

Copyright (c) 2000 The Regents of the University of California

U.C. Davis Law Review

Summer, 2000

**LENGTH:** 7235 words

**PERFORMING LATCRIT: INTRODUCTION:** Performing LatCrit

Robert S. Chang \* & Natasha Fuller \*\*

**BIO:**

\* Professor of Law, Loyola Law School, Loyola Marymount University. A.B. Princeton University; J.D., M.A. Duke University. I'd like to thank Kevin R. Johnson for inviting us to write this introduction, and the U.C. Davis Law Review for their patience. I'd also like to thank Jerome Culp, Adrienne Davis, Berta Hernandez, Todd Hughes, Kevin R. Johnson, Amy Maldonado, Frank Valdes, Leti Volpp, and the Los Angeles Critical Race Theory Reading Group for their insights.

\*\* Juris Doctor Candidate, expected Summer 2000, Loyola Law School, Loyola Marymount University. B.A., University of California, Los Angeles.

**SUMMARY:** ... In his concluding thoughts to his last field report, Mirande discusses the common themes and issues that emerged as the class progressed, along with the implications for progressive lawyering and advocacy: ... Many of these themes can be found in his strongest field report, the one that provides his title.

...

**[\*1277]**

Borrowing from Eric Yamamoto's definition of race praxis, we understand LatCrit praxis to be "a critical pragmatic process of race theory generation and translation, practical engagement, material change, and reflection . . . which integrates conceptual inquiries into power and representation with frontline struggles for racial justice," n1 especially with regard to Latina/o communities. n2 The four articles in this cluster can be seen as case studies that explore different aspects of LatCrit praxis. Pedro Malavet examines the role literature and the arts can play as a form of antistatist practice. n3 Nicholas Gunia focuses on Jamaican music as a particular site of antistatist practice, showing us that resistance comes in many forms and that LatCrit practitioners must have a broad theory for social change that is not limited to legislatures, courtrooms, classrooms, and law reviews. n4 Alfredo Mirande Gonzalez employs personal narrative to tell us how he used narra [\*1278] tives in his classroom to better prepare students to work with subordinated groups. n5 In doing so, he presents, obliquely, a pedagogical model for training law students. Sumi Cho and Robert Westley present a case study of U.C. Berkeley's Boalt Coalition for a Diversified Faculty to make the important point that LatCrit praxis must go beyond theory and progressive lawyering to include a third dimension, political organizing. n6 They argue that if we pay sufficient attention to this third dimension and its submerged histories it will reveal that student movements were central to the development of CRT and will expose the limitations of anti-essentialist theorizing.

Together, these four articles present a vibrant picture of LatCrit praxis, a project that, as Francisco Valdes notes, is by its very nature "perpetually under construction." n7 They also present important questions about narrative responsibility that can help guide future work that employs narrative methodology. We turn now to examine the way each article constructs or performs LatCrit. n8

## Case Study 1 Literature and the Arts as Antisubordinationist Practice

Professor Pedro Malavet confesses to being an "accidental crit." n9 His contribution to this symposium can be described as his intellectual journey as his involvement with LatCrit transforms him, especially as a member of the planning committee for LatCrit IV. n10 Along the way, he challenges what he perceives to be the (ab)use of language in postmodern discourse, contrasting this with the way "popular cultural narratives[ ] may sometimes be spoken in plain and simple language, and . . . still be perfectly able to transmit complex ideas that constitute antisubordination praxis." n11 Some of these popular cultural narratives are the subject of the plenary ses [\*1279] sion -- Literature and the Arts as Antisubordination Praxis: LatCrit Theory and Cultural Production -- which plays an important role in Professor Malavet's intellectual transformation. n12

Before providing an account of that session, Professor Malavet encourages the use of narrative within CRT. n13 While we agree with the basic contours of his defense of narrative, n14 there is one important point that invites elaboration. Malavet states that "LatCrit scholarship must and does include storytelling" n15 in order to challenge current norms and essentialist constructions of Latinas/os. He equates current norms and essentialism with the current structures of oppression, and storytelling is presented as an oppositional methodology. But storytelling is not the sole province of the left or counterhegemonic social formations. Storytelling is a neutral technique that can perhaps be used more easily to maintain the status quo than to attack it. n16 One example comes from the 1990 United States Senate race in North Carolina between Jesse Helms, the white incumbent, and Harvey Gantt, the African American challenger. A commercial for the Helms campaign featured "a white working class man tearing up a rejection letter while the voice-over said, 'You needed that job and you were the best qualified. . . . But it had to go to a minority because of a racial quota.'" n17 [\*1280] This story is both normative and essentialist. It pushes the norm of an unexamined colorblind meritocracy; it is essentialist in the way that it reinforces stereotypes about un(der)qualified minorities. It is a powerful story that helped Jesse Helms win the election.

