What Is an Ethic of Teaching?

859 CARING AND RELATIONSHIPS: DEVELOPING A PEDAGOGY OF CARING

Nelson E. Soto [FNa1]

I.   Introduction

TACITLY, many educators neglect the social foundations of newcomer students within the confines of the school community. [FN1] There is a plausible assumption among educators that newcomer students have cultural values and foundations that are inadaptable in the classroom. Willingness to adapt pedagogy to students' cultural background is the premise of "funds of knowledge," which "refers to those historically developed and accumulated strategies . . . or bodies of knowledge that are essential to a household's functioning and well being." [FN2] Commentators further conclude that teachers can implement teaching practices that are developed from the households of their students to transmit new knowledge to (im)migrant students. [FN3] Invoking funds of knowledge within the curriculum and overall teaching practices can establish a "caring" community. As students perceive the school community as a caring institution-- through the invoking of their (newcomer) home culture values--the plausible outcomes are higher levels of student engagement and academic success, which lead to student persistence.

Formal education has historically obstructed and continues to obstruct language and ethnic minority students from academic success and/or engagement within the school community. [FN4] In Gibson's ethnography *860* of Punjabi Indians' school experiences in the United States, she concluded that although Punjabi Indian boys fare well academically, they (both Punjabi boys and girls) were subjected to a hostile environment in schools. [FN5] For example, Punjabi students were ridiculed and physically abused for their dietary habits and speaking a different language. [FN6] The hostile environment demoted Punjabi students to positions of inferiority. Gibson concluded that "in one way or another Punjabi students are told that India and Indian culture are inferior to Western and American ways." [FN7]

Other contemporary scholarly works highlight the struggles and negotiations that occur for (im)migrant students. [FN8] Failing to recognize and understand the emotional impact of (im)migrating from a foreign country to the Unites States has a ripple effect on the educational adjustments of (im)migrant students. Gonzalez-Ramos and Sanchez-Nester posit that the schools' failure to comprehend the emotional experience associated with (im)migration and to assist (im)migrant students in negotiating the terrain of a U.S.-based educational system serves as a catalyst for the dismissal of (im)migrant educational performance. "[I]f schools failed to address immigrant children's traumas and emotional needs, they were contributing in some ways to the children's learning problem." [FN9]

As immigration peaks to higher records, [FN10] educational institutions must react to demographic shifts and respond appropriately to the newcomer population. These changes require educators to adopt new strategies *861* and styles to handle a more diverse student body. Demographic shifts among the U.S. population serve as a catalyst

for educators to develop teaching pedagogies and practices for this newcomer population.

The focus of this essay is to synthesize the caring literature across various philosophical and social sciences, including, but not limited to, social/cognitive psychology, educational anthropology, culture responsive pedagogy and feminist epistemology. The end goal of this piece is to advocate for the need to invoke caring strategies, which may liberate students, especially (im)migrant students, from school-wide policies and teaching practices that maintain a cycle of educational poverty.

II. Definition of Caring

The discourse on caring is multifaceted, which leads to a variety of interpretations and beliefs. A universal definition of caring will not be purported in this essay because of the inability to accurately represent the voices of all groups of people. Thompson warns that "if theories of care are not to be essentialist, they cannot be modeled on one social group and then applied to (or modified for) others." [FN11]

Caring theory is primarily constructed within feminist epistemology, which tacitly places this theoretical framework outside of perceived "mainstream" research. [FN12] Carol Gilligan, a pioneer of caring, critiqued Kohlberg's theory of moral development for failing to promote both males' views of individual rights and rules and women's views of caring and relationships on equal levels. [FN13] Gilligan purports that:

> Some people base ethical decisions on principles of justice, equality, impartiality, and rights. This is the justice perspective. But others base their decisions on a care perspective, which the need to preserve relationships and minimize hurt takes precedence over considerations of justice and rights. The care perspective *862 places special significance on attachment and compassion . . . . [FN14]

The care theory recognizes the relationship between the care giver and receiver, by which Noddings concludes that the caregiver and receiver enter into a mutually satisfying relationship. [FN15] Embedded in the care theory is an inherent need to do what is "right" for the individual by using an ethic of care that "employ[s] reasoning to decide what to do and how best to do it." [FN16] The goal is to "strive for competence because we want to do our best for those we care for." [FN17] Implementing caring practices within institutions, such as schools, will promote student engagement. [FN18] According to Gay, students who are engaged in school develop an affinity to learning, maintain emotional stability and succeed in their academic work. [FN19]

The care theory, in its purest form, assumes that the actors are willing to develop relationships with each other and that care will emerge from those relationships. Care may fail to emerge, however, as Noddings summarizes:

