

Copyright (c) 2000 The Regents of the University of California

U.C. Davis Law Review

Summer, 2000

LENGTH: 11175 words

GLOBALIZATION OR GLOBAL SUBORDINATION?: HOW LATCRIT LINKS THE LOCAL TO GLOBAL AND THE GLOBAL TO THE LOCAL: AFTERWORD: Historicizing and Symbolizing a Racial Ethnic Identity: Lessons for Coalition Building with a Social Justice Agenda

Mary Romero *

BIO:

* Professor, School of Social Justice, College of Public Programs, Arizona State University. B.A., Regis College, Ph.D. University of Colorado at Boulder. I am indebted to Kevin R. Johnson, Christopher Ruiz Cameron, and George A. Martinez for inviting me to participate in LatCrit and who continue to support my increasing involvement. The warm welcome I received from Frank Valdes, Elizabeth M. Iglesias, Guadalupe Luna, Laura Gomez, Sumi K. Cho, Sylvia Lazos, Elvia Arriola, Adrienne Davis, and others has truly been inspiring and uplifting. I am honored that Frank Valdes invited me to write the Afterword to LatCrit IV Symposium. I thank the symposium authors for their challenging articles and their significant contributions to LatCrit social justice agendas. I am grateful for the critical feedback I received from Eric Margolis and the insightful comments I received from Kevin R. Johnson, Sumi Cho and Chris Cameron. Mike Soldatenko and Maria Guitierrez Soldatenko provided me with helpful cites on Chicana/o Studies.

SUMMARY: ... Although groups centering on discrete identities struggled to find a rallying point from which to advocate social justice and coalition building, this has proven to be a difficult project. ... The ways in which race-based movements and racialized communities construct their identities has enormous implications for setting social justice agendas and for coalition building. ... I argue for cooperation and coalition building, for making common linkages, sharing values, and respecting differences. ... A historical analysis of Filipinos in California suggests strategies for coalition building among subordinated groups. ... Each of these works calls into question the legitimacy of certain kinds of historicizing and symbolizing, as well as underscoring the limitations to coalition building that stem from identity construction. ... This type of identity construction has already proven to be an obstacle to coalition building within and outside Chicana/o and Latina/o communities. ... We might take a look at the implications for coalition building with other subordinated groups, what role Latina/o popular culture has in influencing global conversations about contradictions produced by transnational capital, and how popular culture facilitates conversations with other racialized and minoritized people. ...

[*1599]

Introduction

In the late 1960s and 1970s the civil rights and antiwar movements splintered into an array of groups grounded in identity politics. A quarter of a century later, concern for inclusion, diversity, and difference continues to dominate progressive literature. Although groups centering on discrete identities struggled to find a rallying point from which to advocate social justice and coalition building, this has proven to be a difficult project. Self-criticism in the 1980s called attention to falsehoods lurking behind attempts to make

universal claims about particular kinds of subordination. In the 1990s, these critiques have extended to problems of essentialismⁿ¹ and antiessentialismⁿ². Questions about [*1600] the framing of racial and ethnic identity,ⁿ³ the historyⁿ⁴ and symbolsⁿ⁵ evokes, the incorporation of literature and the arts as antisubordination praxis,ⁿ⁶ and their basis for building coalitions (internationally and domestically)ⁿ⁷ were vigorously discussed and debated at LatCrit IV.

LatCrit IV raised number of challenging and provocative issues, particularly those arising from the apparently uneasy union between the theory and praxis of identity. As I reflected on the issues that arose in the symposium stressing commonalities and respect for difference in coalition building, I recalled a troubling incident that occurred recently where I teach at Arizona State University. Following the Supreme Court decision on the Boy Scout hiring practices that allowed the Boy Scouts to discriminate against gays,ⁿ⁸ the campus newspaper published a cartoon depicting a gay scout master handing a badge to a Boy Scout saying, "Ok Boyth, Who wants to earn their First AIDS merit badge?!" During this time, a graduate student in my seminar reported her research findings on student involvement. One of the students she interviewed used this incident as an example of the lack of university-wide support for gay activists. This interviewee remarked that a similar attack on the Chicano community would [*1601] have generated hundreds of letters to the editor, and Movimiento Estudiantil Chicano de Aztlan ("MEChA") would have responded by rallying Chicano students and holding demonstrations. My student selected this interviewee for the study because he had helped to develop a public service component for a new Hispanic fraternity on campus. What I found revealing and alarming about the account was the way he constructed the issues around boundaries or turfs. First, the student did not comprehend how a cartoon attacking gays was "his" issue. He did not perceive that it had anything to do with the narrow range of topics and activities he had defined as "service." Second, he did not consider "activism" within the range of activities that his group participated in. Instead, he perceived Chicano and Latino issues to be narrowly constructed the mission statement of the student organization MEChA. Similarly, MEChA did not voice opposition to the cartoon because they defined political activism within a cultural nationalistic agenda, one that does not include gays or the general category of human rights.

I reflected on this story as I began this Afterword because it captures the tunnel vision inherent in constructing racialized ethnicities that ignore intersectionality and frequently narrow the terrain for coalition building, or make it impossible. The ways in which race-based movements and racialized communities construct their identities has enormous implications for setting social justice agendas and for coalition building.ⁿ⁹ Racialized ethnicities were forged out of centuries of colonialism, conquest, slavery, capitalism, racism, sexism, classism, and the politics of appropriation and co-optation. Consequently, all forms of resistance and struggle pose extremely complex questions. In order to resist effectively, we must constantly reconsider and reconstruct identity.ⁿ¹⁰ This Afterword reflects on a number of identity issues that emerged in LatCrit IV, paying particularly attention to three objectives: (1) the commitment to the production of both knowledge and community specifically as a means toward an end the [*1602] attainment of social justice; (2) elucidating intra-and inter-group diversities across multiple identity axes, including those based on perspective and discipline, and; (3) ensuring that African American, Asian American, Native American, Feminist, Queer, and other OutCrit subjectivities are brought to bear on Latinas/os places and prospects under the Anglocentric and heteropatriarchal rule of the United States.ⁿ¹¹

I hope to add to ongoing dialogues and critiques of problems in identity politics, particularly the distinctions between identity constructions based on a mythical past, imagined communities stemming from lived and shared experiences, claims of authenticity and cultural nationalism. I begin by discussing reflections on historicizing and symbolizing Latina/o identity in terms of agency in the struggle for social justice. Here, I want to engage questions of commonalities and differences involving both intra-and inter-group diversities. I note several essays that offer lessons for building coalitions that draw upon commonalities. Next, I consider writings that highlight cultural controversies that arise when we assume commonalities that do not lead to coalition building but rather splinter organizing efforts. I draw lessons on

how to ground LatCrit in theory and material reality from historical and contemporary cases analyzed throughout the symposium. I end with a review of lessons learned by discussing the critical intersections and transformative potential that culture offers in the struggles for social justice.

I. Historicizing and Symbolizing Latina/o Identity: Questions of Commonalities and Differences

There is a disturbing parable that I first heard when I taught Chicana/o Studies, I had never heard it growing up: A young child asks a fisherman why he didn't put a lid on a basket of crabs. The fisherman says, "Because the basket contains Mexican crabs. As soon as one of them gets near the top the others drag him back down. They are so busy fighting among themselves that I don't have to worry about any of them reaching the top and getting out." This story has two meanings: the first is the familiar [*1603] ideology of capitalism: the only path to success is individual effort, and attempts at organizing only drag the hard worker back into the bucket. The second is a message of cultural-hatred -- this behavior is peculiar to Mexicans. The story frequently is told with a coda; pointing to another bucket with a lid, the fisherman completes the story by saying, "This basket has Jewish crabs. They help each other get to the top. I have to keep a lid on here because they will help each other get out of the basket." Each time I heard this story from a Chicana or Chicano undergraduate it was offered as an explanation for why collective action on campus or in the community failed. The ethnicity of the crabs changed in later tellings, but the parable always evokes the same two underlying assumptions: that organizing is counter-productive and that culture explains why some groups have difficulty establishing common ground and helping members get ahead. The "dysfunction" of Mexican, black, or Indian crabs was explained by the essential qualities of culture and ancestry, as was the "function" of Jewish, Korean, or West Indian crabs.