If storytelling is understood as a neutral technique, how should it be employed in LatCrit discourse? While LatCrit storytelling should be careful to avoid the pitfalls of essentialism, n18 we understand the best LatCrit stories to be differently normative from those that maintain oppressive structures. These stories resist hegemonic constructions of Latinas/os and other subordinated communities, and they offer an enriched notion of justice through the inclusion of previously excluded stories. Professor Malavet makes precisely this point when he says that "storytelling can be used to fill historical gaps," and "storytelling, particularly by outsiders, provides a balanced historical view, ensuring that the particular stories about minority communities are not suppressed." n19 But if LatCrit scholars are to deploy stories as a LatCrit praxis methodology, the goal of storytelling must go beyond descriptive "accuracy"; the "is" must be connected to an explicit or implicit "ought." We will describe this as the narrative responsibility of a LatCrit storyteller. n20

LatCrit storytellers already fulfill this responsibility. For example, stories about the Bracero Program that brought Mexican workers into the United States and their wholesale deportation through Operation "Wetback" n21 operate far beyond the descriptive realm to provide some normative "oughts": (1) we ought not to have treated Mexican immigrants and American citizens of Mexican ancestry in this manner; (2) we ought to remember this history when we consider the current treatment of agricultural workers who are subject to terrible abuses whether or not they are documented; (3) we ought not to have allowed the Immigration and [\*1281] Naturalization Service to defy court orders so that by the 1990s, hundreds of alien children fleeing the violence in Central America were held in squalid refugee camps in Arizona, California, and Texas with little access to healthcare, formal education, or legal services; n22 we ought to reconsider the way Latinas/os are essentialized as perpetually foreign which creates easy targets for nativism during times of cultural or military or economic uncertainty. n23 The list of normative propositions can go on and on. One of the tasks for LatCrit is to challenge settled, exclusionary norms through "counterstories" n24 in order to create more inclusive justice norms.

This is in fact how Professor Malavet employs narrative in his article. We read the story of his intellectual transformation as an allegorical tale. Malavet spent his formative years in Puerto Rico where he occupied a relatively privileged position based on his class and racial features. He was seduced by the liberal myth of meritocracy to believe that equality of opportunity existed such that one was limited only by one's reach and efforts. n25 Paradise is lost, though, when he moves to the States and learns that he is a person of color, an appellation he resists at first because:

"Personas de color," the literal Spanish translation . . . was a very offensive reference to blackness and to mulatez (mulattohood) that was used in my community on the isla. What I had not learned until recently, is that when a White American looks at me, he or she sees a persona de color . . . . How will I break it to mamita (mommy) that I am colored? n26

This realization of his newfound place in the racial economy of the United States mainland spurs his disenchantment with the liberal myth of meritocracy and his eventual engagement with LatCrit.

In addition to telling a personal odyssey, this story can elicit empathy from those able to relate to his experiences, n27 and may create [\*1282] connections with other communities. n28 Professor Malavet's story echoes the story of racial realization told by James Weldon Johnson in *The Autobiography of an Ex-Coloured Man*. n29 Weldon is very light-skinned and did not learn of his "real" race until the second term of school. The principal of his school walked into his classroom:

"I wish all of the white scholars to stand for a moment." I rose with the others. The teacher looked at me and, calling my name, said: "You sit down for the present, and rise with the others." I did not quite understand her, and questioned: "Ma'm?" She repeated, with a softer tone in her voice: "You sit down now, and rise with the others." I sat down dazed. I saw and heard nothing. When the others were asked to rise, I did not know it. . . . [After school, he runs home to his room and his looking-glass.] For an instant I was afraid to look, but when I did, I looked long and earnestly. . . . How long I stood there gazing at my image I do not know. When I came out and reached the head of the stairs, I heard the lady who had been with my mother going out. I ran downstairs and rushed to where my mother was sitting . . . . I buried my head in her lap and blurted out: "Mother, mother, tell me, am I a nigger?" n30

Malavet's and Johnson's stories, side by side, tell a similar story about the racial economy of the United States and challenge the norm of ahistorical colorblindness as the solution to this country's race problem. Narrative can be very powerful.