> A relation may fail to be one of caring because the carer fails to be attentive or, having attended, rejects the "I must" and refuses to respond. Or, it may fail because the cared-for is unable or unwilling to respond; he or she does not receive the efforts of the carer, and therefore caring is not completed. Or finally, both carer and cared-for may try to respond appropriately, but some condition prevents completion; perhaps there has been too little time for an adequate relation to develop and the carer aims rather wildly at what he or she thinks the cared-for needs. A relational interpretation of caring pushes us to look not only at *863 moral agents but also at the recipients of their acts and the conditions under which the parties interact. [FN20]

The literature on caring portrays unification among teachers and students, where teachers support and accept students as viable members of the classroom community. Hult's perspective of caring involves teachers recognizing their students as members of the human race, individuals and role-occupants. [FN21] To develop an understanding of student-teacher relationships requires a theoretical framework that upholds the implicit value of unity among educators and students. Caring is a deliberate and action-oriented event that occurs between actors who willingly promote and develop this phenomenon. [FN22]

Scholarship in feminist caring reveals an incorporation of intentional acting toward one another. As Noddings states, "[c]are ethicists depend more heavily on establishing the conditions and relations that support moral ways of life than on the inculcation of virtues in individuals." [FN23] Korth also posits that caring is an action-based phenomenon, requiring critical awareness and understanding. [FN24] Under that theory, "[i]nequalities became visible through analyses of care-in-action because inequalities and distortions disrupted the possibility of keeping dignity, authenticity, connection, and collectivity in tact." [FN25] Because immigrant students can experience emotional trauma when they first immigrate to the United States, teachers can lessen the impact of the psychological stress associated with relocation by developing caring relationships with students, rather than just being information-providers in the classroom. [FN26]

*864 In Subtractive Schooling: U.S.-Mexican Youth and the Politics of Caring, Valenzuela contrasts caring with school climates and historical practices. [FN27] In Valenzuela's ethnography with Latina/o students, she defines two forms of caring: aesthetic and authentic. Aesthetic caring solely focuses on the instructional relationship between the teacher and students. Drawing upon the work of Fine, Valenzuela concludes that "teachers are committed to an institutional 'fetish' that views academics as the exclusive domain of the school." [FN28]

On the contrary, authentic caring fosters reciprocal relationships among teachers and students. [FN29] The domain of this caring is above the formal role of education but includes an acceptance of the students' cultural background and values encompassed in the relationship. [FN30] Valenzuela infers that "[r]elations with school personnel, especially with teachers, play a decisive role in determining the extent to which youth find the school to be a welcoming or an alienating place." [FN31] Valenzuela further posits that this form of caring promotes and validates students' cultural values and beliefs. [FN32] This is especially important for language and ethnic minority students, such as (im)migrant children. [FN33]

III. Culturally Responsive Pedagogy

The feminist development of caring is at times criticized for failing to recognize and incorporate people of color in its ideology. Thompson asserts that caring is a framework developed through a colorblind position, which upholds racist sentiments: "Politely pretending not to notice students' color makes no sense unless being of different colors is somehow shameful. Colorblindness, in other words, is parasitic upon racism: it is *865 only in a racist society that pretending not to notice color could be construed as a particularly virtuous act." [FN34]

Research supports that as newcomer (im)migrants continue to enroll in United States schools, educators must draw upon multidimensional teaching pedagogies to embrace this growing population. [FN35] Acknowledging the limitations to caring from the feminist perspective, cultural responsive pedagogy accentuates that the pillars of caring encompass four major tenets: caring is concern for person and performance; caring is action-provoking; caring prompts effort and achievement; and caring includes

multidimensional responsiveness. [FN36] Gay promotes a caring ideology that includes the lived realities and experiences of students of color. [FN37] She states that caring is an act that "binds individuals to their society, to their communities, and to each other." [FN38] Within this context, Gay identifies "the 'community' [as] underachieving students of color and their teachers." [FN39]

The concept of caring is further elaborated as action-based, where "caring is concern for person and performance." [FN40] Ladson-Billings' work with successful African American teachers demonstrates that the teachers were concerned with both the academic growth and the social and emotional development of their students. [FN41] The research of Jones, Siddle Walker and Sowell revealed that ethnic minority students conceive that caring occurs when teachers and the school environment are identified as safe and where the students feel that the school is a home away from home. [FN42] While at the school, the students were nourished intellectually *866 and emotionally, the teachers encouraged the students to perform to the best of their ability and the educators facilitated a setting of academic and emotional growth. In developing a caring environment, students were shown to be engaged with their teachers, highly participatory in their education and demonstrated high levels of academic scholarship and engagement.

Newcomer (im)migrant students require a teaching faculty that supports and acknowledges their potential abilities to achieve in society. Mercado's work reveals that teachers' opinions of students are reflected in their teaching practices. [FN43] Developing a culture of caring within the classroom and in the temperament of the teachers requires personal and institutional evaluations of current caring practices. [FN44] "Before a genuine ethos of caring can be developed and implemented on a large scale, educators must identify and understand current non-caring attitudes and behaviors, and how they can obstruct student achievement." [FN45] This inventory is especially vital to (im)migrant students because they are susceptible to many destructive forces such as emotional instability, yearning for family, language disconnection and discrimination.