I counter the myth by explaining that neither conflict nor organizational ability are essential cultural characteristics, and are no more inherent to Chicanas/os than any other group. I argue for cooperation and coalition building, for making common linkages, sharing values, and respecting differences. I argue for overturning the basket. Although the social constructions of race in the U.S. present identity as fixed and stagnant, ideologies of race are anything but consistent. n12 Political strategies aimed at establishing interracial justice cannot assume that commonalities and differences articulated in multiple identities are devoid of racist ideology and history, and, therefore, necessarily constructive for coalition building. Interracial justice requires recognition of the fluidity of racism n13 and exposing the underlying assumptions in particular constructions of identity that create opportunities or establish barriers to coalition building. Constructing the ground between negotiated commonalities and respected differences is key to building the extremely delicate path toward coalition and [*1604] antisubordination praxis. n14 In the following section, I begin to identify the lessons offered in LatCrit V concerning historicizing and symbolizing Latina/o identity and the limits or opportunities for progressive coalition building.

A. Lessons for Building and Constructing Common Ground

A historical analysis of Filipinos in California suggests strategies for coalition building among subordinated groups. Professor Leti Volpp's study of the neglected history of Filipinos and the pattern of antimiscegenation laws and enforcement raises questions about the different ways that race has been sexualized and gendered and the ways these characterizations govern marriage contracts, inheritance, and cultural/social legitimacy. n15 Volpp's questions about the implications of legal distinctions made within identity categories of "Asian American" and "Pacific Asian American" is particularly relevant to similar internal hierarchies within the identity category of Latina/o that need further consideration. n16 Linking examples of antimiscegenation laws and Filipinos to Proposition 187, Professor Victor Romero introduces the concept "minority on minority oppression" to explain inter-and intragroup action that "help perpetuate racial stereotypes that separate us rather than unify our communities." n17 He persuasively argues that responses to racism that fail to build bridges with other racially subordinated groups are likely to promote "minority on minority oppression." In addition, Romero illustrates how identity can be constructed and symbolized to include "perceived notions of commonality" that create opportunities for coalition building

in everyday encounters -- even when they are based on stereotypes. n18 However, the limits of such a beginning are questionable and probably need to be qualified. It is necessary to move beyond stereotypes towards the development of concrete [*1605] commonalities in social, political and/or economic circumstances.

Bringing the lessons closer to home, three essays offer cautionary appraisals of "both the creation of scholarship through community and community through scholarship." n19 Professors Sumi K. Cho and Robert Westley suggest ways of facilitating coalitions among the generations of race critics and avoiding competing paradigms. They recount "an obscured history that was central to the development of Critical Race Theory ("CRT") "the history of student activism for diversity in higher education from the 1960s to the 1990s." n20 Documenting the history of law students at Boalt, Cho and Westley challenge the commonly held perception that CRT was born at Harvard, and point out that the movement has heterogeneous roots. Grounding critical theory in the historical context from which it emerged ties together CRT, LatCrit, APA Crit, Fem Critics, CLS, and NAIL. This grounding also constructs an egalitarian basis for developing and building coalitions to incorporate diverse communities in common struggles and acknowledges "symbiotic relationship between intellectual activists and activist intellectuals." n21 In his panel presentation, Professor Devon Carbado added to growing commentaries on "the old and tired" critiques of the black/white paradigm. n22 He added a caution against continuing critiques that offer no strategic direction methods, or that fail identify the political misuses of the paradigm. He offers concrete suggestions to move dialogues on the various paradigms in directions that offer a basis for coalition building. The importance of community building among scholars of color is particularly salient to the experiences of young legal scholars whose "contributions to legal academia were disrespected, devalued and denigrated" by their home institutions. Professor Pamela Smith's essay provides a number of lessons for tenured and tenure track professors, stressing the need to make [*1606] connections with professors of color across the disciplines, that experience silencing tactics and hostile academic environments, and to senior colleagues that can provide mentoring.

In the third essay, Professor Tanya K. Hernandez explores the socialist Cuban context of affirmative action to pose difficult questions concerning the case of Afro-Latinas/os that are frequently ignored in LatCrit critiques of the white/black binary. n23 This case study poses a distinction between color, class, and ethnicity that has largely been ignored in the analysis of racial and cultural discrimination. While social research has documented differences among Latinas/os based on color and class, n24 writings on intersectionality are primarily theoretical and narrative. n25 A related issue emerging from Hernandez's work is the question of the comfort zone among Latinas/os dissecting race: Are we more likely to engage in theoretical explorations of our mestizo roots rather than our multiracial roots? More specifically, have we ignored our African roots -- both the Moorish connections from Spain and African heritage from slavery? I will return to these issues of identity construction and the assumption of commonality and difference.

B. Lessons About Assuming Commonalities and Similarities

The most obvious incident of assumed and fictitious commonality was presented in the case study written by Dean Cameron. n26 He analyzes the fight over banning gas-powered leaf blowers, in which Hollywood celebrities often supported the ban under the guise of caring for safer environment and the health and spirituality of the Latino gardeners. Defining the ban as benign guidance was not an attempt to build a coalition but to appropriate the voice of the workers. It served to keep Latino gardeners invisible as workers. The social and class differences between the [*1607] gardeners and Hollywood celebrities was exacerbated by these attempts to couch their relationship as that of allies rather than of adversaries; no attempt was made to find a common ground to define the issue.

Salient issues that distinguish racialized communities in the U.S. are highlighted in Professor Eric Yamamoto's article. n27 He demonstrates how questions of identity situate groups' political status, historical consciousness, self-determination, human rights and colonialism. n28 These specific questions of

identity are closely related to the underlying the conflicts described in Professor Hernandez's essay. n29 Each of these works calls into question the legitimacy of certain kinds of historicizing and symbolizing, as well as underscoring the limitations to coalition building that stem from identity construction. While these essays are primarily aimed at inter-and intra-groups within the U.S., I suggest that they raise serious implications for international coalition building as well.

In her comments on the Native Cultures, Comparative Values and Critical Intersections Panel, Professor Tsosie challenged constructions of Chicana/o identity that claim "indigenous" status and rejects similar claims to ancestral land implied in the concepts of Aztlán and la frontera. While I largely agree with her critique, I do think it is important to note that there are numerous constructions of Chicana/o and Mexican American identity. And while some of these identities are grounded in indigenous ancestry, they do not claim the same political status as Native Americans or Native Hawaiians.

On the one hand, I appreciate Professor Tsosie's comments because they address the underlying problem with the movimiento indigenista and the growing cultural nationalism in our communities and universities today. On the other hand, her critique has the unfortunate consequence of erasing the basis for one hundred and fifty years of land and water rights struggles in Southern [*1608] Colorado and Northern New Mexico. n30 Before addressing the specific identity constructions of the movimiento indigenista, I think it is critical to recall that the construction of racial, ethnic and national identity is inexorably tied to myth-making and is highly selective, n31 particularly when the identity is a gloss of two to five hundred years of conquest, occupation, the destruction and creation of nation states, transitions from feudalism to capitalism, and shifting boundaries of citizenship status. n32

Given the acceptance of the term Chicano and the concept of Aztlán among academicians and writers, the Chicano Movement was extremely successful in unifying a population that had not previously owned its history or culture. n33 While Chicanos are unlikely to distinguish themselves as mestizo or non-mestizo, they do make regional classifications such as Tejanos, n34 Californios, n35 and manitos, n36 and they differentiate between Mexicano and Chicano, immigrant and nonimmigrant. n37 We also make generational distinctions. n38 Comparisons between rural and urban experience are extremely significant to families who migrated from the countryside of Texas, New Mexico, and California to find employment in Chicago, Detroit, Denver, and Los Angeles. n39 Prior to the commercial homogenization of culture, regional distinctions were observed in linguistic differences n40 and a host of cultural practices including food, music, n41 traditional medicine, n42 santos, shrines, and other religious customs. n43