#### Case Study 2 Jamaican Music as a Particular Site of Antisubordinationist Practice

In *Half the Story Has Never Been Told*, Nicholas Gunia attempts to tell the untold half, a gap left because of the way reggae music "has been devalued and underrepresented by scholars that privilege the knowledge and views of the establishment over those of the [\*1283] masses." n31 In doing so, he is engaging in the kind of storytelling encouraged by Professor Malavet. n32

Through his examination of Jamaican music, Gunia reminds us that social change is not always accomplished by the efforts of progressive lawyers or legal scholars. While not saying that we should now go out and produce music or express ourselves in other art forms, he shows us what the music can teach us if only we "listen." As repositories of cultural memory, music can provide glimpses of history, emotions, and lives that cannot otherwise be accessed. Further, productive alliances may be made with those artists who are engaging in antisubordinationist practices. Each has much to gain.

While Gunia's article teaches about Jamaican race and class politics, and shows how reggae music has served as a powerful antisubordinationist practice in Jamaica, n33 its lessons for LatCrit are less obvious. We might take Gunia's presentation as an invitation to explore the different ways that music has operated in different contexts and communities. n34 Or, more crudely, we might ask where Jamaicans map in our racial cosmology and in LatCrit discourse.

Gunia tells us that "roughly eighty percent of all Jamaicans are black, while an additional fifteen percent are mixed, or brown Jamaicans, and also of African descent. The remaining five percent of the population is comprised of Europeans, Chinese, East Indians and Arabs." n35 Later, he tells us that "many Jamaicans, who identify themselves as white, emigrate to the United States only to find out that they are black." n36 Presumably, persons who identify as black in Jamaica continue to do so upon emigration to the United States, but perhaps not as Black American or African American. Consider the identity formation known as "West Indian Black." n37 Gunia's [\*1284] article implicitly raises the question about the impact that immigration from the Caribbean will have on the racial taxonomy/logic of the United States. As one commentator, Dennis Conway, observed:

New immigration from such non-traditional source regions as Africa, the Caribbean, and South Asia is bringing multicultural plurality to the Black- or AfricanAmerican community. Not only is Latin American and Caribbean immigration contributing to HispanicAmerican diversity, but also to an emerging panAmerican heterogeneity. Accordingly, conventional, ascriptive distinctions of U.S. racial and ethnic minorities into "black" and "hispanic" are likely to face challenge, or at least undergo reconceptualization under the dawning (political) reality of non-white, cultural heterogeneity and diversity. n38

It seems obvious that language, colonialism and postcoloniality, religion, and culture will play important roles in this reconceptualization of nonwhite identities. Gunia's work reminds us of the importance of culture if we are to understand who "we" are and who "we" will become. The way we experience culture and the way we participate in the production of culture strongly informs who we are. Gunia discussed music as a form of antisubordinationist practice. An avenue of further inquiry is the way antisubordinationist practices, like music, construct individual and group identities. n39 Antisubordinationist practices may help to produce political (as opposed to essential) identities. Understanding how this operates may help with the difficult work of building and maintaining coalitions. [\*1285]

#### Case Study 3 Using Narrative to Teach Students How to Serve Subordinated Communities

Professor Mirande sets out "to illustrate how narratives and storytelling can be used in teaching . . . as a pedagogical tool for preparing students to work with subordinated groups." n40 While the actual case study he reports on is from an undergraduate course, n41 it is also potentially relevant for clinical law teaching and for civil rights litigation courses. Mirande required the students in his class to produce field reports of their experiences working with certain groups. n42 In many ways, Mirande modeled his class after his own experience as a student in Stanford Law School's Lawyering for Social Change Program. n43 One important difference is that in the class he taught, Mirande began writing field reports of his own, reflecting on the class and the issues raised in it. n44 He wrote these field reports to a fictional character, Fermina Gabriel, but his students were the intended audience.

This raises an audience question. Written originally for his students, Mirande's field reports contain lessons that he felt unable to convey in the conventional classroom setting. But what does he hope to convey to a law review audience by reproducing them here, especially when he himself admits in his introduction that the field reports "may appear on the surface to be anecdotal, unfocused, and lacking obvious transitions from one section to the next"? n45 Is this a guidebook or model for teachers? If his article is meant to be a guidebook or model, some more explicit instructions would have been helpful. If meant for students, are they supposed to model their field reports after his? It would have been interesting to see, or at least have descriptions of, what the student field reports were like and how, through their exposure to Mirande's field reports, they learned to work with subordinated [\*1286] communities. Without more explicit instructions, we were uncertain what teachers, students, judges, and/or lawyers were to make of the often deeply personal material contained in the field reports.