IV. Caring and Teachers' Biographies

Academic literature posits that one in every five children enrolled in school is an (im)migrant. [FN46] The teaching workforce is comprised of primarily white, female, middle class, monolingual women. [FN47] Further, teachers prefer to educate students who represent their familiar cultural upbringing. [FN48] The question becomes to what extent is caring rooted in teachers' biographies and temperaments?

*867 Teachers' biographies and broader cultural ideologies can foster a disconnect with newcomer (im)migrant students. Nathenson-Mejia and Escamilla estimate that ninety percent of the teaching workforce is comprised of white, middle class women. [FN49] "Teachers who are born in the United States and grow up in some strata of the middle class may have little in common with students of the same ethnicity who are immigrants or who grow up in lower socioeconomic status situations . . . ." [FN50] Taylor and Nieto conclude that only ten percent of teachers have the ability or inherited background knowledge to understand constraints and barriers facing newcomer (im)migrant students and families. [FN51] This problem underscores the need to educate teachers on both (im)migrant and multicultural issues.

Changing demographics place the onus of educating the forty percent language minority population upon teachers who share different backgrounds, cultural values or social classes. The mismatch implicitly demonstrates that, regardless of the teacher's preference to teach monolingual English speaking students, teachers are charged with

educating students who are different from their personal backgrounds. Further, one author argues that educators lack the awareness and understanding of the educational experiences and previous learning systems of newly arrived (im)migrant students. [FN52]

Researchers have found that a non-diverse teacher population has led to detrimental consequences in the education of immigrant students. [FN53] Because most teachers are white, middle class women, their internalized *868 cultural values and norms may hinder the acceptance of the newcomer's norms and values. Implicitly, the disconnect of respecting and appreciating the norms and values of a newcomer (im)migrant student can result in a lack of caring by the teacher within the learning environment. Another author concludes that teachers and school counselors are likely to treat students differently based on their perceptions of the students' academic abilities and school engagement. [FN54]

Trueba and Bartalome's work further describes how teachers' ideologies, beliefs and values are not divorced from their classroom teaching practices. [FN55] Hence, teachers' perceptions of newcomer students may affect the integration of students into the educational environment. For example:

> [The] restrictive views by which some teachers view their students are usually a product of their own personal theories, internalized beliefs, and values that reflect their own formative and restricted life experiences and influences. However they do not recognize beliefs and attitudes as reflecting the dominant ideology but instead view them as "natural," "objective," and "common sensical"--in other words, the "norm" . [FN56]

Failing to recognize and understand the emotional impact of migrating from a foreign country to the United States has a ripple effect on educational adjustments of (im)migrant students. By embracing students within the pedagogical focus of the classroom rather than relegating English language learners to a subordinate place in the teacher's concerns, the student will feel more included in the school. Unless students know that schools seek to include them in their educational missions, students often feel displaced. Schools that have been successful in creating welcoming climates for (im)migrants make a conscious effort to do so. Educators need to recognize the emotional needs of (im)migrant children. Doing so requires familiarity with each child's unique situation, especially because there is a great deal of diversity within the language minority communities.

Being informed of the historical, political and economic aspects of each student's country is important, as is acknowledging that family situations may vary considerably. Teachers bring into practice their own assumptions, *869 ideologies and expectations of what are perceived as normal "best practices" to educate all children. Developing teaching practices for newcomers requires teachers to adapt to new pedagogies that can better influence the future success of ethnic and language minority students. By invoking strategies of caring and acceptance, "teachers hold the key to making the learning of young Mexican immigrant children a success." [FN57]

The changing demographics of the student population are disproportionate to those within the teaching community. Villegas warns that, as the student population continues to become heterogeneous, the teaching faculty is becoming more homogenous. [FN58] Zimpher and Ashburn suggest that having diversity among teachers is essential to students of color and newcomer (im)migrants. [FN59]

Schools have not traditionally done a good job of educating students of color. This pattern must be reversed. It is a moral issue, but beyond that, it is also an issue of economic survival. Our society cannot afford to lose the many resources we are losing by not bringing in individuals of color. [FN60]

Teacher preparation programs are ineffective in preparing pre-service teachers for the diversity of the classroom and working with parents. Glazier states that "past experiences in preparing teachers to address the needs of the diverse population they teach have proven to be less than effective in either changing individuals' perspectives towards diversity and/or multicultural education or their stances towards how to teach." [FN61] Educators often overlook the unique needs of their (im)migrant students and families. Teacher preparation programs have a vital role in remedying this situation.