I draw attention to these distinctions, not merely to celebrate diversity and acknowledge difference, but to focus on the importance of historical events n44 in shaping social processes and creating and maintaining unique or similar cultures. There is an extensive literature of historical and sociological studies that documents significant regional differences generated by the various religious, government, n45 and labor n46 practices used "to win the [*1610] West." Each of these institutions contributed to shaping the process of "becoming Mexican American," "becoming Chicano," "becoming Latino," and "becoming Hispanic." n47 These concrete historical, social and cultural processes went beyond individual choice to construct specific but fluid group identities created from group experiences and struggle. The construction of identity involved imagining community and establishing the basis for collective action. Today's (so-called postmodern) identity construction based on personal choice or idiosyncrasy is quite different from one based on a concrete, lived experience. Furthermore, the ways in which identity is historicized and symbolized creates boundaries that do not necessarily promote coalition building in antisubordination struggles within the inter-or intra-group. n48

One of the first references to identity politics that I can recall reading was by Carey McWilliams. Writing in the 1940s, he critiqued the identity politics of the elite in Los Angeles in a chapter entitled, "The Fantasy Heritage." n49 At the time Mexicans were excluded from "restaurants, dance halls, swimming pools, and theaters." But, claiming to be direct descendants of "Spanish grandees and caballeros," and building a

"Spain-away-from-Spain," they referred to "a quarter acre and twenty chickens" as a rancho. McWilliams followed with a racial description of Los Angeles' first settlers:

Pablo Rodriquez, Jose Variegas, Jose Moreno, Felix Villavicencio, Jose de Lara, Antonio Mesa, Basilio Rosas, Alejandro Rosas, Antonio Navarro, and Manuel Camero. All "Spanish" [*1611] names, all good "Spanish" except "Pablo Rodriquez" who was an Indian; Jose Variegas, first alcalde of the pueblo, also an Indian; Jose Moreno, a mulatto; Felix Villavicencio, a Spaniard married to an Indian; Jose de Lara, also married to an Indian; Antonio Mesa, who was a Negro; Basilio Rosas, an Indian married to a mulatto; Alejandro Rosas, an Indian married to an Indian; Antonio Navarro, a mestizo with a mulatto wife; and Manuel Camero, a mulatto. The twelfth settler is merely listed as "a Chino" and was probably of Chinese descent. n50

What is most telling is that such references to "Spanish" in our fin de siecle imagination translates into White. This translation is distorted given that Spain's history includes eight hundred years of Moorish domination prior to the colonization of Mexico and the expulsion of Jews in 1492. Clearly, myth making is not the exclusive property of any one group. n51 Early writings of the Chicano Movement claimed Chicanos as the direct descendants of Aztecs and the Southwest as Aztlan, thereby establishing essentialist notions of culture and the nature of mestizos n52 that were later popularized in poetry, art, literature, and dance. n53 In the late [*1612] 1970s and 1980s, Chicana/o writings began to critique aspects of "Aztlan" ideology and challenge certain assumptions, particularly those depicting gender and sexuality. For instance, Mexican n54 and Chicana n55 feminists revisited the portrayal of Malintzin Tenepal or Dona Marina as "La Malinche," the Mexican Eve. n56 In a mytho-symbolic language, they argued that Tenepal could not be traitor of the Mexican people because Mexico was not a nation state at the time and Aztecs had subordinated surrounding tribes. n57 Revisionists argued that Malintzin Tenepal was a heroine that united the tribes in their quest to overthrow the tyranny of the Aztec empire. The most popularized Chicana writings strived to replace the macho representations of Yo Soy Joaquin or Chicano Manifesto with feminist versions of spirituality drawn from MesoAmerica, that (1) replaced the male deities Quetzatcoatl or Huxilopochtli, with the female deities, Tonatzin and Coatlicue, n58 and (2) feminized indigenous identities claiming that "la Raza Comica comes of the union of the Indian mother and the European father." n59 This genre did not directly challenge Chicanismo but merely packaged cultural nationalism in a feminist voice. The symbolizing used to construct indigenous and mestiza/o identity as the true identity of Chicanas/os in the U.S. had several politi [*1613] cal consequences that limited its usefulness and hobbled its ability for coalition building that: (1) it lacks historical specificity, n60 (2) it equates biology [the hybrid represented in the concept of mestizo] to a common culture, history and ancestry, (3) it erases 500 hundred years of material reality; n61 (4) it ignores the central importance of social class, n62 (5) it creates dualistic thinking about racial justice, n63 and (6) it centers spirituality while marginalizing concrete historical and sociological analysis. n64 [*1614]

A contemporary version of the "the fantasy heritage" may well include many aspects of cultural nationalism, particularly the movimiento indigenista. n65 Primarily structured around dance troupes known as Danzantes, the movement claims a Mexica nation and proclaims cultural nationalism -- frequently expressed in sexist, homophobic, anti-Semitic, racist, and militarist ideology. Ignoring Mexico's complex ethnic, race and class history, as well as the existing indigenous communities still struggling to survive, they claim a distinctive indigenous identity based on a MesoAmerica heritage and culture as members of a Mexica nation. n66 In spite of the obvious contradiction, indigenous and mestizo identity is being claimed as a collective spiritual link. Such an ideology requires a highly selective and distorted vision of Mexico's past. n67 In the romantic imagination, indigenous and mestizo identity becomes highly symbolic and ritualized, ungrounded in the lived experience, cultural competence or struggle that unifies specific communities. n68 Nonetheless, Mexistas burn sage, built sweat lodges, and claim a position at international conferences on indigenous rights and struggles. n69 This produces, not coalition, but increased tension and strains surrounding their claims of an identity as "a people/a tribe." In his critique of

Anzaldúa's identity [*1615] construction of the new mestiza, Benjamin Alire Saenz captured the embedded contradictions in appropriation of indigenous identity:

In wanting to distance herself from dominant European discourses, which she views as dualistic, oppressive, and racist, Anzaldúa gestures toward mythologies and cultures that I cannot believe are truly her own. Acknowledgment of mixed ancestry is not in itself problematic; it is far better to acknowledge the competing cultures we literally inherit than to base our identities on ridiculous (and dangerous) notions of "purity" and "pedigree" such as those that gave rise to Nazi Germany and the current wars of ethnic cleansing in Eastern Europe. . . . By calling herself a mestiza, she takes herself out of a European mind-set. She refuses to refer to herself as "Hispanic"; to do so would be to embrace an identity that admits no competing discourses, that admits only a European history and erases any indigenous consciousness. Her impulse is to defy that her "Indianness" has been destroyed. But her "Indianness" has been destroyed -- just as mine has. I do not find it productive to build a politics and an identity centered on "loss." n70

Characterized as a form of oppositional culture or culture of resistance in the face of internal colonialism and institutional racism, the romanticism of pre-Columbian traditional ways, coupled with the appropriation of living indigenous cultures, is inconsistent with the decolonization process that Franz Fanon n71 and Paulo Freire n72 described. Embracing an oppositional culture that substitutes adherence to perceived tradition for assimilationist ideology hampers the progress toward decolonization because it discourages dialectic consciousness-raising or liberating techniques involving self-criticism.

A serious confrontation with our mestizo heritage is a complex project; one that needs to include accepting historical responsibility and recognizing privileges gained by neither being fullbloods [*1616] nor assimilating into Spanish/Mexican culture. n73 An argument that claims (or mandates) mestizo and indigenous identity as a political identity, but remains centered on pre-Columbian mythology assumes commonalities with indigenous people that is not based on our material existence or historical and current struggles in the U.S. While I recognize that the spirituality gained through the mythology of pre-Columbian gods and goddesses may be inspirational to some individuals, the imagined community is thoroughly exclusionary. This type of identity construction has already proven to be an obstacle to coalition building within and outside Chicana/o and Latina/o communities.