This raises the question of narrative responsibility that we raised earlier. n46 Is there a strong connection between the "is" and an implied or explicit "ought." In his concluding thoughts to his last field report,

Mirande discusses the common themes and issues that emerged as the class progressed, along with the implications for progressive lawyering and advocacy:

- (1) how one relates to the "Other";
- (2) bereavement;
- (3) centrality of family and biography in shaping our conceptions of law and subordination;
- (4) "voice," representation, and authenticity as it relates to advocacy on behalf of subordinated groups; and
- (5) internal diversity within subordinated groups

Themes (1), (4), and (5) contain important lessons for progressive lawyering. Many of these themes can be found in his strongest field report, the one that provides his title. It is a funny, allegorical tale that warns of the pitfalls of objectifying and commodifying those "unfortunates" whom progressive lawyers serve.

Although Mirande exhaustively discussed themes (2) and (3) in his field reports, we were uncertain how they related to his class or to progressive lawyering, unless they contribute to themes (1), (4), and (5). Mirande had his students read Renato Rosaldo's account of Ilongot headhunting. n47 Rosaldo was unable to relate to the practice until, fourteen years later, he experienced the grief/rage [\*1287] brought on by the death of his wife. n48 Mirande writes that he "relates to [Rosaldo's] piece in a very personal, visceral way." n49 We were not sure how his ability to relate to Rosaldo's experience translated into better classroom practice or progressive lawyering methodology, unless by talking about his bereavement he was inviting his students to explore their own grief in the student reports. n50 Personal narrative may free the narrator from the false voice of objectivity, but without further elaboration, personal narrative may collapse into self-absorption. n51 This highlights one of the pitfalls of using personal narrative and the care required to use it effectively. n52

There is one point that requires further comment. Professor Kevin Johnson in his Foreword notes that Mirande may be interpreted as lacking gender sensitivity in his depiction of Fermina, who, among other things, "looks great in her black Charra outfit." n53 To be fair to Mirande, this description comes at the end of a long paragraph spinning out an extraordinary fictional life:

Fermina was born in the barrio of South Colton. Her father was an orange picker and later worked at the cement plant in Colton. After graduating second in her class at Colton High School she attended Valley Community College for two years and then went on a scholarship to the University of California at Santa Cruz. After working for the farm workers in Delano she entered the joint J.D. and Ph.D. Program in sociology at Stanford. After graduating from Stanford she worked for the Milagro Immigration Clinic in Watsonville. She teaches part time at U.C. Santa Cruz in the History of Consciousness Program. Oddly enough, her real passion is literature. She just published her first novel and is working on a collection of poems and short stories. On the weekends, [\*1288] Fermina participates in a folklorico group and she occasionally sings at El Sombrero Restaurant in Watsonville. . . .

Fermina loves to ride horses and is a charter member of the Lienso Charro del Nortel, and was on the Olympic Equestrian Team in Atlanta. n54

And, she looks great in her black Charra outfit. She really is a "Super Chicana." n55 But what does this description do for his narrative? After all, the field reports are about the author, not her. She has no voice, no real presence in the field reports. As only a foil, despite her extraordinary life, she cannot be said to serve meaningfully as a role model for his male or female students.

The description of Fermina leads us to wonder about some of his other narrative choices. In the text, he talks about how his brothers and he "were forced to grow up very rapidly." n56 The supporting footnote states: "I recall for example, that I started 'dating' at age eight, and that I would actually go to the movies by myself with a girl at this age. It seems pretty amazing as I look back on it." n57 Growing up is equated

with having, or at least emulating, mature heteronormative relations. And now, he has a Super Chicana as his epistolary companion. Mirande's narrative choices reflect problematic constructions of Chicana/o femininity and masculinity.

The need for (more than) gender sensitivity when critiquing racism and other forms of subordination is highlighted in Bernice Zamora's poem, Notes from a Chicana "Coed":

To cry that the gabacho [derogatory term for Anglos] is our oppressor is to shout in abstraction, carnal. brother He no more oppresses us than you do now as you tell me "It's the gringo who oppresses you, Babe." . . . you're quick to shout, "Don't give me that Women's Lib trip, mujer, woman [\*1289] that only divides us, and we have to work together for the movimiento; movement the gabacho is oppressing us!" n58

This poem highlights the untenable position women of color often find themselves in when they are asked to subsume their gender for the sake of racial solidarity. n59 It teaches us about the importance of self-reflection and self-critique to protect against inadvertent reenactments of the kinds of subordination we claim to be working against. n60 Mirande, writing against subordination, must take care not to repeat the sins that he condemns.