V. Caring Is Critical to Newcomers

Using the Theory of Assisted Performance, Tharp and Gallimore, with the help of Vygotsky, argue that one role of teachers is to help students *870 solve problems that could not be solved on their own. [FN62] Drawing upon the work of cognitive psychologists such as Vygotsky and Cole, [FN63] practical conditions can be established in an educational climate to support (im)migrant students and other oppressed populations in further developing their educational growth without negating their cultural norms and values. Because social relationships between teachers and their students are essential for learning to occur, teachers have an obligation to increase their sociocultural consciousness, which will enable teachers to understand their students. [FN64] This foundation establishes an effective instructional pedagogy that acknowledges the learner's ability to function autonomously without assistance and incorporate new knowledge through teaching practices.

In connecting theory to practice, practitioners can establish conditions within the schools that are critically important to newcomer (im)migrant students. MacGillivray and Rueda assert that five strategies may be utilized by educators to promote learning and further maintain culture sensitivity in developing curriculum. [FN65] Their five recommended strategies are based on empirical research conducted with teachers of poor second language learners:

> 1) Be responsible for knowing about your students' lives;
>
> 2) Expect the most; avoid deficit models;
>
> 3) Recognizing knowledge of both language and culture;
>
> 4) Beware of default curriculum: content and structure;
>
> 5) Implement curriculum that is meaningful to the children. [FN66]

Although these guidelines suggest that teachers serve as brokers in facilitating learning, the entire responsibility for successful (im)migrant *871 education should not fall completely on the shoulders of classroom teachers. A potential long-term solution for lessening the academic deficiencies among the (im)migrant community is to foster a union between families and teachers. Parent involvement studies conclude that an alliance among parents and teachers leads to successful educational opportunities for minority children. [FN67] Christenson and Conoley recommend collaboration among schools and families to promote learning, which has been shown to increase student achievement. [FN68]

VI. Social Capital

Newcomer (im)migrant students continue to enroll in American schools. Does their minority status impact the quality of support and educational nourishment they will receive by teachers? This marginalized community must be supported in environments that are academically engaging, emotionally nourishing and culturally accepting.

Derived from the work of Putnam, social capital refers to "connections among individuals--social networks and the norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness that arise from them." [FN69] This framework allows for the examination of structural access to institutional privileges and resources, and also for the consideration of the role of individual/cultural *872 agency. [FN70] Institutional agents can include teachers and counselors, other school personnel, social service workers and school peers. Increasing the social capital of newcomers is an example of caring. Valenzuela's ethnographic investigation supports the idea that "relations with school personnel, especially with teachers, play a decisive role in determining the extent to which youth find the school to be a welcoming or an alienating place." [FN71]

The relationships between parents and teachers can work to develop social ties for (im)migrant children. Institutional agents serve as important liaisons in the social development, school success and status attainment of (im)migrant students. Their institutional support, which refers to key forms of social support that function to help students become effective participants within the school system, influences the socialization process of (im)migrant students. [FN72] "[S]upportive ties with institutional agents represent a necessary condition for engagement and advancement in the educational system and, ultimately, for success in the occupational structure." [FN73]

VII. Conclusion

The objective of this essay was to draw attention to the importance of establishing caring relationships among all students, but especially among newcomer (im)migrants. Although some scholars claim that the caring theory fails to recognize its own inherent racism, [FN74] it provides a theoretical foundation to critically engage newcomer students within learning institutions. This piece is intended to act as an advocate for caring strategies. [FN75] *873 These caring strategies may liberate students from school-wide policies and teaching practices that are designed to maintain a cycle of educational poverty.

Because of the challenges in maintaining Latina/o (im)migrants within the K-12 educational system, a call for action to lessen the academic achievement gap is vital to the future success of the Latina/o community. A potential long-term solution for lessening the academic deficiencies among the (im)migrant community is to foster relationships among students and teachers. One way to accomplish this is to move towards authentic caring relationships in which students and teachers are in a reciprocal and nurturing environment. [FN76] Noddings advocates that teachers who develop an understanding of the inter-subjective realm of their students should promote authentic caring relationships with their students. [FN77] Nieto accentuates how teachers perceive that students' abilities, skills, language and culture have the potential to affect the academic success of language minority students. [FN78]

In my future work, I wish to further develop the caring literature to include Latina/o high school experiences with teachers in a Midwestern community. A study of that nature aims to highlight understandings and manifestations of how teacher-Latina/o (im)migrant student relationships may influence school engagement in communities that have a great deal of immigrant impact. It challenges traditional configurations of educating

(im)migrants, while also broadening our understanding of how strategies and teacher practices influence the relationships among teacher and (im)migrant students.

Footnotes:

[FNa1]. Doctoral Candidate, Indiana University School of Education and Lecturer at Indiana University, Purdue University School Indianapolis, School of Education. I would like to acknowledge Dr. Gerardo Lopez (Indiana University), Dr. Barbara Korth (Indiana University) and Ana Elisa Baratta (Doctoral Candidate at Indiana University School of Education) for their guidance and encouragement with this scholarship.