The problematic politics of an indigenous identity that places tradition above concerns for social justice is an issue that can be shared with Native Americans. Like the manitos that claim the Colorado's San Luis Valley, Mora Country, Tierra Amarilla and other land grant areas of New Mexico as their homeland, n74 and have been forced off their land in search of jobs, many Native Americans were dispossessed of their land and tribal position through various means. Too often the litmus test of "tradition" and "authenticity" is used to deny membership to mixed-bloods, detribalized or nonreservation Indians. n75 Denying the urban Indian experience, their struggles, and cultural production advances the assimilationist project that began under Richard Pratt at the Carlisle Indian school. n76 No community confronted by the racist colonial past of U.S. policies can wrap themselves in traditionalism and be assured of developing and maintaining an anti [*1617] subordination agenda. Nor will such a policy result from the refusal to engage in self-critique or address issues of essentialism.

The salience of particular kinds of historicizing and symbolizing also appear in the essays that revisit the controversies over religion and coalition theory and praxis. n77 Professor Luna's n78 analysis of the establishment and enforcement of Spanish law by clergy of the Catholic Church in the California missions alerts us to the need to recognize the historical and religious linkages of canon law, statutes, and doctrine to the subordination of Indians and mestizos. Grounding her discussion in a historical context, she avoids the tendency to make the essentialist arguments that appear in more general abstract discussions. n79 At the same time, universalizing the Catholic experience among Latinas/os on the basis of theology is inaccurate because each cultural group had a unique history to the Church. The uniqueness is characterized by the incorporation of specific cultural rituals and icons (including saints and distinctive versions of Mary). n80

Similarly, the Catholic Church's selective appropriation of indigenous culture provided parishioners with a variety of cultural flavors. n81 Cultural variation within Catholicism is not limited to music, language, rituals, or icons but also includes of other ideologies (feminism, nationalism, humanism) n82 and a wide range of beliefs and behaviors. The task, to ascertain how religious praxis may "promote or obstruct the liberation struggles and antisubordination imperatives that have coalesced in and around the LatCrit movement," n83 is most clearly illuminated in Luna's analysis of [*1618] specific struggles of resistance within the Church rather than centering the discussion on theology or the mythology of saints and icons.

C. Historicizing and Symbolizing Material Realities

As the articles in the symposium show, connecting LatCrit theory and praxis to the concrete political struggles of Latina/o communities and other subordinated groups outside the academy, n84 rather than to mythology and theology, promises to bring focus and clarity to the movement. Reclaiming our intellectual history is best achieved by grounding our project in the resistance and struggle of activists. n85 Professor Gil Gott's essay provides an excellent example of locating the roots of the intellectual and political project of critical race theory in the work of "activists such as Ida B. Wells, DuBois, Paul Robeson, Mary McLeod Bethune, Arturo Schomburg, Addie Hunton and Alphaeus Hunton, Jr." n86 Drawing from this rich history of political thought and praxis, we can see how to bridge difference and build coalitions as suggested in Professor Gott's call for a critical race globalism. n87 Recovering our intellectual and political history has been a major project since the fragmenting identity politics of the 1970s and continues today. n88 Shifting our search for roots from the feet of MesoAmerican or Catholic deities to human social activists such as Sara Estela Ramirez, n89 Ricardo Flores Magon, n90 Juan Jose [*1619] Herrera, n91 Lucia Gonzalez Parsons, n92 Teresa Urrea, n93 Emma Tenayca, n94 and Ernesto Galarza n95 has the potential to set us firmly on the path towards antisubordination theory and praxis.

The value of historical specificity n96 or employing "a kind of political impact determination" n97 in the investigation of LatCrit theory cannot be overstated. Several of the essays provide evidence of the strength of grounded analysis. A fine example of historical specificity in race identity is found in Professor Ediberto Roman essay. By analyzing the race debate surrounding the Spanish American War and occupation of territories in the Caribbean and the Pacific, Roman demonstrates that the debate is not merely legislative history but has become "part of the United States Supreme Court jurisprudence." Roman thus demonstrates how "race has always been a real but unspoken factor in international policy." n98 Professor Donna Coker's n99 assessment of the actual material resources available in intervention programs takes into consideration conditions that determine different outcomes for Latinas and other poor women of color. Rather than falling back on models of cultural determinism that characterize Latinas as submissive, suffering and fatalistic, n100 Coker emphasized the intersectionality of multiple identity axes and highlighted structural barriers to obtaining services, such as bilingual services, citizenship, unemployment, and police community relations. William Tamayo, Regional Attorney for the Equal Employment Opportunity [*1620] Commission ("EEOC"), draws upon past experience with political asylum applicants and battered immigrant women in "challenging the cultural limits and cultural-based assumption of the staff" in order to investigate the rape and sexual abuse of nonEnglish speaking Latina immigrant farm workers. n101 Analyzing the recent antibilingual education initiatives in California, Professors George Martinez and Kevin Johnson demonstrate concrete ways that persons of Mexican ancestry have been discriminated against in each initiative and argue for using "discrimination by proxy" as a doctrinal tool to strengthen antidiscrimination laws. This is a very important type of analysis that addresses the more subtle and covert forms of racism that are replacing familiar but the previously unmasked forms.

II. Critical Intersections Through Culture

The urgency of Professor Eric Yamamoto's thesis that "cultural performance" is a viable means to influence the cultural frameworks of decisionmakers, became apparent n102 after reading Professor Larry Cata Backer's findings on the limited penetration that outsider scholarship has made in the courts. n103

Using citations in the opinions of courts to measure the degree of acceptance of the legal writings by women and scholars of color, Backer concludes by noting that most successes have been experienced in "the political and cultural life of the states." n104 Yamamoto's powerful account of "a multifaceted hula dance program performed by a multiracial group of law students and faculty during the Jurist-in-Residence program two years ago" shows how cultural performance has the potential to penetrate the individual framework of supreme court justices. Yamamoto imagines the influence that this cultural performance may have in (re)presenting the history of indigenous Hawaiians to members of the Supreme Court who might not otherwise understand their political status in *Rice v. Cayetano*. Yamamoto challenges legal advocates to go beyond the work of crafting doctrinal arguments by including strategies for cultural transformation. There are brilliant examples from the [*1621] community to draw from, including: CHRLA's use of novelas to organize domestic workers, n105 Nuyorican Poets, n106 Luis Alfaro, n107 Marisela Norte, n108 Culture Clash, El Vez, n109 Coco Fusco, n110 Guillermo Gomez Pena, n111 and many others. The overwhelming enthusiasm in the U.S. over the revival of Cuban music presented in the film and CD of *The Buena Vista Club* will no doubt play an important role in shaping the American public's cultural framework for expanding diplomatic channels in Cuba.

Critical intersections between the arts and legal commentary are further illuminated in Professor Pedro A. Malavet's essay. Drawing on his extensive experience as the editor of several books on storytelling, he extends "insightful and powerful social, political and legal commentaries" n112 to other art forms of the narrative. Citing examples of popular culture, including such forms as Afro-Cuban Jazz, Salsa, poetry, and dance, he points to the political significance and the potential for re-thinking, refiguring and reproducing narratives of nation, citizenship, class, race, gender and sexuality. Discussing Jamaican popular music as antisubordination praxis, Nicholas A. Guinia's reviews ways that Reggae functions as both a "tool for resisting oppression" and a "vehicle for communicating and promoting values, ideas and beliefs." n113 In much the same way, Professor Lillian Manzor analyzed *Camelita Tropicana*, a Cuban-American lesbian art performer, to call attention to the power of narratives and story telling in sub [*1622] verting essentialist constructs of race, gender and sexuality. n114 The intersections between LatCrit and narrative story telling found in the arts suggest innovative ways for outsider scholarship to penetrate the cultural frameworks of decision makers and the political process.

