92, at 38.


n201 Vizeu, supra note 184.
Of course, some would argue that this question simply pushes the identity question back one generation -- also needing verification.

This is Yang's concern in seeking a third way between acceptance of subjective identity and traditional fraud doctrine. See Yang, supra note 33.

Ney Hayashi da Cruz, supra note 193.

 Committees might develop a listing of probes for discriminatory experiences to further the explorations, such as whether someone had ever been (1) followed in a store, (2) discouraged from shopping or entering a public place, (3) stopped by police while driving or passing through a middle class neighborhood, (4) rejected summarily prevented from applying for employment in occupations with white customers, etc. See Seth Racsen, "A Mulato Cannot be Prejudiced": The Legal Construction of Racial Discrimination in Contemporary Brazil" (Thesis, MIT Department of Political Science 2002), especially 174-195.

Author's interview with Mauro Rabelo, Brasilia (Aug. 17, 2004).


Author's interview with Edson Cardoso, Sao Paulo, (Apr. 19, 2007).

See Maio and Santos, supra note 23, at 86-7.


n215 For example, Gilberto Freyre showed that Brazil did not resemble the post World War I US that he observed. His work was rich descriptively but did not advance systemic claims about Brazilian practices. (See Thomas Skidmore, *Raízes de Gilberto Freyre*, 34 J. LAT. AMER. STUD., 1, 2002) Even if his claim were true that Brazil had the "most harmoniously constituted . . . race relations" in the Americas, what would that tell us about Brazil? (See GILBERTO FREYRE, THE MASTERS AND THE SLAVES, A STUDY IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF BRAZILIAN CIVILIZATION 83, (2nd English Language Version, University of California Press 1986). Donald Pierson and his mentor, Robert Park, highly influenced by Freyre's orientalist paradigm, discussed Brazil in "paradisiacal" terms (Robert Park, "Introduction" to Donald Pierson, Negroes in Brazil: A Study of Race Contact at Bahia, University of Chicago Press, 1942 at xix) because it did not possess US style dynamics. (Donald Pierson, Negroes in Brazil: A Study of Race Contact at Bahia, University of Chicago Press, 1942, especially at 344-350). Marvin Harris sought to unearth an underlying logic to Brazilian identity based upon his understanding of the mapping of identity in the US. Although Harris acknowledged Pierson's observation that the usage of terms: "varies with individuals in keeping with varying personal relations" (Marvin Harris 1964, supra note 93, at 27.) and also that the 'noise' and 'ambiguity' of Brazilian identity could be functional to the maintenance of the social structure, (Marvin Harris, 1970, supra note 79 at 12) he did not theorize those insights, treating variation as noise, rather than information about the "relations" between persons. He concluded that there was so much 'noise' and 'ambiguity' about the classification of Brazilians that he could not find a 'general cognitive formula" for identity claims. (Harris, 1964, supra note 26 at 23.) Thus, he concluded that Brazil was not the US, "The larger significance of the confusion about racial identity in Bahia is that it clearly precludes systematic discrimination and segregation. In order to prevent the members of a certain group from voting, enrolling in a school, or joining a club, it is absolutely indispensable that there be a reliable means of establishing the identity of those who are to be segregated and discriminated against." (Harris 1970, supra note 79, at 28). Carl Degler viewed the "mulatto escape hatch" as the decisive difference between the US and Brazil which he viewed from a US perspective. Although he acknowledged ambiguities in the Brazil-US comparison, he marveled about the use of certain linguistic expressions based upon what their use might have represented in the US without fully analyzing what their use actually meant in Brazil. (CARL DEGLER, NEITHER BLACK NOR WHITE, SLAVERY AND RACE RELATIONS IN BRAZIL AND THE UNITED STATES (MacMillan Publishing 1971)).

n216 Merida Blanco uncovered the social and relational context that had eluded Marvin Harris. From Blanco, one could hypothesize that much Harris's "noise" from the logic of identity actually represented individual positioning, such as: "I am darker than you", or "He is lighter than me", rather than precise positions. The Verification Commissions face a greater challenge, in so far as Blanco was trying to simply uncover the existing structure of identity, and Brazilian identity is evolving beyond that moment. See Blanco, supra note 15.