[FN1]. See Sara Exposito & Alejandra Favela, Reflective Voices: Valuing Immigrant Students and Teaching with Ideological Clarity, 35-1 Urb. Rev. 73, 73-75 (2003) (arguing that schools and educators judge student and parent behavior based on their own middle-class values).

[FN2]. See Norma Gonzalez et al., Teacher Research on Funds of Knowledge: Learning from Households 4 (1993), available at http:// www.ncela.gwu.edu/pubs/ncrcdsll/epr6.htm. Funds of knowledge can include information about trade or business, community norms or standards and any other skill or understanding.

[FN3]. See Center for Applied Linguistics, Funds of Knowledge: Learning from Language Minority Households 1 (CAL Digest ed., No. EDO-FL-94-08, 1994) (summarizing research model showing how teaching can be positively enhanced by drawing upon funds of knowledge of minority students).

[FN4]. See Margaret Gibson, The School Performance of Immigrant Minorities: A Comparative View, in Minority Education: Anthropological Perspectives 123 (E. Jacob & C. Jordan eds., 1993) (finding that when younger students arrived in America, and how long students had been resident in America, correlated strongly with higher academic achievement).

[FN5]. See id. at 120 (finding that portion of white students would verbally and physically abuse minority Punjabi students). While the majority of students would not participate in the open harassment, they would either condone the behavior or do nothing to stop it. See id.

[FN6]. See id. (observing students were spit on, had food thrown at them, "and worse").

[FN7]. Id.

[FN8]. See, e.g., Christina Igoa, The Inner World of the Immigrant Child (Naomi Silverman ed., 1995) (sharing experiences of teacher educating immigrant students and how she developed her teaching methodology based on her teaching philosophy and experiences); Laurie Olsen, Made in America: Immigrant Students in Our Public Schools (1998) (examining assimilation of immigrant students, Olsen spent two and one half years in California high school examining issues immigrant students face); Margaret A. Gibson, Complicating the Immigrant/Involuntary Typology, 28 Anthropology & Educ. Q. 431 (1997) (examining research on immigrant and involuntary minority youth and finding that "minority students do better in school when they feel strongly anchored in the identities of their families," whereas those who face greatest risk of failure are not connected to their culture and experience racial conflict).

[FN9]. See G. Gonzalez-Ramos & M. Sanchez-Nester, Responding to Immigrant Children's

Mental Health Needs in the Schools: Project Mi Tierra/My Country, 23 Child. & Sch. 49, 51 (2001).

[FN10]. See U.S. Census Bureau, Profile of the Foreign-Born Population in the United States: 2000, P23-206, 8 (Dec. 2001) (stating that currently 10.4 percent of U.S. population is foreign born, which is highest percentage in seventy years).

[FN11]. See Audrey Thompson, Not the Color Purple: Black Feminist Lessons for Educational Caring, 68 Harv. Educ. Rev. 522, 526 (1998).

[FN12]. See Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development (1993) (showing that women and men have different modes of thinking about relationships, which create disparity between women's experience and common representation of human development); Nel Noddings, Educating Moral People: A Caring Alternative to Character Education, (2002) (offering alternative to character education care ethics); Barbara Korth, Care in the Heart and Mind of Critique: A Strikingly Feminist Critique of Critical Practices 1-7 (unpublished manuscript, on file with author).

[FN13]. See Gilligan, supra note 12, at 18 (noting paradox in Kohlberg's theories; traits that are traditionally associated with virtuousness of women are same traits that make them inferior in moral development); Thompson, supra note 11, at 526 (discussing Gilligan's work and stating that "[f]rom the perspective of Black feminist ethics… neither care nor justice has the character claimed for it in mainstream theories").

[FN14]. Claire Andre & Manuel Velasquez, Men & Women; Justice & Compassion (Winter 1990), at http://www.scu.edu/ethics/publications/iie/v3n1/men.html.

[FN15]. See Noddings, supra note 12, at 14 (indicating that caring relationships require both carer and cared-for to be satisfied and relationships may fail if carer is inattentive or cared-for does not respond to caring); see also id. at 28 ("For a relationship--even a very brief encounter--to be caring, the caring must be received.").

[FN16]. Id. at 14 (noting that caring uses logic and reasoning to determine desired goals and how to achieve them).

[FN17]. Id.

[FN18]. See id. at 2 (observing that student, as cared-for, may make significant contributions to relationship with teacher, as carer); see also id. at 1 ("Indeed, we believe that children who are properly cared for by people who genuinely model social and ethical virtues are likely to develop those virtues themselves.").

[FN19]. See Geneva Gay, Culturally Responsive Teaching: Theory, Research, & Practice 55, 168 (James A. Banks ed., 2000) (discussing that class participation and other forms of classroom involvement help students learn, achieve in their academic studies and develop emotionally).

[FN20]. Noddings, supra note 12, at 14.