Future LatCrit sessions on popular culture might incorporate inquires into the ways that the production and consumption of Latina/o popular culture in the U.S. is being transformed by the transnational flows of capital and people. We might take a look at the implications for coalition building with other subordinated groups, what role Latina/o popular culture has in influencing global conversations about contradictions produced by transnational capital, and how popular culture facilitates conversations with other racialized and minoritized people. The growth of "world music," the easy availability of video technology, and the spread of cultural forms through the Internet, make the issue of popular culture a particularly promising area for critical theory.

Conclusion: A Cautionary Tale

When I began my academic career twenty years ago, I was inspired by the transformative potential and political activism shaping Chicana o Studies. As I look back, I can see many important intellectual and political contributions that my generation has made. However, I am also aware of our shortcomings and the pitfalls we tumbled into. There were originally two linked goals: 1) creation of a political vision linking intellectual production to community activism; 2) the elimination of oppression. However, as faculty and students undertook the process of institutional building, their political strategies of control and autonomy within academia shifted towards efforts to acquire resources and stability within the institution. Establishing journals, building an academic association, and developing curricula lead to the development of characteristics similar to traditional disciplines. Gradually the critical edge and link to community struggle lessened as scholarship and student activity became focused on identity issues and not antisubordination praxis. The cultural nationalism that dominates current political discussion and debate

within Chicana/o Studies, was largely fueled by an emphasis on arts and [*1623] humanities that was not grounded in a social justice agenda but served narrowly construed identity politics. n115 Even as early as the late 70s, the move towards "doing culture" as a priority of identity politics was apparent. Gomez-Quinones remarked that:

Without class identification and political participation this is at best neutral. At worst, it becomes deceptive, diversionary, and conservative, thus supportive of the status quo. Cultural activity, quo culture, even in groups ostensibly allied to the political movement, retains this conservative character. n116

Building on cultural or racial identity rather than specific antisubordination theories and praxis has resulted in the establishment of interdisciplinary programs that provide Latina/o faculty and students with an academic home but frequently bear more similarities to the larger institution than differences. For instance, on my campus, Chicano/a Studies continues to accept funding from Motorola in the face of strong evidence of the company's continued pollution in communities heavily populated by Chicanas/os. Moreover they accepted a substantial grant from Wells Fargo -- the bank that assisted Oregon Steel in surviving a strike at their Colorado Fuel and Iron Company in Pueblo. The CF& I strike consisted largely of Chicano workers. With a growing number of students majoring in business, efforts are underway to develop an undergraduate bidisciplinary program with the Business School. Needless to say, this program does not empha [*1624] size the concerns of workers but rather of employers and corporate interests.

Replicating traditional disciplines also involved institutionalizing norms and values. Arrogance and self-importance crept into daily interaction between faculty. Hypercriticism and personal grievances repackaged as "political" limited intellectual discourse and community participation in the National Association for Chicana and Chicano Studies. Academic cliques emerged around the practice of selective citation, and perceived stars became legitimated through this institutional practice. Meanwhile as jargon intensified and relevance dissipated the applicability of their writings to community struggle waned. In our enthusiasm to produce interdisciplinary knowledge in LatCrit, I hope that the errors made by ethnic and cultural studies will not be uncritically embraced or reproduced.

Identity politics and resurgent nationalism have made coalition building in our demographically changing communities difficult and have made it impossible, in many instances, to undertake common projects with our neighbors in the black, Asian, Native American, and poor white communities. All too often we see ourselves involved in a zero sum game where black political gains are seen as Latina/o losses. This ideology hinders our ability to address the pressing substantive issues of race, gender and class oppression - locally, nationally, and internationally. Nationalism has slowed our progress in addressing issues of gender and sexuality. Relying on exhausted tropes of ethnic specificity, ethnic solidarity and other essentialized notions of community, we find ourselves with an identity stripped of the national and international struggles for human rights and alone in the fight against racism and class oppression.

Advancing LatCrit's "commitment to the production of both knowledge and community specifically as a means to social justice" involves transforming the crab parable from cultural determinism to a message that organizing is both productive and essential in antisubordination struggle. The LatCrit project has the potential to rebuild misdirected and fragmented ethnic studies discourses. LatCrit discourse has already influenced interdisciplinary writings and revived the link between scholarship and community struggle. The LatCrit web page, LatCrit Primer, and the LatCrit-Student Outreach Listserv will further strengthen [*1625] links towards antisubordination struggle. All of these efforts will hopefully transform future responses of student activists on campuses and in the community to identify with the larger category of human rights rather than fragmenting along lines of race, ethnicity, sexuality, and other dissected identities.

FOOTNOTE-1:

n1 See Angela Harris, Race and Essentialism in Feminist Legal Theory, [42 Stan. L. Rev. 581 \(1990\)](#).

n2 See Sumi K. Cho & Robert Westley, Critical Race Coalitions: Key Movements that Performed the Theory, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1377 \(2000\)](#).

n3 See Tanya K. Hernandez, An Exploration of the Efficacy of Class-Based Approaches to Racial Justice: The Cuban Context, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1135 \(2000\)](#); Berta Esperanza Hernandez-Truyol, LatIndia II -- Latinas/os Natives, and Mestizajes -- A LatCrit Navigation of Nuevos Mundos, Nuevas Fronteras, and Neuvias Teorias, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 851 \(2000\)](#).

n4 See Cho & Westley, supra note 2; Gil Gott, Critical Race Globalism?: Global Economy and the Intersections of Race, Nation, and Class, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1503 \(2000\)](#); Eric K. Yamamoto, Practically Reframing Rights: Culture, Performance, and Judging, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 875 \(2000\)](#).

n5 See Cho & Westley, supra note 2; Gott, supra note 4; Guadalupe T. Luna, Gold, Souls and Wandering Clerics: California Missions, Native Californians, and LatCrit Theory, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 921 \(2000\)](#); Laura M. Padilla, Latinas and Religion: Subordination or State of Grace?, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 973 \(2000\)](#).

n6 See Nicholas A. Gunia, Half the Story Has Never Been Told: Popular Jamaican Music as Antisubordination Praxis, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1333 \(2000\)](#); Pedro A. Malavet, Literature and Arts as Antisubordination Praxis LatCrit Theory and Cultural Production: The Confessions of An Accidental Crit, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1293 \(2000\)](#).

n7 See, Gott, supra note 4; Pamela J. Smith, The Tyrannies of Silence of the Untenured Professors of Law, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1105 \(2000\)](#); William R. Tamayo, The Role of the EEOC in Protecting the Civil Rights of Farm Workers, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1075 \(2000\)](#); Leti Volpp, American Mestizo: Filipinos and Antimiscegenation Laws in California, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 795 \(2000\)](#).

n8 See [Curran v. Mount Diablo Council of Boy Scouts of America, 17 Cal. 4th 670, 72 Cal. Rptr.2d 410 \(1998\)](#) (permitting Boy Scouts to discriminate in hiring on basis of sexual preference).

n9 See George A. Martinez, African-Americans, Latinos, and the Construction of Race: Toward an Epistemic Coalition, [19 ChicanoLatino L. Rev. 213 \(1998\)](#) (discussing importance for Latinas/os to reject legal designation of white in order to dismantle racial subordination and step toward building coalition with African Americans).

n10 These issues are explored in depth in videos by Marlon Riggs. See Black Is, Black ain't: A Personal Journey Through Black Identity (California Newsreel 1995); Tongues Untied (Frameline 1989).

n11 Francisco Valdes, Afterword -- Theorizing "OutCrit" Theories: Coalitional Method and Comparative Jurisprudential Experience -RaceCrits, QueerCrits, LatCrits, [53 U. Miami L. Rev. 1265 \(1999\)](#).

n12 See Volpp, supra note 7. Defining racial identity for Filipinos is addressed in the question of whether to classify as Latinas/os or Asians. The "either/or" nature of the question reflects mainstream society's demand that we all pick and in some cases be assigned a single identity, when in fact many of us have more than one.

n13 See Robert C. Smith, Racism in the Post-Civil Rights Era, Now You See It, Now You Don't (1995).

n14 See Jodi Dean, *Solidarity of Strangers, Feminism After Identity Politics* (1996) (proposing theory of participatory democracy that respects difference and moves beyond limitations posed by identity politics).