#### Case Study 4 Critical Race Theory (Rev. Ed.)

Professors Sumi Cho and Robert Westley have written a provocative article that seeks to revise CRT to bring about their vision of its political potential. The first revision involves the history and development of CRT. The second rejects the primacy of anti-essentialist theory underlying the work of a number of critical race theorists. n61 This article is likely to set off a rich discussion.

In the first part of the article, Professors Cho and Westley set out "to retrieve an obscured history that was central to the development of critical race theory." n62 Although they disclaim the intent to add to the already-existing genesis stories, n63 they are essentially cre [\*1290] ating another genesis story, n64 one that emphasizes student activism generally and the Boalt Coalition for a Diversified Faculty (BCDF) specifically. n65 In doing so, they are writing against the grain of standard accounts that "emphasize the agency of individual scholars" n66 and "obfuscate ongoing power relations in legal academe by perpetuating the notion of selfcorrecting institutional reform -- i.e., that the struggle over physical space for people of color on law school faculties was primarily a matter of prevailing in the 'free marketplace of ideas.'" n67 Cho and Westley reject the liberal undertones of the story of individual agency and selfcorrecting institutions. They criticize that story as a false narrative of inevitable progress that minimizes the role of power politics in bringing about change.

In telling the submerged history, Professors Cho and Westley seek to remind critical race scholars to not forget the political movements that helped create the space in the legal academy for them to do their work. They also argue that recognition of this history "has significant implications for the mutual obligations between radicals in the academy and political communities." n68 These obligations become the centerpiece of the second half of their article.

In the second half of their article, Cho and Westley propose a [\*1291] mode of synergistic movement theorizing that contains both substantive and methodological commitments. Synergism represents the contestation with power by racially conscious political movements by "doing" race conscious theory whose "scientism" -- data, logic, verifiability, etc. grows organically from political context. As outsider intellectuals, our goal and strategy articulation should become an open process, a dialogue, intersubjective and genealogically wed to the resistant discourses and practices that perform the movement. n69

They applaud first wave CRT scholarship n70 but are critical of second wave CRT scholarship, much of which they see as not being grounded in political movements or perhaps arising out of other concerns. n71 In particular, they focus on the postmodern turn, where "scholars retooled race variously as a social construction, a dangerous trope, a performance, in contrast to outdated and discredited notions of race as a

biological fact of difference among groups." n72 This moment in the development of CRT was characterized by the hope that race and gender essentialism would be overturned and that it was anti-essentialist theory that would provide the analytic tools that would unmask incoherent group classifications "as a stratagem of oppressive power." n73 Cho and Westley argue that this critique misunderstood the way antiessentialist theory could be co-opted by the existing structures of power to delegitimize race or gender or sexuality-based social movements. n74 Understood in this way, unbounded anti-essentialist theory can be disabling to community organizing, n75 and "once set in motion, antiessentialism unmodified has no limiting principles to prevent minority groups from being deconstructed until all that remains are disunited and atomized individuals themselves." n76 Cho and [\*1292] Westley criticize the second wave's fascination with anti-essentialism as "the ahistorical pursuit of the 'theoretical' that represents an abdication of political engagement and the relinquishment of the full promise of antistatist intellectual production." n77 Anti-essentialist theory is understood here to be antithetical to effective political organizing. If this is right, those within the field of CRT may be working at cross purposes; perhaps CRT needs to reform itself and embrace what Professor Cho describes elsewhere as "essential politics." n78

This is a fundamental and powerful critique. It challenges the current conventional wisdom within CRT, in which anti-essentialism is the "dominant theory and culture within CRT." n79 We see this as challenging, or at least questioning, the theoretical and political commitments of some second-wave critical race scholars. Cho and Westley's article is a friendly, possibly controversial, critique by race crit insiders. Our hope is that the conversation started here can be conducted in a constructive manner, n80 in the same way that Cho and Westley offer their critique. Whether or not one agrees with their revised account of CRT, one should recognize the point they make about the importance of political organizing, that race theorizing and progressive lawyering are only part of the picture if one is to engage in an effective antistatist praxis.

#### An Invitation in Lieu of a Conclusion

These brief descriptions reveal the richness of the discourse taking place within CRT and LatCrit. We have tried to identify some important themes and preliminary impressions, but we leave to the readers the task of engaging fully with the authors.