[FN21]. See Richard E. Hult, Jr., On Pedagogical Caring, 29 Educ. Theory 237, 242 (1979) ("[T]he teacher recognizes and understands the student as a unique individual self. As I have indicated, this presumes that the teacher understands the unique talents, idiosyncrasies, and perhaps the personal history of the student."); see also Karen Osterman & Stephanie Freese, Nurturing the Mind to Improve Learning: Teaching Caring and Student Engagement, in The Academic Achievement of Minority Students: Perspective, Practices, and Prescriptions 287, 293 (S.T. Gregory ed., 2000) (explaining

that caring has many definitions in classrooms, but that all approaches to caring involve teachers supporting students and providing them with sense of being cared for).

[FN22]. See Robert J. Chaskin & Diana Mendley Rauner, Toward a Field of Caring: An Epilogue, 76 Phi Delta Kappan 718, 718-19 (1995) (implying that caring is voluntary action by emphasizing that we must develop and encourage caring behavior in individuals).

[FN23]. Noddings, supra note 12, at xiii.

[FN24]. See Korth, supra note 12, at 6 ("This research also proposes that a study of caring is tightly conjoined to the critical awareness embodied in actors' understanding of their own interactions and situations.").

[FN25]. Id. at 5-6.

[FN26]. See Julia Reguero de Atiles & Martha Allexsaht-Snider, Effective Approaches to Teaching Young Mexican Immigrant Children: ERIC Clearinghouse on Rural Education and Small Schools (Dec. 2002), at http:// ericadr.piccard.csc.com/extra/ericdigests/ed471491.html (noting that "[e]ntering a new class can be intimidating for an immigrant child who may be faced with social isolation and linguistic constraints"); see also Jack Frymier & Bruce Gansneder, The Phi Delta Kappa Study of Students at Risk, 71 Phi Delta Kappan, 142, 145-46 (1989) (criticizing schools' responses to at-risk students, particularly regarding teachers who know nothing about, and are not involved in, at-risk students' personal lives).

[FN27]. See Angela Valenzuela, Subtractive Schooling: U.S.-Mexican Youth and the Politics of Caring 63-66 (Christine E. Sleeter ed., 1999) (indicating that relationships between students and teachers are based on social and cultural factors in these relationships, and on schools' cultures and whether they promote caring and differences between students and teachers with regard to cultural background and language).

[FN28]. Id. at 73.

[FN29]. See id. at 61 (stating reciprocal relationships between teachers and students is part of authentic caring and serves as basis for all learning).

[FN30]. See id. at 110 (stating authentic caring dictates "a complete apprehension of the 'other' [such] that the material, physical, psychological, and spiritual needs of youth will guide the educational process").

[FN31]. Id. at 7.

[FN32]. See id. at 63 (discussing teacher embodying authentic caring by apprehending students' cultural world and structural position).

[FN33]. See id. at 61 (stating immigrant children are committed to authentic caring).

[FN34]. See Thompson, supra note 11, at 524.

[FN35]. See, e.g., Ana Maria Villegas, School Failure and Cultural Mismatch: Another View, 20 Urb. Rev. 253, 261 (1988) (discussing multicultural education fostering appreciation for cultural diversity and encouragement of teachers to use diversity in classroom).

[FN36]. See Gay, supra note 19, at 47-53 (describing four tenets of caring).

[FN37]. See id. at 52 (describing caring as multidimensional responsiveness that understands cultural influences on students).

[FN38]. See id. at 45 (quoting J. Webb et al., Understanding Caring in Context: Negotiating Borders and Barriers, 25 Urb. Rev. 25, 33-34 (1993)).

[FN39]. Id.

[FN40]. Id. at 47.

[FN41]. See Gloria Ladson-Billings, The Dreamkeepers: Successful Teachers of African American Children 61-77 (1994) (discussing stories of teachers that demonstrate concern for academic learning, while also incorporating emotional and social growth).

[FN42]. See Faustine Childress Jones, A Traditional Model of Excellence 2 (1981) (stating successful Dunbar High School as home away from home where students were nurtured and supported); Emilie V. Siddle Walker, Interpersonal Caring in the "Good" Segregated Schooling of African-American Children: Evidence from the Case of Caswell County Training School, 25 Urb. Rev. 63, 64 (1993) (stating caring is associated with creating "homelike environment" in segregated schools). See generally Thomas Sowell, Patterns of Black Excellence, 43 Pub. Int., 26-58 (1976) (describing study of specific black high schools and elementary schools, analyzing what makes each individual school successful).

[FN43]. See Carmen I. Mercado, Caring as Empowerment: School Collaboration and Community Agency, 25 Urb. Rev. 79, 85 (1993) (discussing teachers being engrossed in students' needs, which allows teachers to be responsive to students in classroom).

[FN44]. See Gay, supra note 19, at 53 (stating that teachers must understand noncaring attitudes to develop genuine caring in classroom). See generally J.S. Kleinfeld, Effects of Nonverbally Communicated Personal Warmth on the Intelligence Test Performance of Indian and Eskimo Adolescents, 91 J. Soc. Psychol. 149, 149-50 (1973) (describing study of positive effect of nonverbally communicated personal warmth on Indian and Eskimo students).