n15 See Volpp, *supra* note 7; see also Tomas Almaguer, *Racial Fault Lines: The Historical Origins of White Supremacy in California* (1994) (discussing role of intermarriage in establishing upper class relationships between Mexican elite in California and Anglo Americans).

n16 See Volpp, *supra* note 7.

n17 See Victor C. Romero, "Aren't You Latino?": Building Bridges upon Common Misperceptions, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 837 \(2000\)](#).

n18 See *id.*

n19 See Valdes, *supra* note 11.

n20 See Cho & Westley, *supra* note 2.

n21 *Id.*

n22 See Anthony Paul Farley, *All Flesh Shall See It Together*, [19 Chicano-Latino L. Rev. 163, 172-74 \(1998\)](#) (critiquing Gloria Sandrino-Glasser's criticism of black/white paradigm because paradigm makes Latinas/os that are multi-racial invisible). In addition, Farley makes a very important point about the criticism that ignores the extensive writings by blacks that have been inclusive of Latinos, Asians, and Native Americans -- including Frederick Douglass, W.E.B. DuBois, Booker T. Washington, Paul Robeson, and James Baldwin. See *id.*

n23 See Hernandez, *supra* note 3.

n24 See Suzanne Oboler, *Ethnic Labels, Latino Lives: Identity and the Politics of (Re)Presentation in the United States* (1995); Alejandro Portes & Alex Stepick, *City on the Edge: The Transformation of Miami* (1993); Clara E. Rodriguez, *Puerto Ricans, Born in the U.S.A.* (1989).

n25 See Kevin R. Johnson, *How Did You Get to be Mexican? A White/Brown Man's Search for Identity* (1999).

n26 See Christopher David Ruiz Cameron, *The Rakes of Wrath: Urban Agricultural Workers and the Struggle Against Los Angeles' Ban on Gas-Powered Leaf Blowers*, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1087 \(2000\)](#).

n27 See Yamamoto, *supra* note 4. Specifically he discusses: "(a) political status contrasted with racial status (in applying equal protection doctrine); (b) historical acuity versus historical myopia in multiracial settings; (c) legal norms of self-determination vis-a-vis equality; (d) international human rights rather than domestic civil rights, and; (e) colonialism and conquest vis sovereignty and liberation."

n28 See *id.*

n29 See Hernandez-Truyol, *supra* note 3.

n30 Since 1848, Chicanas/os have engaged in political and legal struggles to keep their homeland and have never claimed their homeland as descents of Aztecs or the Mexica nation. Instead, they claim an identity based on a history of two or three hundred years, tracing their ancestry to communal land grants, and to the surrounding Pueblos and/or Spanish colonization. Unless engaged in university campus politics, they are unlikely to refer to the land as Aztlan

but as land designated by Spanish and Mexican land grants, such as Tierra Amarillo. See Patricia Bell Blawis, *Tijerina and the Land Grants, Mexican Americans in Struggle for Their Heritage* (1971).

n31 See Luz Guerra, *LatCrit la Des-Colonizacion Nuestra: Taking Colon Out*, [19 Chicano-Latino L. Rev. 351 \(1998\)](#).

n32 See Gloria Anzaldua, *Borderlands: La Frontera: The New Mestiza* (1987).

n33 However, there is an overabundance of university examples, particularly among college students in MEChA, that are used in writings claiming an Aztec identity. Consequently, we do not have strong indicators measuring the level of acceptance of ethnic terms and movement symbols that are embraced by the larger Mexican and Mexican American population throughout the U.S.

n34 See generally David Montejano, *Anglos and Mexicans in the Making of Texas, 1836-1986* (1987).

n35 See generally Gilbert G. Gonzalez, *Labor and Community: Mexican Citrus Worker Villages in a Southern California County, 1900-1950* (1994); Martha Menchaca, *The Mexican Outsiders: A Community History of Marginalization and Discrimination in California* (1995)

n36 See generally Nancie L. Gonzalez, *The Spanish-Americans of New Mexico, A Heritage of Pride* (1976).

n37 See David Gutierrez, *Walls and Mirrors: Mexican Americans, Mexican Immigrants, and the Politics of Ethnicity* (1995) (providing overview of history of tensions and cooperation between Mexican Americans and Mexican immigrants in California). Gutierrez provides numerous examples in which Mexican Americans perceived and treated immigrants as not part of their community, and other examples of how Mexican Americans defined their social and political issues as one community. See *id.*; see also Kevin R. Johnson, *Immigration and Latino Identity*, [19 Chicano-Latino L. Rev. 197 \(1998\)](#) (identifying difficulty that legal definitions "citizen" and "alien" create for coalitions in Los Angeles).

n38 See Leo Chavez, *Introduction to Shadowed Lives: Undocumented Immigrants in American Society* xii (1998) (identifying himself as thirteenth generation Chicano).

n39 Although early writings by anthropologists characterized Mexican Americans as a rural people, some of the oldest urban centers in the Southwest were founded by Mexicans. In other words, the urban experience of El Paso and Los Angeles is just as authentic and Yakama Valley in Washington.

n40 See Rosaura Sanchez, *Chicano Discourse Socio-Historic Perspectives* (1983) (discussing Spanish language varieties).

n41 See Manuel H. Pena, *The Texas-Mexican Conjunto, History of a Working-Class Music* (1985) (discussing development of class-base and regionally specific type of music).

n42 See Fran Leeper Buss, *La Partera: Story of a Midwife* (1980) (telling life story of Jesusita Aragon, midwife from San Miguel County in northern New Mexico). Buss's book contains descriptions of specific maternal health practices, herbs, and beliefs specific to this region and borrowed from training received in Mexico. See *id.*

n43 See generally Ana Maria Diaz-Stevens & Anthony M. Stevens-Arroyo, *Recognizing the Latino Resurgence in U.S. Religion, The Emmaus Paradigm* (1998) (discussing traditions); Norma Jean Williams, *The Mexican American Family: Tradition and Change* (1990) (reporting

on study conducted on changing traditions within Mexican American families in Texas from one generation to next).

n44 These include distinct settlement histories and government policies. See generally Rodolfo Acuna, *Occupied America: A History of Chicanos* (1988).

n45 See *id.* (contrasting states in Southwest after Mexican American War, presented in terms of length of time each experienced before annexation and different role each region played in the U.S. economy and capitalist development); Carey McWilliams, *North From Mexico* (1961).

n46 See generally Mario Barrera, *Race and Class in the Southwest; A Theory of Racial Inequality* (1979) (discussing labor history of Mexican Americans from Mexican American War to 1970s that built on colonial labor system model); Camille GuerinGonzales, *Mexican Workers & American Dreams: Immigration, Repatriation and California Farm Labor, 1900-1936* (1994); Devra Weber, *Dark Sweat, White Gold, California Farm Workers, Cotton, and the New Deal* (1994); Emilio Zamora, *The World of the Mexican Worker in Texas* (1993).

n47 See Gutierrez, *supra* note 37 (discussing political struggles and historical incidents in which Mexican Americans identified with Mexican immigrants); Felix M. Padilla, *Latino Ethnic Consciousness: The Case of Mexican Americans and Puerto Ricans in Chicago* (1985) (exploring ethnic identity and identifying uses and practices of pan-ethnicity); George J. Sanchez, *Becoming Mexican American, Ethnicity, Culture and Identity in Chicano Los Angeles, 1900-1945* (1993) (analyzing formal federal and state programs of acculturation aimed at Mexican immigrants and ways that Mexican culture was reconstructed through family networks, religious practices, musical entertainment, work experiences, and consumption patterns).

n48 See Hernandez, *supra* note 3 (discussing implications of AfroCubans theorizing Latinos as race or as ethnicity and ways that Latinas/os with connections to African ancestry may be excluded from coalition building).

n49 McWilliams, *supra* note 45, at 43.

n50 *Id.* at 44.

n51 Of course, the power to write history and establish policy based on one's myth depends on the group's political and economic power. In addition, the less threatening the revisions are, the more likely they will be accepted. I would argue that the incorporation of spiritual and mythical writings into the curriculum is much less threatening than social science research that examines structural inequalities and the impact on the Latina/o community or historical research on labor struggles and organizing.

n52 See generally Armando B. Rendon, *Chicano Manifesto* (1971) (referring to "People of Aztlan").