#### FOOTNOTE-1:

n1 Eric K. Yamamoto, *Interracial Justice: Conflict & Reconciliation in Post-Civil Rights America* 10 (1999).

n2 This definition is consistent with what Professor Francisco Valdes, one of the chief architects of LatCrit, identifies as four functions of LatCrit theory: (1) the production of knowledge; (2) the advancement of transformation; (3) the expansion and connection of struggle(s), and; the cultivation of community and coalition. See Francisco Valdes, Foreword: Under Construction -- LatCrit Consciousness, Community, and Theory, [85 Cal. L. Rev. 1087, 1093-94 \(1997\)](#), [10 La Raza L.J. 1, 7-8 \(1998\)](#).

n3 See Pedro A. Malavet, *Literature and the Arts as Antistatist Praxis: LatCrit Theory and Cultural Production: The Confessions of an Accidental Crit*, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1293 \(2000\)](#).

n4 See Nicholas A. Gunia, *Half the Story Has Never Been Told: Popular Jamaican Music as Antistatist Praxis*, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1333 \(2000\)](#).

n5 See Alfredo Mirande Gonzalez, Alfredo's Jungle Cruise: Chronicles on Law, Lawyering, and Love, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1347 \(2000\)](#).

n6 See Sumi Cho & Robert Westley, Critical Race Coalitions: Key Movements that Performed the Theory, [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 1377 \(2000\)](#).

n7 Valdes, *supra* note 2, [85 Cal. L. Rev. at 1096](#), [10 La Raza L.J. at 10](#).

n8 This discussion does not necessarily track the order in which these articles appear.

n9 Malavet, *supra* note 3.

n10 In addition to attending a few of the earlier gatherings, he served as a member of the planning committee for LatCrit IV. This symposium can be understood as the documentary record of that conference.

n11 Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1296. Malavet qualifies this statement, saying that he does "not mean to imply that popular culture is always 'plain and simple' in language." *Id.* at 1295 n.11.

n12 Kevin Johnson provides a Faustian twist to Malavet's intellectual transformation, describing it as an "'accidental' descent into LatCrit theory." Kevin R. Johnson, Foreword -- Celebrating LatCrit Theory: What Do We Do When the Music Stops? [33 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 775 n.136 \(2000\)](#) (emphasis added). We reserve comment on where LatCrit is properly located in jurisprudential cosmology.

n13 See Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1298-1303 (responding to critiques by Tushnet, Posner, and Farber and Sherry).

n14 See Robert S. Chang, Toward an Asian American Legal Scholarship: Critical Race Theory, Post-Structuralism, and Narrative Space, [81 Cal. L. Rev. 1241, 1268-86 \(1993\)](#). Other persuasive accounts include Kathryn Abrams, Hearing the Call of Stories, [79 Cal. L. Rev. 971 \(1991\)](#), and Jane B. Baron, Resistance to Stories, [67 S. Cal. L. Rev. 255 \(1994\)](#).

n15 Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1302.

n16 See Richard Delgado, Rodrigo's Eleventh Chronicle: Empathy and False Empathy, [84 Cal. L. Rev. 61, 66-69 \(1996\)](#) (discussing cognitive and narrative theory barriers that prevent dominant groups from empathizing with outsider groups).

n17 Cheryl I. Harris, Whiteness as Property, [106 Harv. L. Rev. 1707, 1767 n.261 \(1993\)](#) (citing Andrew Hacker, Two Nations: Black and White, Separate, Hostile, Unequal 202 (1992)). Another example, although only partially successful, is the reverse discrimination story often told by Tom Wood, one of the named authors of California Proposition 209, which ended affirmative action in public education, government contracting, and public employment. When Dateline investigated his account, they found that of the five possible philosophy teaching jobs he might have applied for in the Bay Area, four of the jobs went to white men. The fifth went to a woman who was by all accounts better qualified than Wood, who in the first 15 years following his Ph.D. degree had published nothing and who in the 20 years after his degree had held only two one-year university positions. See Dateline NBC, (NBC television broadcast, Jan. 23, 1996) (transcript on file with author).

n18 See generally Angela P. Harris, Race and Essentialism in Feminist Legal Theory, [42 Stan. L. Rev. 581 \(1990\)](#).

n19 Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1303.

n20 This is not meant to downplay the importance of personal narrative. Placing an emphasis on the "ought" helps to strengthen the narrative's relevance and impact.