[FN45]. Gay, supra note 19, at 53 (noting importance of teachers acknowledging and correcting noncaring behavior).

[FN46]. See Dilys Schoorman, Addressing the Academic Needs of Immigrant Students: Issues and Trends in Immigrant Education, in Multicultural Education in the 21st Century 85, 85 (Carlos F. Diaz ed., 2001) (presenting statistic relating to proportion of immigrant students enrolled in schools).

[FN47]. See A. Lin Goodwin, Teacher Preparation and the Education of Immigrant Children, Educ. & Urb. Soc'y, Feb. 2002, at 156, 158 (noting that teaching population is still very homogenous in face of changing student population because teachers of color only constitute ten percent of all teachers).

[FN48]. See Nancy L. Zimpher & Elizabeth A. Ashburn, Countering Parochialism in Teacher Candidates, in Diversity in Teacher Education: New Expectations 40, 40-44 (Mary E. Dilworth ed., 2002) (presenting idea that teachers prefer to work with children who are most like them because they relate better to children with similar backgrounds).

[FN49]. See Sally Nathenson-Mejia & Kathy Escamilla, Connecting With Latino Children: Bridging Cultural Gaps With Children's Literature, Bilingual Res. J., Spring 2003, at 101,

102 (presenting statistics relating to teachers' race); see also Schoorman, supra note 46, at 98 (noting widening cultural gap between increasingly immigrant student population and increasingly "Euro-American" teacher population).

[FN50]. Nathenson-Mejia & Escamilla, supra note 49, at 102 (discussing how teachers and students of similar cultural backgrounds face differences based on socioeconomic status).

[FN51]. See Sheryl V. Taylor, Multicultural Is Who We Are: Literature as a Reflection of Ourselves, Teaching Exceptional Child., Jan.-Feb. 2000, at 24, 25 (concluding that because only ten percent of teachers come from ethnic minorities, there is strong probability of immigrant students being taught by teachers with dissimilar backgrounds); see also Sonia Nieto, Affirming Diversity: The Sociopolitical Context of Multicultural Education 98 (3d ed., 2000) (finding that Eurocentric educational framework does not aid immigrant students who do not understand Eurocentric culture).

[FN52]. See James A. McLaughlin et al., LEARN: A Community Study About Latino Immigrants and Education, Educ. & Urb. Soc'y, Feb. 2002, at 212, 223-25 (presenting examples of problems that immigrant students face upon arrival in American schools, most notably different academic experiences from their home countries).

[FN53]. See Lilia I. Bartolome & Enrique (Henry) T. Trueba, Beyond the Politics of Schools and the Rhetoric of Fashionable Pedagogies: The Significance of Teacher Ideology, in Immigrant Voices: In Search of Educational Equity 277, 280-81 (Enrique (Henry) T. Trueba & Lilia I. Bartolome eds., 2000) (stating that ideologies held by teachers that differ from those of students lead to problems in educating immigrant student population).

[FN54]. See Richard J. Altenbaugh et al., Caring for Kids: A Critical Study of Urban School Leavers 142-46 (1995) (concluding that teachers' treatment of students is inconsistent based on students' academic ability and socioeconomic status).

[FN55]. See Bartolome & Trueba, supra note 53, at 279-83 (discussing how teachers are unable to separate their personal backgrounds and experiences from classroom, and prefer to teach children who are most like them).

[FN56]. Id. at 281 (stating how teachers might think that their personal beliefs and experiences are normal, although students may have different backgrounds).

[FN57]. Reguero de Atiles & Allexsaht-Snider, supra note 26, at 2 (concluding that teachers must use "research-based, developmentally appropriate practices" to successfully educate Mexican children).

[FN58]. See Villegas, supra note 35, at 253 (noting different growth patterns of student and teacher populations).

[FN59]. See Zimpher & Ashburn, supra note 48, at 40-52 (postulating that diversity among teachers and among teacher education programs is important to minority students).

[FN60]. Southwest Educational Development Laboratory, Teaching for Diversity (2003), at http://www.sedl.org/pubs/policy09/.

[FN61]. Jocelyn A. Glazier, Moving Closer to Speaking the Unspeakable: White Teachers Talking About Race, Tchr. Educ. Q., Winter 2003, at 73 (explaining that because teachers still tend to be white, middle-class women, traditional methods in preparing teachers for

diverse student bodies have been largely ineffective).

[FN62]. See R.G. Tharp & R. Gallimore, Rousing Minds to Life: Teaching, Learning and Schooling in Social Context 30 (1988) (explaining function of Zone of Proximal Development, which is contrast between what children can accomplish on their own and what children need assistance with to accomplish).