We are the people of Aztlan, true descendants of the Fifth Sun, el Quinto Sol.

In the early morning light of a day thousands of years old now, my forebears set out from Aztlan, a region of deserts, mountains, rivers, and forests, to seek a new home. Where they came from originally is hidden in the sands and riverbeds and only hinted at by the case of eye and skin which we, their sons, now bear.

Id. at 7.

n53 See Rodolfo Gonzales, *I am Joaquin* 16 (1967).

I am Cuauhtemoc,

proud and noble,
leader of men,
king of an empire
civilized beyond the dreams
Of the gachupin Cortes,
who also is the blood,
The image of myself.
I am the Maya prince.
I am Nexahualcoyotl,
great leader of the Chichimecas.
I am the sword and flame of Cortes
The despot.
And
I am the eagle and serpent of
the Aztec civilization.
Id.

n54 Juan Armanda Alegria, *Psicologia de las Mexicanas* (2d ed. 1995).

n55 See generally Sandra Messinger Cyress, *La Malinche in Mexican Literature from History to Myth* (1991); Adelaida R. Del Castillo, *Malintzin Tenepal: A Preliminary Look into a New Perspective*, in *Essays on la Mujer* (Rosaura Sanchez & Rosa Martinez Cruz eds., 1977).

n56 See Octavio Paz, *The Labyrinth of Solitude, Life and Thought in Mexico*, (Lysander Kemp trans., 1961).

n57 See Alfredo Mirande & Evangelina Enriquez, *La Chicana: The Mexican-American Woman* 31 (1979).

n58 See Gloria Anzaldua, *Borderlands: La Frontera: The New Mestiza* (1987). (concluding with belief that la diosa, Aztec goddess figure, will "life us," presumably our salvation from capitalism, heterosexism, sexism and racism).

n59 Guerra, *supra* note 31, at 357; see also Anzaldua, *supra* note 58; Cherrie Moraga, *Loving in the War Years: Lo que Nunca Paso por Sus Labios* (1983).

n60 See *Border Theory: The Limits of Cultural Politics* (Scott Michaelsen & David E. Johnson eds., 1997) [hereinafter *Border Theory*] (critiquing Gloria Anzaldua and other writers using border, borderlands and border crossing metaphor in developing theories, and pointing to contradictions embedded in the various applications); Paula M. L. Moya, *Chicana Feminism and Postmodernist Theory*, in *Signs* (forthcoming) (arguing that: "If we choose the realist approach, we will work to ground the complex and variable experiences of the women who take on the identity 'Chicana' within the concrete historical and material conditions which they inhabit.") Moya continued:

Rather than a figure for contradiction or oppositionality, the identity 'Chicana' would be a part of a believable and progressive social theory. I would like to suggest that it is only when we have a realist account of Chicana identity, one that refers outward to the world we live in, will we be able to understand what social and political possibilities are open to use, as Chicanas, for the purpose of working to build a better society than the one we currently live in.

Id.

n61 The emphasis on a genealogical construction of race in defining mestizo in Chicano literature is based on U.S. racial formation rather than the one developed in most Latin American contexts where constructions were influenced by culture, class, and other social factors. See Clara Rodriguez & Hector Cordero-Guzman, *Placing Race in Context*, 15 *Racial & Ethnic Stud.* 523 (1992). In addition, race is often viewed as an "individual marker" in the Caribbean and Latin America, while in the U.S. race is always assumed as a group marker that determines your reference group. See Lawrence Wright, *One Drop of Blood*, *New Yorker*, July 25, 1994, at 46-55.

n62 Migration of European men outnumbered the migration of European women and families. This sex ratio may have attributed to the kinds of relations between the races and the conceptions of race that developed in Latin America. The offspring between Indian and black women that served as mates for European men were in some cases recognized as members of the criollo class and inherited all the privileges attached to this racial class. See Elinor C. Burkett, *In Dubious Sisterhood: Class and Sex in Spanish Colonial South America*, 4 *Latin Am. Persp.* 18, 18-26 (1977).

n63 See Benjamin Alire Saenz, *In the Borderlands of Chicano Identity*, in *Border Theory*, supra note 60, at 86. Saenz noted: "Anzaldua, unfortunately, falls into the dualistic thinking she so eloquently critiques. To categorize the world into 'European' and 'indigenous' and try to bridge those two worlds under mestizaje is to fall squarely into 'dualistic' thinking that does not do justice to the complex society in which we live." Id.

n64 Id. "The material conditions that give rise to the Aztec's religion no longer exist. Anzaldua's language, her grammar, her talk are ultimately completely mortgaged to a nostalgia" Id. at 86-87.

n65 See Hector Carreon, *A Cancer in Chicano Studies . . . Immediate Surgery Required* (visited Apr. 18, 2000) <<http://www.serve.com/Impacto/cancer.html>> (on file with author). "Our community is predominately Catholic and as Christians we believe that 'homosexuality' is an abnormality and should not be promoted in our tax supported institutions of higher learning." Id. More recently, anti-Semitic e-mails have been in abundance over the removal of Los Angeles schools Superintendent Ruben Zacarias. See March B. Haefele, *Dialogue of Slurs, Ethnic Insults have no Place in School District's Power Struggle.*, *L.A. Weekly*, Nov. 1999 <<http://www.laweekly.com/ink/99/50/city-haefele.shtml>> (on file with author).

n66 There is no acknowledgment of Mexico's history of slavery or the complex hierarchy arising from intermarriage between Spaniards born in Spain to those born in Mexico, between Spaniards and Indians, Spaniards and mestizos, Spaniards and *mutilos*, Indians and *mutilos*.

n67 Indigenista is based on a cultural deterministic model much like the one proposed by cultural anthropologists, Florence Kluckhohn and Fred L. Strodbeck, conducting research in a New Mexican village in 1950s. See Florence Rockwood Kluckhohn, *Variations in Value Orientations* (1961). Although their study consisted of less than fifty individuals, their research findings were applied to Mexican Americans throughout the U.S. The history of Mexico is multicultural and the simplistic claims of indigenous or mestizo roots erases the incredible

diversity of the country and denies the existence of a meaningful culture undergoing the daily transformations to meet the material demands of daily life.

n68 See Saenz, *supra* note 63, at 85.

n69 The movement has only superficially links to American Indians or indigenous communities in Mexico.

n70 Saenz, *supra* note 63, at 85-86.

n71 Frantz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth* (1963).

n72 See Paulo Freire, *Cultural Action for Freedom* (1973); Paulo Freire, *Education for Critical Consciousness* (1973); Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (1970).

n73 The controversy over the commemoration of the Spanish conquest in New Mexico highlights the different legacies left from conquest for Don Juan de Onate and soldiers' descendants and the residents of Acoma Pueblo. Commemorations symbolize an attempt by his descendants and other Spanish-Mexican people to reclaim New Mexico away from the growing number of Anglo influences throughout the state; whereas Onate remains the murder of Indians. See *New Mexico Monument Conjures Bitter Legacy*, *Philadelphia Inquirer*, Apr. 17, 1999, at A1; *Bridges Needed to Unite Cultures*, *Denv. Post*, Apr. 4, 1999, at G2; *Conquistador Statue Stirs Hispanic Pride and Indian Rage*, *N.Y. Times*, Feb. 9, 1998, at A10.

n74 James Brooke, *Hot Issue in Northern New Mexico: Fine Print of an 1848 Treaty*, *N.Y. Times*, Feb 19, 1999, at A10 (addressing significance of Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo for communities in Northern New Mexico and loss of communal land grants).