n21 See, e.g., Gilbert P. Carrasco, *Latinos in the United States: Invitation and Exile*, in *Immigrants Out! The New Nativism and the Anti-Immigrant Impulse in the United States* 190 (Juan F. Perea ed., 1997); Michael A. Olivas, *My Grandfather's Stories and Immigration Law: The Slave Traders' Chronical as Racial History*, 34 *St. Louis U. L.J.* 425 (1990).

n22 See Michael A. Olivas, *Unaccompanied Refugee Children: Detention, Due Process, and Disgrace*, 2 *Stan. L. & Pol'y Rev.* 159 (1990).

n23 See Kevin R. Johnson, *Racial Hierarchy, Asian Americans and Latinos as "Foreigners," and Social Change: Is Law the Way to Go?*, [76 Or. L. Rev. 347, 354 \(1997\)](#).

n24 Richard Delgado, *Storytelling for Oppositionists and Others: A Plea for Narrative*, [87 Mich. L. Rev. 2411, 2414 \(1989\)](#) ("Stories build consensus, a common culture of shared understandings, and deeper, more vital ethics. Counterstories, which challenge the received wisdom, do that as well.").

n25 See Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1325.

n26 *Id.* at 1327.

n27 See Lynne N. Henderson, *Legality and Empathy*, [85 Mich. L. Rev. 1574 \(1987\)](#).

n28 See Berta E. Hernandez-Truyol, *Building Bridges -- Latinas and Latinos at the Crossroads: Realities, Rhetoric and Replacement*, 25 *Colum. Hum. Rts. L. Rev.* 369 (1994).

n29 See James Weldon Johnson, *The Autobiography of an Ex-Coloured Man* 13-19 (1989).

n30 *Id.* at 16-17.

n31 Gunia, *supra* note 4, at 1334.

n32 See Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1298-1303.

n33 See Johnson, *supra* note 12, at 775-76.

n34 This is not to question the inclusion of Gunia's presentation at the conference or in this symposium. One of the great things about LatCrit has been its inclusiveness and its willingness to explore uncharted territory such as the possible connections between Filipinas/os and Latinas/os. This is indeed the way Pedro Malavet approaches Gunia's presentation. See Malavet, *supra* note 3, at 1308-10.

n35 Gunia, *supra* note 4, at 1334.

n36 *Id.* Perhaps they undergo the same kind of racial dislocation described above. See *supra* notes 25-30 and accompanying text.

n37 Cf. Tanya K. Hernandez, *The Construction of Race and Class Buffers in the Structure of Immigration Controls and Laws*, [76 Or. L. Rev. 731, 764 n.93 \(1997\)](#) (noting "the occasional middle-tier treatment of West Indian Blacks in the African American community"). What of Jamaicans (of any hue) whose intergenerational emigration pathway to the United States might have included extended stays in Caribbean countries or Central America?

n38 See Dennis Conway, *Are There New Complexities in Global Migration Systems of Consequence for the United States "NationState"?*, 2 *Ind. J. Global Legal Stud.* 31, 33 (1994).

n39 Lessons may be learned from the examination of white minstrelsy in the construction of white identities. See generally Eric Lott, *Love & Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class* (1995).

n40 Mirande, *supra* note 5, at 1348.

n41 See *id.* at 1352.

n42 The students received field placements in four groups, "the homeless, day laborers, at-risk youth of color, and an after school tutoring program for low income, mostly Latina/o children at the Centro de Aztlan." *Id.* at 1352.

n43 See *id.* at 1351.

n44 Apparently, the impetus to write his own field reports grew out of his frustration over not having "an outlet for venting or expressing his response to issues that were emerging in the class." *Id.* at 1348.

n45 *Id.* at 1354.

n46 See *supra* note 20 and accompanying text.

n47 Rosaldo began his book with the following account of Ilongot headhunting:

If you ask an older Ilongot man of northern Luzon, Philippines, why he cuts off human heads, his answer is brief, and one on which no anthropologist can readily elaborate: He says that rage, born of grief, impels him to kill his fellow human beings. He claims that he needs a place "to carry his anger." The act of severing and tossing away the victim's head enables him, he says, to vent and, he hopes, throw away the anger of his bereavement.