[FN63]. See generally Lev Semyonovich Vygotsky, Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes (1978) (attempting to characterize "uniquely human aspects of behavior, particularly with regard to relationships between humans and their environment, new forms of activity that were responsible for establishing labor as the fundamental mechanism by which humans relate to nature, and nature of relationship between use of tools and development of speech").

[FN64]. Ana Maria Villegas & Tamara Lucas, Preparing Culturally Responsive Teachers: Rethinking the Curriculum, J. of Tchr. Educ., Jan.-Feb. 2002, at 22 (arguing that key role of teachers is to understand that their students' ways of thinking, behaving and being are influenced by race, social class and language).

[FN65]. See Laurie MacGillivray & Robert Rueda, Listening to Inner City Teachers of English Language Learners: Differentiating Literacy Instruction 2- 4 (2003) (explaining findings derived from research which indicated that differentiated instruction is best method to improve reading and writing skills of children).

[FN66]. See id. (providing five different methods for helping elementary school children who are poor second language learners).

[FN67]. See, e.g., Nancy Feyl Chavkin, Involving Migrant Families in Their Children's Education: Challenges and Opportunities for Schools, in Children of La Frontera: Binational Efforts to Serve Mexican Migrant and Immigrant Students 337 (1996) (arguing that, to meet challenge of increasing migrant population and migrant families' search for sustenance and economic self-improvement, it will be necessary to develop and nurture partnerships between schools, teachers and parents).

[FN68]. See Home-School Collaboration: Enhancing Children's Academic and Social Competence 22-23 (Sandra L. Christenson & Jane Close Conoley eds., 1992) (arguing that students have enhanced learning experiences when collaboration between student's school and family exist). As evidence for this assertion, Christenson and Conoley noted that "countless articles concluding that parent involvement has positive benefits for students' success in school have been published." Id. at 22 (explaining that such studies indicated conclusively that home-school collaboration and parent involvement lead to higher grades and test scores, increased attendance and better attitudes about school and overall more successful schools).

[FN69]. See Robert D. Putnam, Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community 19 (2000) (describing differences between physical capital, which refers to physical objects, human capital, which refers to properties of people, and social capital). Putnam compared physical capital to a screwdriver and human capital to a college education; both things increase productivity in the same manner that social contacts can. See id. (explaining that core idea of social capital theory is that social networks have value); see also James S. Coleman, Social Capital in the Creation of Human Capital, 94 Am. J. of Soc. S95, S100-01 (1988) (asserting that social capital is among least tangible forms of capital because it revolves almost entirely around relationships between people and extensive trustworthiness cultivated by those relationships, rather than around people themselves).

[FN70]. See Ricardo D. Stanton-Salazar, A Social Capital Framework for Understanding the Socialization of Racial Minority Children and Youths, 67 Harv. Educ. Rev. 5 (1997) (describing role of social capital in evaluation of network-analytic approach to educational socialization of children and adolescents).

[FN71]. See Valenzuela, supra note 27, at 7 (explaining that study of Mexican youth at Juan Seguin High School revealed that human relations are essential to students' motives to achieve and succeed).

[FN72]. See Stanton-Salazar, supra note 70, at 10-11 (arguing that institutional support enables young people, particularly students, to become consumers and entrepreneurs in mainstream marketplace and to exercise control over their lives).

[FN73]. Ricardo D. Stanton-Salazar & S.M. Dornbusch, Social Capital and the Reproduction of Inequality: Information Networks Among Mexican-Origin High School Students, 68 Soc. of Educ. 116, 117 (1995) (illustrating importance of extra-familial support in bettering educational opportunities of immigrants).

[FN74]. See Thompson, supra note 11, at 527 (arguing that caring theory accepts predominately white, middle-class, heterosexual feminist ethics as basis for all feminist ethics).

[FN75]. See Gay, supra note 19, at 75 (noting importance of emergence of teachers with "expectations and interactions, knowledge and skills, values and ethics that exhibit the power of caring"); C. Gilligan, In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development 62-63 (1982) (explaining that experiences of inequality and interconnection give rise to ethics of caring and caring strategies); Ladson-Billings, supra note 41, at 156 (showing that methods used in study included emphasis on "caring strategies," indicating that "the ethic of caring suggests that personal expressiveness, emotions, and empathy are central to the validation process"); Valenzuela, supra note 27, at 255 (illustrating that politics of caring is first step towards establishment of relevant and authentic pedagogy).

[FN76]. See Valenzuela, supra note 27, at 109 (arguing that authentic caring is absolute necessity for schools to work for "historically oppressed subordinate groups," like Mexican-Americans).

[FN77]. See id. at 61 (affirming Noddings' proposition that authentic caring, and sustained reciprocal relationships between teachers and students, is basis for all learning).

[FN78]. See generally Nieto, supra note 51 (exploring meaning, necessity and benefits of multicultural education for students from all cultural backgrounds through investigations of how schooling is influenced by racism, discrimination, school organization and policies, ethnicity, race, gender, language and class).