n75 See Joanne Marie Barker, *Indian TM USA: Citizenship Rights, Blood Tales, and the Indian Arts and Crafts Act of 1990*, in *We Decide! Native Identity* (Irene Vernon ed., forthcoming).

n76 See Richard Henry Pratt, *Battlefield and Classroom: Four Decades with the American Indian, 1867-1904* (1964); see also William Heuman, *The Indians of Carlisle* (1965).

n77 Elizabeth M. Iglesias & Francisco Valdes, *Afterword -Religion, Gender, Sexuality, Race and Class in Coalitional Theory: A Critical and Self-Critical Analysis of LatCrit Social Justice Agendas*, [19 Chicano-Latino L. Rev. 503 \(1998\)](#).

n78 See Luna, *supra* note 5.

n79 See Padilla, *supra* note 5 (portraying Chicanas and Latinas as having specific cultural tendencies "to accept their fate of suffering with dignity").

n80 See Terry Rey, "The Virgin's Slip Is Full of Fireflies": The Multiform Struggle over the Virgin Mary's Legitimierende Macht in Latin America and Its U.S. Diasporic Communities, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 955 \(2000\)](#).

n81 See *id.* After the Mexican American War, the archdiocese changed hands and Archbishop Lamy assumed the post. The conflict between the Archbishop and local priests who allowed parishioners to continue their indigenous practice is documented as part of the history of New Mexico. See generally Ray John De Aragon, *Padre Martinez and Bishop Lamy* (1978).

n82 See Rey, *supra* note 80.

n83 Iglesias & Valdes, *supra* note 77, at 509. The case of the Mothers of East L.A. is an example of how a group of Latina activists experienced tension within one Catholic parish; they sought affiliation with another parish and developed a nonprofit community-based

component direct by their concerns. See Mary Pardo, Working-Class Mexican American women and "Voluntarism": "We Have to Do It!", in *Women and Work: Exploring Race, Ethnicity, and Class* 204 (1997).

n84 Iglesias & Valdes, *supra* note 77, at 582.

n85 See Cho & Westley, *supra* note 2.

n86 See Gott, *supra* note 4.

n87 See, Timothy A. Canova, Global Finance and the International Monetary Fund's Neoliberal Agenda: The Threat to the Employment, Ethnic Identity, and Cultural Pluralism of Latina/o Communities, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1547 \(2000\)](#) (suggesting areas of application that LatCrit theory may have to the international economic system).

n88 For example, Recovering the U.S. Hispanic Literary Heritage is a national project to search for literary expressions created by Latino in the U.S. from colonial to contemporary times. The project is housed at the University of Houston, and works and collections have been published by the Arte Publico Press.

n89 See Emilio Zamora, Sara Estela Ramirez: Una Rosa Roja En El Movimiento, in *Mexican Women in the United States Struggles Past and Present* (Magdalena Mora & Adelaida R. Del Catillo eds., 1980).

n90 See Ward Albro, *Always a Rebel: Ricardo Flores Magon and the Mexican Revolution* (1992); Colin MacLachlan, *Anarchism and the Mexican Revolution: The Political Trials of Ricardo Flores Magon in the United States* (1991).

n91 See Robert J. Rosenbaum, *Mexicano Resistance in the Southwest: "The Sacred Right of Self-Preservation"* (1981); Mary Romero, *Class Struggle and Resistance Against the Transformation of Land Ownership and Usage in Northern New Mexico: The Case of Las Gorras Blancas* (unpublished manuscript, on file with author).

n92 See Carolyn Ashbaugh, *Lucy Parsons: American Revolutionary* (1976).

n93 See *Notable Hispanic American Women 405-06* (Diane Telgen & Jim Kamp eds., 1993).

n94 *Id.* at 398; Matt S. Meier, *Mexican American Biographies; A Historical Dictionary 1836-1987*, at 218 (1988).

n95 See Ernesto Galarza, *Merchants of Labor: The Mexican Bracero Story; An Account of the Managed Migration of Mexican Farm Workers in California, 1942-1960* (1964); Ernesto Galarza, *Spiders in the House and Workers in the Field*. (1970); Ernesto Galarza, *Tragedy at Chualar: El Crucero de las Treinta y Dos Cruces* (1977).

n96 Iglesias & Valdes, *supra* note 77.

n97 See, Sumi K. Cho, *Essential Politics*, [2 Harv. Latino L. Rev. 433, 434 \(1997\)](#).

n98 See Ediberto Roman, *A Race Approach to International Law (RAIL): Is There a Need for Yet Another Critique of International Law?*, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1519 \(2000\)](#).

n99 See Donna Coker, *Shifting Power for Battered Women: Law, Material Resources, and Poor Women of Color*, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1009 \(2000\)](#).

n100 Mirande & Enriquez, *supra* note 57.

n101 See Tamayo, *supra* note 7.

n102 See Yamamoto, *supra* note 4.

n103 See Larry Cata Backer, Measuring the Penetration of Outsider Scholarship in the Courts: Indifference, Hostility, Engagement, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1173\(2000\)](#).

n104 *Id.*

n105 See Pierrette Hondagneu-Sotelo, Why Advocacy Research? Reflections on Research and Activism with Immigrant Women, *The American Sociologist* (1994).

n106 See, e.g., Aloud! Voices of the Nuyorican Poet's Cafe, Henry Holt and the Online Bookstore (visited Apr. 5, 2000) <<http://www.obsus.com/obs/English/books/holt/books/aloud/index.htm>> (on file with author).

n107 See Luis Alfaro, *Down Town*, New Alliance Records (1993); Michelle Habell Pallan, Family and Sexuality in Recent Chicano Performance: Luis Alfaro's Memory Plays, *Ollantay Theater J.* 33, 33-42 (1996).

n108 Marisela Norte is the author of a CD entitled *Norte Wood*. See Marisela Norte, *Norte Word* (New Alliance Records 1991). She has written essays and short stories too. See, e.g., Marisela Norte, *And the Wind cries Mari*, in *Alchemy* 14-16 (1992); Marisela Norte, *Dolores Fuertes: A Short Story*, in *Alchemy*, *supra*, at 32-33; Marisela Norte, *El Club Sufrimiento* 2000, *9 High Performance* 56 (1986).

n109 See Michelle Habell Pallan, *El Vez is 'Taking Care of Business': The Inter/National Appeal of Chicana/o Popular Music*, *13 Cultural Stud.* 195, 195-210 (1999).

n110 See Coco Fusco, *Broken English Spoken Here: Notes on Cultural Fusion in the Americas* (1995).

n111 See Guillermo Gomez-Pena, *Warrior for Gringostroika: Essays, Performance Texts, and Poetry* (1993).

n112 See Malavet, *supra* note 6.

n113 See Gunia, *supra* note 6.

n114 See Malavet, *supra* note 6.

n115 The argument against cultural nationalism and identity issues that I make here is not exclusive to Chicano and Chicana Studies or Latina/o Studies for that matter, but dominates the current debates over the direction of ethnic studies. This controversy was featured in a recent *New York Times*, featuring two spokesmen representing differing perspectives: Manning Marable and Henry Luis Gates. See *A Debate on Activism in Black Studies*, *N.Y. Times*, Apr. 4, 1998, at A13, A15. The titles of their individual essays clearly state their position. Manning Marable's essay was entitled *A Plea That Scholars Act Upon, Not Just Interpret, Events* and Henry Luis Gates' essay was entitled *A Call to Protect Academic Integrity From Politics*. Gates calls for "the distinction between scholarship that is political and politicized scholarship" whereas Marable makes the distinction between the "intellectual tradition that has generally been 'descriptive,' 'corrective' and 'prescriptive'" and the one he advocates which would continue to link scholarship with the goal of improving the lives of black people. While Manning Marable and Henry Louis Gates are nationally recognized scholars, they are certainly not the first or only ethnic studies scholars and educators to engage in this debate. See Juan Gomez-Quinones, *On Culture* (1977); *The State of Asian America: Activism and Resistance in the 1990s* (Karin Aguilar ed., 1994).

n116 Gomez-Quinones, supra note 115, at 43.