Renato Rosaldo, *Culture & Truth: The Remaking of Social Analysis* 1 (1993).

n48 Rosaldo was making an important point about anthropological method through the "use of personal experience serves as a vehicle for making the quality and intensity of the rage in Ilongot grief more readily accessible to readers than certain more detached modes of composition." *Id.* at 11.

n49 Mirande, *supra* note 5, at 1358.

n50 Mirande did not report whether students engaged with his field reports in this way.

n51 Rosaldo himself cautions, "If classic ethnography's vice was the slippage from the ideal of detachment to actual indifference, that of present-day reflexivity is the tendency for the self-absorbed Self to lose sight altogether of the culturally different Other." Rosaldo, *supra* note 47, at 7.

n52 As for theme (3), Mirande says that "my conceptions of equality, subordination, and social justice were shaped at an early age." Mirande, *supra* note 5, at 1370. We were not sure what lessons teachers or students could draw from his many family narratives.

n53 Johnson, *supra* note 12, at 776 (citation omitted).

n54 Mirande, *supra* note 5, at 1355 n.10.

n55 See *id.*

n56 *Id.* at 1350.

n57 *Id.* at 1350 n.5.

n58 Bernice Zamora, Notes from a Chicana "Coed," in *Making Face, Making Soul (Haciendo Caras): Creative and Critical Perspectives by Feminists of Color* 131-32 (Gloria Anzaldua ed., 1990). Gabacho is also used sometimes in a derogatory manner to refer to assimilated Mexican Americans.

n59 For excellent, critical examinations of this situation, see *This Bridge Called My Back: Writings by Radical Women of Color* (Cherrie Moraga & Gloria Anzaldua eds., 1981).

n60 The text that we criticize plays only a minor role in Mirande's overall thesis. In this sense, it is gratuitous, which is perhaps why we find its presence so troubling. It is the narrative responsibility of a LatCrit storyteller to choose carefully the stories one tells, especially if they are going to be used as teaching materials. Uncritical, regressive notions of Chicano masculinity and Chicana femininity have little place in LatCrit.

n61 At the outset, we should reveal that we are among those who believe in the anti-essentialist theory that Professors Cho and Westley criticize. Although we are not the direct or named objects of the critique, the reader may want to consider our position in reading this section.

n62 Cho & Westley, *supra* note 6, at 1377.

n63 *Id.* at 1379-80.

n64 According to one originary myth, critical race theory, although it had historical antecedents, began in the late 1980s as a racial intervention in critical legal studies and as a leftist intervention in liberal race discourse. See Kimberle Crenshaw, *Remarks at Opening Plenary, Conference on Critical Race Theory, Yale Law School* (Nov. 14, 1997) (transcript on file with author); see also *Introduction to Critical Race Theory: The Key Writings that Formed the Movement* xiii (Kimberle Crenshaw et al. eds., 1995). By describing it as an originary myth, we are not disputing the veracity of the account; instead, we do so to acknowledge the mythic quality that stories of origin have, remembering that the original Greek mythos meant a true story.

n65 Cho and Westley were active participants and leaders of BCDF in the late 1980s and early 1990s. Throughout their narrative, they adopt the objective voice. Their refusal to interject themselves in the text can be read as being consistent with their rejection of individual agency stories and their conception of BCDF as a collective. We wonder, though, what is lost and gained by assuming the objective voice in recounting a movement in which the authors actively participated. A more personally situated account might have shed more light on how to do the tough political work of organizing across and between groups. Also, we could learn more directly about how their experiences affected and informed their teaching, scholarship, and activism.

n66 Cho & Westley, *supra* note 6, at 1378.

n67 *Id.* at 1380.

n68 *Id.* at 1378.

n69 *Id.* at 1410.

n70 See *id.* at 1412. ("Many CRT founders wrote about movements or with movements in mind, attempting to intervene through their writings to produce new understandings of old problems in order to generate better theory.").

n71 See *id.* at 1423 ("Second wave race crits benefited from the elevated status and newfound theoretical ascendancy of CRT. Accordingly, they faced pressures and rewards when entering

the 'race for theory,' not necessarily a race that is conducive to the synergistic ethos we described above.").

n72 Id. at 1414.

n73 Id. at 1413-14.

n74 Id. at 1414.

n75 Id. at 1417-19.

n76 Id. at 1416.

n77 Id. at 1410.

n78 Sumi K. Cho, Essential Politics, [2 Harv. Latino L. Rev. 433 \(1997\)](#).

n79 Cho & Westley, supra note 6, at 1414.

n80 For two particularly thoughtful engagements with essentialism/anti-essentialism and its implications for personal identity and political work, see john a. powell, The Multiple Self: Exploring Between and Beyond Modernity and Postmodernity, [81 Minn. L. Rev. 1481 \(1997\)](#) and Angela P. Harris, Foreword: The Jurisprudence of Reconstruction, [82 Cal. L. Rev. 741 \(1994\)](#).